

Appendix A9.1: Cultural Heritage Approach and Methods

1.1 Introduction

- 1.1.1 This appendix presents the approach and method used for the cultural heritage inputs into the Environmental Impact Assessment Report (EIAR) for the Pass of Birnam to Tay Crossing section of the A9 Dualling (hereafter the 'proposed scheme').
- 1.1.2 Cultural heritage has been considered under the following sub-topics:
- Archaeological remains - are monuments with '*elements or structures of an archaeological nature*' and sites containing '*material remains resulting from the works of humans or the combined works of nature and humans, and areas including archaeological sites*' Note 1 and Note 3 of DMRB LA 106 (Highways England et al., 2020a, page 6).
 - Historic buildings – are defined as '*architectural works, works of monumental sculpture*' and '*groups of buildings of separate or connected buildings (recognised for their architecture, homogeneity or their place in the landscape)*' provided by Note 1 and Note 2 of DMRB LA 106 (Highways England et al., 2020a, page 6).
 - The historic landscape – comprises '*landscapes of historical, cultural or archaeological significance*' (Highways England et al., 2020a, page 7; paragraph 1.4). For the purposes of this assessment the historic landscape has been divided into Historic Landscape Types (HLT), '*a distinctive and repeated combination of components define a generic historic landscape character type*' (Rippon, 2004, page 19).
- 1.1.3 A cultural heritage resource is '*a building, monument, site, place, area or landscape identified as having a degree of significance meriting consideration in planning decisions, because of its heritage interest*' (Highways England et al, 2020a, page 6). Cultural heritage resources can be designated or undesignated (*ibid*).

1.2 Legislation, planning policy and best practice guidance

- 1.2.1 Relevant legislation, planning policy and best practice guidance for the cultural heritage inputs to the EIAR is identified below. An assessment of compliance with national and regional planning policies is presented in Appendix A3.1 (Assessment of Policy Compliance).

Legislation

- 1.2.2 Scheduled Monuments are, by definition, of national importance and are protected by law under the Ancient Monuments and Archaeological Areas Act 1979 (as amended by the Historic Environment Scotland Act 2014). It is a criminal offence to damage a Scheduled Monument, and Scheduled Monument Consent must be obtained from Historic Environment Scotland (HES) before any works affecting a Scheduled Monument may take place.
- 1.2.3 Listed Buildings are protected under the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997 (as amended by the Historic Environment Scotland Act 2014) and are recognised to be of special architectural or historic interest. Under Section 59 of the Act, in considering whether to grant planning permission for a development which affects a Listed Building or its setting, a planning authority or the Secretary of State (as the case shall be) is required to have special regard to the desirability of preserving the building or its setting, or

any features of special architectural or historic interest which it possesses. Additional controls over demolition and alteration exist through the requirement for Listed Building Consent to be gained before undertaking alteration or demolition on a Listed Building. Under Schedule 5, Section 17.b. iv, of the Town and Country Planning (Development Management Procedure) (Scotland) Regulations 2013, planning authorities are required to consult HES on development proposals that may affect a Category A Listed Building or its setting.

- 1.2.4 Under the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997 (as amended by the Historic Environment Scotland Act 2014), listing may take into account not only the building itself but also how its exterior contributes to the architectural or historic interest of any group of buildings of which it forms part, and any feature of the building consisting of a man-made object or structure fixed to the building or forming part of the land and comprised within the curtilage of the building. Section 1 Paragraph 4 of the Act states that any object or structure fixed to a Listed Building and any object or structure within the curtilage of the building which, though not fixed to the building, forms part of the land and has done so since before 1st July 1948 shall be treated as part of the listing.
- 1.2.5 The Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997 (as amended by the Historic Environment Scotland Act 2014) imposes a duty on local planning authorities to designate and protect the historic character and appearance of some areas through their designation as Conservation Areas. These are areas of special architectural or historic interest, the character or appearance of which it is desirable to preserve or enhance. The main implication of this designation is that consent would be required for specific types of development that would not otherwise require it, such as 'Conservation Area Consent' for the demolition of unlisted buildings in Conservation Areas.
- 1.2.6 The Ancient Monuments and Archaeological Areas Act 1979 (as amended by the Historic Environment Scotland Act 2014) requires HES to compile and maintain an Inventory of Gardens and Designed Landscapes and to compile and maintain an Inventory of Historic Battlefields. Under Schedule 5, Section 17.b. ii, of the Town and Country Planning (Development Management Procedure) (Scotland) Regulations 2013, planning authorities are required to consult HES on development proposals that may affect a historic garden or designed landscape. Similarly, under Schedule 5, Section 17.c., of the regulations, planning authorities are required to consult HES on development which may affect a historic battlefield.
- 1.2.7 The Ancient Monuments and Archaeological Areas Act 1979 (as amended by the Historic Environment Scotland Act, 2014) requires HES to compile and maintain an Inventory of Historic Battlefields. While listing on the Inventory does not confer statutory designation on a Historic Battlefield, protection is provided under Schedule 5 Paragraph 5(5) of The Town and Country Planning (Development Management Procedure) (Scotland) Regulations 2013. Under the regulations local authorities are required to consult Scottish Ministers, and thereby HES, on development proposals which may affect a Historic Battlefield.

Planning Policy

- 1.2.8 The following national and regional planning policy has been used to inform the cultural heritage inputs to the EIAR:

- Planning Advice Note 2/2011: Planning and Archaeology (PAN2/2011) (Scottish Government, 2011);
- Historic Environment Policy for Scotland (HEPS) (HES, 2019a);
- Historic Environment Scotland Circular Regulations and Procedures (HES, 2019b);
- Designation Policy and Selection Guidance (HES, 2020a);
- Perth & Kinross Council's (PKC's) Local Development Plan 2 (LDP) (Adopted 29th November 2019) (PKC, 2019); and
- National Planning Framework 4 (Scottish Government, 2024).

Planning Advice Note 2/2011: Planning and Archaeology (PAN2/2011)

- 1.2.9 PAN 2/2011: Planning and Archaeology (Scottish Government, 2011) provides advice on archaeological remains within the planning process. It sets out the requirement to protect archaeological remains in a manner which is proportionate to the relative value of the remains and of the development under consideration.

Historic Environment Policy for Scotland

- 1.2.10 Historic Environment Policy for Scotland (HEPS) (HES, 2019a) identifies HES's policies which provide a framework for making decisions which affect the historic environment and forms part of a range of documents that inform decisionmakers in the Scottish planning system.

Historic Environment Scotland Circular Regulations and Procedures

- 1.2.11 Historic Environment Scotland Circular - Regulations and Procedures (HES, 2019b) describes the requirements of secondary legislation relating to the Historic Environment Scotland Act 2014 and HES's role in relation to listing and scheduling, consents and appeals.

Designation Policy and Selection Guidance

- 1.2.12 The Designation Policy and Selection Guidance document (HES, 2019c) supports HEPS (HES, 2019a) and sets out the policy and selection guidance used by Historic Environment Scotland to designate historic sites and places at the national level.

Perth & Kinross Council's Local Development Plan 2

- 1.2.13 Perth & Kinross Council's (PKC's) Local Development Plan 2 (LDP) (Adopted 29th November 2019) (PKC, 2019) includes policies which seek to protect cultural heritage from inappropriate development, and to shape the design of development to conserve and enhance cultural heritage. The relevant policies in relation to the cultural heritage resource include:

- Policy 26: under Policy 26A there is a presumption against development which would have an adverse effect on the integrity of a Scheduled Monument and its setting unless there are exceptional circumstances. Policy 26B identifies that PKC will seek to protect areas or sites of known archaeological interest and their settings, and that there will be a strong presumption in favour of preservation in situ. Policy 26B identifies further identifies that where, in exceptional circumstances, preservation of the archaeological features is not feasible, the developer will be required to make provision for the survey, excavation, recording and analysis of threatened features prior to development commencing. Discoveries made during any development should be reported to PKC and work suspended until mitigation measures have been agreed.
- Policy 27: under Policy 27A presumption in favour of the retention and sympathetic restoration, correct maintenance, and sensitive management of Listed Buildings to enable them to remain in active use, and any proposed alterations or adaptations to help sustain or enhance a building's beneficial use should not adversely affect its special interest. This policy states that the layout, design, materials, scale, siting and use of any development which will affect a Listed Building, or its setting, should be appropriate to the building's character, appearance and setting. Policy 27B identifies that there is a presumption against the demolition of Listed Buildings.
- Policy 28: under Policy 28A development within a Conservation Area must preserve or enhance its character or appearance. The design, materials, scale and siting of new development within a Conservation Area, and development out with an area that will impact upon its special qualities should be appropriate to its appearance, character and setting. Policy 28B states that when considering the demolition of unlisted buildings in Conservation Areas, PKC will give careful consideration to the merits of the building and its contribution to the character and appearance of the Conservation Area. Where a building is considered to be of value, either in itself or as part of a group, there will be a presumption in favour of its retention, restoration for the current or another appropriate use.
- Policy 29: states that PKC will seek to manage change in order to protect and enhance the integrity of those sites included on the current Inventory of Gardens and Designed Landscapes.
- Policy 30: states that PKC will seek to protect, conserve and, where appropriate, enhance the key landscape characteristics and special qualities of those battlefields listed on the Inventory of Historic Battlefields.
- Policy 31: states that there is a range of non-designated historic assets and areas of historical interest, including historic landscapes, which do not have statutory protection and that PKC will seek to protect and preserve significant resources as far as possible, in situ wherever feasible.

National Planning Framework 4

- 1.2.14 National Planning Framework 4 includes Policy 7 (Historic assets and places) which seeks to protect and enhance historic environment assets and places, and to enable positive change as a catalyst for the regeneration of places (Scottish Government, 2023, page 45).

1.2.15 Relevant elements of Policy 7 include:

- Under Policy 7 a) development proposals with a potentially significant impact on historic assets will be accompanied by an assessment based on an understanding of the cultural significance of the historic asset and the assessment should identify the likely visual or physical impact of any proposals and provide a sound basis for managing the impacts of change. Proposals should also be informed by national policy and guidance on managing change in the historic environment, and information held within Historic Environment Records.
- Under Policy 7 c) development proposals affecting the setting of a Listed Building should preserve its character, and its special architectural or historic interest.
- Under Policy 7 d) development proposals in or affecting Conservation Areas will only be supported where the character and appearance of the Conservation Area and its setting is preserved or enhanced. Relevant considerations include the:
 - architectural and historic character of the area;
 - existing density, built form and layout; and
 - context and siting, quality of design and suitable materials.
- Under Policy 7 e) development proposals in Conservation Areas will ensure that existing natural and built features which contribute to the character of the Conservation Area and its setting, including structures, boundary walls, railings, trees and hedges, are retained.
- Under Policy 7 h) Development proposals affecting Scheduled Monuments will only be supported where:
 - direct impacts on the Scheduled Monument are avoided;
 - significant adverse impacts on the integrity of the setting of a Scheduled Monument are avoided; or
 - exceptional circumstances have been demonstrated to justify the impact on a Scheduled Monument and its setting and impacts on the monument or its setting have been minimised.
- Under Policy 7 i) development proposals affecting nationally important Gardens and Designed Landscapes will be supported where they protect, preserve or enhance their cultural significance, character and integrity and where proposals will not significantly impact on important views to, from and within the site, or its setting.
- Under Policy 7 j) development proposals affecting nationally important Historic Battlefields will be supported where they protect and, where appropriate, enhance their cultural significance, key landscape characteristics, physical remains and special qualities.
- Under Policy 7 o) non-designated historic environment assets and their setting should be protected and preserved in situ wherever feasible. Where impacts cannot be avoided they should be minimised. Where it has been demonstrated that avoidance or retention is not possible, excavation, recording, analysis, archiving, publication and activities to provide public benefit may be required through the use of conditions or legal/planning obligations. When new archaeological discoveries are made during the course of development works,

they must be reported to the planning authority to enable agreement on appropriate inspection, recording and mitigation measures.

Best Practice Guidance

- 1.2.16 The cultural heritage inputs to the EIAR been prepared in accordance with guidance provided by DMRB LA 106 and the following:
- Environmental Impact Assessment Handbook: Guidance for competent authorities, consultation bodies, and others involved in the Environmental Impact Assessment process in Scotland (Scottish Natural Heritage and HES, 2018).
 - Standard and guidance for historic environment desk-based assessment (CIfA, 2020);
 - Managing Change in the Historic Environment: Setting (HES, 2020b);
 - Managing Change in the Historic Environment: Gardens and Designed Landscapes (HES, 2020c);
 - Managing Change in the Historic Environment: Historic Battlefields (HES, 2020d); and
 - Criteria for Selection (UNESCO, 2021);
 - Principles of Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment in the UK (IEMA et al. 2021);
 - Code of conduct: professional ethics in archaeology (Chartered Institute for Archaeologists (CIfA), 2022); and
 - Our Past, Our Future (HES, 2023).

1.3 Study Area

- 1.3.1 Paragraph 3.6 of DMRB LA 106 (Highways England et al, 2020a, page 9) identifies that the study area for a cultural heritage assessment '*shall include the footprint of the scheme plus any land outside that footprint which includes any heritage assets which could be physically affected*'. A study area comprising the Compulsory Purchase Order (CPO) Area plus an area extending 200m in all directions from it was therefore defined. This study area is appropriate to identify any cultural heritage resources which could be physically affected by the proposed scheme, to assess impacts on the setting of cultural heritage resources in its vicinity, and to inform an assessment of the potential for the presence of unknown archaeological remains.
- 1.3.2 In addition, paragraph 3.6.1 of DMRB LA 106 states that the study area '*should include the settings of any designated or other cultural heritage resource in the footprint of the scheme or within the zone of visual influence or potentially affected by noise*' (Highways England et al, 2020a, page 9).
- 1.3.3 Consultation with the noise specialists identified that the extent of the study area was sufficient to identify and assess potential noise effects on the setting of cultural heritage resources. The Zone of Visual Influence (or Zone of Theoretical Visibility (ZTV)) was used to identify cultural heritage resources outside the study area the settings of which could be affected by the proposed scheme. Potential visual effects of these cultural heritage resources were then screened using information from sources identified in Appendix A9.2: (Cultural

Heritage Baseline Information), modern Ordnance Survey mapping and on-line aerial imagery and through consultation with Historic Environment Scotland (HES), Perth and Kinross Council (PKC) and Perth and Kinross Heritage Trust (PKHT). Where the potential for an effect on the setting of a cultural heritage resource was identified, these cultural heritage resources were included in the cultural heritage baseline.

1.4 Consultation

- 1.4.1 The cultural heritage inputs to the EIAR have been informed by the results of consultation with HES, PKC and PKHT as detailed in Chapter 7 (Consultation and Scoping) and Appendix A7.1 (Summary of Scoping and Consultation Responses).

1.5 Assessment of Value, Magnitude of Impact and Significance of Effect

- 1.5.1 The assessment of value (sensitivity), magnitude of impact and significance of effect and the reporting the significant effects on cultural heritage resources, including where relevant their setting, was undertaken following the requirements provided by DMRB LA 104 (Highways England et al, 2020a), DMRB LA 106 (Highways England et al, 2020b) and best practice guidance identified in Section 1.2.

Value (sensitivity)

- 1.5.2 An assessment of the value (sensitivity) of each cultural heritage resource was undertaken on a five-point scale of very high, high, medium, low and negligible. The assessment of value (sensitivity) was based on professional judgement guided by the typical descriptions presented in Table A9.1-1 and the guidance provided in Annex A: Criteria to inform the assessment of value (sensitivity) and the identification of key characteristics, features or elements of cultural heritage resource.

Table A9.1-1: Environmental Value (sensitivity) and typical descriptions

Value (sensitivity) of receptor/ resource	Typical description
Very High	Very high importance and rarity, international scale and very limited potential for substitution.
High	High importance and rarity, national scale, and limited potential for substitution.
Medium	Medium or high importance and rarity, regional scale and limited potential for substitution.
Low	Low or medium importance and rarity, local scale.
Negligible	Very low importance and rarity, local scale.

Impact Magnitude

- 1.5.3 Magnitude of impact is the degree of change that would be experienced by a cultural heritage resource and (where relevant) its setting resulting from the construction or operation of the proposed scheme, as compared with a 'do-nothing' scenario. Magnitude of impact is assessed without reference to the value (sensitivity) of the cultural heritage resource and may include physical impacts or impacts on its setting or amenity value.
- 1.5.4 Assessment of magnitude of impact was based on professional judgement informed by the typical descriptions provided in Table A9.1-2.

Table A9.1-2: Magnitude of impact and typical descriptions

Magnitude of impact (change)		Typical description
Major	Adverse	Loss of resource and/or quality and integrity of resource; severe damage to key characteristics, features or elements.
	Beneficial	Large scale or major improvement of resource quality; extensive restoration; major improvement of attribute quality.
Moderate	Adverse	Loss of resource, but not adversely affecting the integrity; partial loss of/damage to key characteristics, features or elements.
	Beneficial	Benefit to, or addition of, key characteristics, features or elements; improvement of attribute quality.
Minor	Adverse	Some measurable change in attributes, quality or vulnerability; minor loss of, or alteration to, one (maybe more) key characteristics, features or elements.
	Beneficial	Minor benefit to, or addition of, one (maybe more) key characteristics, features or elements; some beneficial impact on attribute or a reduced risk of negative impact occurring.
Negligible	Adverse	Very minor loss or detrimental alteration to one or more characteristics, features or elements.
	Beneficial	Very minor benefit to or positive addition of one or more characteristics, features or elements.
No change		No loss or alteration of characteristics, features or elements; no observable impact in either direction.

Significance of Effect

- 1.5.5 For each cultural heritage resource, the significance of effect without mitigation was assessed based on the value (sensitivity) of the cultural heritage resource and the magnitude of impact using on a five-point scale of Very Large, Large, Moderate, Slight or Neutral using professional judgement informed by the matrix illustrated in Table A9.1-3. The five levels of significance of effect apply equally to adverse and beneficial impacts.

Table A9.1-3: Matrix for determination of significance (Highways England et al, 2020a, page 14).

		Magnitude of impact				
		No change	Negligible	Minor	Moderate	Major
Value (sensitivity)	Very High	Neutral	Slight	Moderate or Large	Large or Very Large	Very Large
	High	Neutral	Slight	Slight or Moderate	Moderate or Large	Large or Very Large
	Medium	Neutral	Neutral or Slight	Slight	Moderate	Moderate or Large
	Low	Neutral	Neutral or Slight	Neutral or Slight	Slight	Slight or Moderate
	Negligible	Neutral	Neutral	Neutral or Slight	Neutral or Slight	Slight

- 1.5.6 For the purpose of this assessment, potential effects of Moderate or greater significance are considered to be potentially significant in the context of the Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) Regulations and are highlighted in bold in Table A9.1-3.

Cumulative Effects

- 1.5.7 Potentially significant cumulative effects of the proposed scheme, and those of the proposed scheme in combination with other reasonably foreseeable developments, are assessed in Chapter 21 (Assessment of Cumulative Effects).

Limitations to Assessment

- 1.5.8 This assessment has been prepared based on the sources identified in Appendix A9.2 (Cultural Heritage Baseline Information) and non-intrusive archaeological investigations and is considered appropriate for the purposes of this DMRB Stage 3 assessment.

1.6 References

Legislation

Ancient Monuments and Archaeological Areas Act 1979 (as amended by the Historic Environment Scotland Act 2014)

Historic Environment (Amendment) (Scotland) Act 2011

Historic Environment Scotland Act 2014

Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997 (as amended by the Historic Environment Scotland Act, 2014)

Town and Country Planning (Development Management Procedure) (Scotland) Regulations 2013

Sources

Chartered Institute for Archaeologists (2020). Standard and guidance for historic environment desk-based assessment [Online]. Available at:
https://www.archaeologists.net/sites/default/files/CIfAS%26GDBA_4.pdf (Accessed February 2021)

Chartered Institute for Archaeologists (2022). Code of conduct: professional ethics in archaeology [Online]. Available at:
<https://www.archaeologists.net/sites/default/files/Code%20of%20conduct%20revOct2022.pdf> (Accessed October 2024)

Highways England, Transport Scotland, Welsh Government, Department for Infrastructure (2020a). Design Manual for Roads and Bridges (DMRB): Sustainability & Environment. LA 106 'Cultural heritage assessment' (Revision 1).

Highways England, Transport Scotland, Welsh Government, Department for Infrastructure (2020b). Design Manual for Roads and Bridges (DMRB): Sustainability & Environment, LA 104 Environmental assessment and monitoring (formerly HA 205/08, HD 48/08, IAN 125/15, and IAN 133/10).

Historic Environment Scotland (2019a). Historic Environment Policy for Scotland (HEPS) [Online]. Available at: <https://www.historicenvironment.scot/archives-and-research/publications/publication/?publicationId=1bcfa7b1-28fb-4d4b-b1e6-aa2500f942e7> (Accessed February 2021)

Historic Environment Scotland (2019b). Historic Environment Scotland Circular Regulations and Procedures [Online]. Available at: <https://www.historicenvironment.scot/archives-and-research/publications/publication/?publicationId=a768f3cb-eb44-4473-be7b-aa2500e4892b#:~:text=This%20document%20sets%20out%20the,special%20architectural%20or%20historic%20interest> (Accessed October 2024)

Historic Environment Scotland (2020a). Designation Policy and Selection Guidance [Online]. Available at: <https://www.historicenvironment.scot/archives-and-research/publications/publication/?publicationId=8d8bbaeb-ce5a-46c1-a558-aa2500ff7d3b> (Accessed October 2024)

Historic Environment Scotland (2020b). Managing Change in the Historic Environment: Setting. [Online]. Available at: <https://www.historicenvironment.scot/archives-and-research/publications/publication/?publicationid=80b7c0a0-584b-4625-b1fd-a60b009c2549> (Accessed February 2021)

Historic Environment Scotland (2020c). Managing Change in the Historic Environment: Gardens and Designed Landscapes. [Online]. Available at: <https://www.historicenvironment.scot/archives-and-research/publications/publication/?publicationid=83214207-c4e7-4f80-af87-a678009820b9> (Accessed February 2021)

Historic Environment Scotland (2020d). Managing Change in the Historic Environment: Historic Battlefields. [Online]. Available at: <https://www.historicenvironment.scot/archives-and-research/publications/publication/?publicationid=b7a05b45-f2a9-4c71-8450-a60b0094c62e> (Accessed February 2021)

Historic Environment Scotland (2023). Our Past, Our Future. [online]. Available at: <https://www.historicenvironment.scot/archives-and-research/publications/publication/?publicationId=79204155-9eb2-4d29-ab14-aff200ec2801> (Accessed October 2024)

IEMA, IHBC and the Chartered Institute for Archaeologists (2021). Principles of Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment in the UK. [Online]. Available at: j30361_iema_principlesofchia_v8.pdf ([archaeologists.net](https://www.archaeologists.net)) (Accessed October 2024)

Perth & Kinross Council (2019). Perth and Kinross Local Development Plan 2. [Online]. Available at: https://www.pkc.gov.uk/article/15042/Local-Development-Plan-2019-Plan/pdf/Adopted_LDP_Web_Version.pdf?m=636099646768900000 (Accessed June 2019)

Rippon, S. (2004). Historic Landscape Analysis: Deciphering the Countryside. Practical Handbooks in Archaeology No. 16. Council for British Archaeology.

Scottish Government (2011). Planning Advice Note 2/2011: Planning and Archaeology. [Online]. Available at: <https://www.gov.scot/publications/pan-2-2011-planning-archaeology/> (Accessed October 2024)

Scottish Government (2024). National Planning Framework 4. [Online]. Available at: <https://www.gov.scot/publications/national-planning-framework-4/>. (Accessed October 2024).

Scottish Natural Heritage and Historic Environment Scotland (2018). Environmental Impact Assessment Handbook: Guidance for competent authorities, consultation bodies, and others involved in the Environmental Impact Assessment process in Scotland.

UNESCO (2021). The Criteria for Selection. [Online]. Available at: <https://whc.unesco.org/en/criteria/> (Accessed March 2021)

Annex A: Criteria to inform the assessment of value (sensitivity) and the identification of key characteristics, features or elements of cultural heritage resource.

1.1 Introduction

- 1.1.1 This annex presents the criteria used to inform the assessment of value (sensitivity) and the identification of key characteristics, features or elements of cultural heritage resources (comprising archaeological remains, historic buildings and historic landscapes) for the cultural heritage assessment for the A9 Dualling: Pass of Birnam to Tay Crossing project.

1.2 Background

- 1.2.1 In the absence of guidance in the Design Manual for Roads and Bridges (DMRB) LA 106 'Cultural heritage assessment' Revision 1 (hereafter 'DMRB LA 106') (Highways England et al., 2020), this criteria has been developed to inform professional judgement in the assessment of importance, rarity and geographical scale for cultural heritage resources which are required to inform the assessment of value (sensitivity), and the identification of key characteristics, features or elements of cultural heritage resources that is required to inform the magnitude of impact.
- 1.2.2 The criteria presented in Tables A9.1-Annex A-1 – 3 have been developed based on:
- Cultural criteria from UNESCO's World Heritage List Criteria for Selection (UNESCO, 2021). These criteria are used to inform the assessment of cultural heritage resources (archaeological remains, historic buildings, historic landscapes) of very high importance and rarity, which are important at an international scale (and therefore cultural heritage resources of very high value (sensitivity)), and the key characteristics, features or elements of such cultural heritage resources.
 - Selection Guidance for Determining National Importance for Scheduled Monuments provided in Annex 1 of Designation Policy and Selection Guidance (HES, 2019, page 10). These criteria are used to inform the assessment of archaeological remains of high importance and rarity, which are important at a national scale (and therefore of high value (sensitivity)) and have been adapted to inform the assessment of archaeological remains of medium, low and negligible importance. These criteria have also been used to aid the identification of key characteristics, features or elements of archaeological remains where these have not been previously identified.
 - Selection Guidance for Deciding the Special Architectural or Historic Interest of Listed Buildings provided in Annex 2 of Designation Policy and Selection Guidance (HES, 2019, pages 12-13). These criteria are used to inform the assessment of historic buildings of high importance and rarity, which are important at a national scale (and therefore of high value (sensitivity)) and have been adapted to inform the assessment of historic buildings of medium, low and negligible importance. These criteria have also been used to aid the identification of key characteristics, features or elements of historic buildings where these have not been previously identified.

- Selection Guidance for Deciding if a Garden and Designed Landscape is of National Importance provided in Annex 3 of Designation Policy and Selection Guidance (HES, 2019, pages 14-16). These criteria are used to inform the assessment of historic landscapes of high importance and rarity, which are important at a national scale (and therefore of high value) and have been adapted to inform the assessment of historic landscapes of medium, low and negligible importance. Along with the guidance provided by Managing Change in the Historic Environment: Gardens and Designed Landscapes (HES, 2020c), these criteria have also been used to aid the identification of key characteristics, features or elements of historic landscapes where these have not been previously identified.
- Selection Guidance for Deciding if a Battlefield is of National Importance provided in Annex 4 of Designation Policy and Selection Guidance (HES, 2020a, pages 18-19). These criteria are used to inform the assessment of battlefields of high importance and rarity, which are important at a national scale (and therefore of high value (sensitivity)) and have been adapted to inform the assessment of battlefields of medium, low and negligible importance. Along with the guidance provided by Managing Change in the Historic Environment: Historic Battlefields (HES, 2020d), these criteria have also been used to aid the identification of key characteristics, features or elements of historic battlefields where these have not been previously identified.

1.2.3 In a letter of 25 March 2021 PKHT and in an email of 27 May 2021 HES confirmed that they were content with the use of the criteria in Tables A9.1-Annex A-1 -3 to inform professional judgement as part of the cultural heritage assessment for the A9 Dualling: Pass of Birnam to Tay Crossing project.

Table A9.1-Annex A-1: Criteria to inform the assessment of the value (sensitivity) of archaeological remains

Value (sensitivity)	Criteria
Very High	<p>World Heritage Sites (including Nominated Sites).</p> <p>Archaeological remains that:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) represent a masterpiece of human creative genius; 2) exhibit an important interchange of human values, over a span of time or within a cultural area of the world, on developments in architecture or technology, monumental arts, town-planning or landscape design; 3) bear a unique or at least exceptional testimony to a cultural tradition or to a civilization which is living or which has disappeared; 4) are an outstanding example of a type of building, architectural or technological ensemble or landscape which illustrates (a) significant stage(s) in human history; 5) are an outstanding example of a traditional human settlement, land-use, or sea-use which is representative of a culture (or cultures), or human interaction with the environment especially when it has become vulnerable under the impact of irreversible change;

Value (sensitivity)	Criteria
	6) are directly or tangibly associated with events or living traditions, with ideas, or with beliefs, with artistic and literary works of outstanding universal significance ¹ .
High	<p>Scheduled Monuments.</p> <p>Non-designated archaeological remains that:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a) Make a significant contribution to our understanding or appreciation of the past, or have the potential to do so. It may do so in itself, or as part of a monument type, or as a geographical group of related monuments. b) Retain structural, architectural, decorative or other physical remains to the extent that it makes a significant contribution to our understanding or appreciation of the past. The remains can be upstanding fabric, evidence of buried archaeological structures and deposits, scatters of artefacts or a combination of these. c) Are a rare example of a monument type when assessed against current knowledge of Scotland's history, archaeology and/or architecture, and of the region in which the monument is found. d) Are a particularly representative example of a monument type when assessed against knowledge of Scotland's history, archaeology and/or architecture and of the region in which the monument is found. e) Have research potential which could significantly contribute to our understanding or appreciation of the past². f) Make a significant contribution to the landscape and/or our understanding of the historic landscape. This may include the relationship of the monument to other monuments or natural features in the landscape, and/or the significance of its setting in understanding the monument or the monument type. g) Have significant associations with historical, traditional, social or artistic figures, events, movements and/or practices that are of national importance.
Medium	<p>Non-designated archaeological remains that:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a) Make some contribution to our understanding or appreciation of the past, or have some potential to do so. It may do so in itself, or as part of a monument type, or as a geographical group of related monuments. b) Retain structural, architectural, decorative or other physical remains to the extent that it makes some contribution to our understanding or appreciation of the past. The remains can be upstanding fabric, evidence of buried archaeological structures and deposits, scatters of artefacts or a combination of these. c) Are an uncommon example of a monument type when assessed against current knowledge of a Scotland's history, archaeology and/or architecture, and of the region in which the monument is found. d) Are a representative example of a monument type when assessed against knowledge of Scotland's history, archaeology and/or architecture and of the region in which the monument is found.

¹ These are the cultural criteria from UNESCO's World Heritage List Criteria for Selection <https://whc.unesco.org/en/criteria/>. UNESCO consider that criterion (vi) should preferably be used in conjunction with other criteria.

² This criterion should be assessed against national archaeological research frameworks such as Scottish Archaeological Research Framework (ScARF) (<https://www.socantscot.org/research-projects/scarf/>) and regional archaeological research frameworks where these are available.

Value (sensitivity)	Criteria
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> e) Have research potential which could contribute to our understanding or appreciation of the past. f) Make some contribution to the landscape and/or our understanding of the historic landscape. This may include the relationship of the monument to other monuments or natural features in the landscape, and/or the significance of its setting in understanding the monument or the monument type. g) Have associations with historical, traditional, social or artistic figures, events, movements and/or practices that are of regional importance.
Low	<p>Non-designated archaeological remains that:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a) Make a limited contribution to our understanding or appreciation of the past, or have limited potential to do so. It may do so in itself, or as part of a monument type, or as a geographical group of related monuments. b) Retain structural, architectural, decorative or other physical remains to the extent that it makes a limited contribution to our understanding or appreciation of the past. The remains can be upstanding fabric, evidence of buried archaeological structures and deposits, scatters of artefacts or a combination of these. c) Are a common example of a monument type when assessed against current knowledge of Scotland's history, archaeology and/or architecture, and of the region in which the monument is found. d) Are a poorly representative example of a monument type when assessed against knowledge of Scotland's history, archaeology and/or architecture and of the region in which the monument is found. e) Have limited research potential which could contribute to our understanding or appreciation of the past. f) Make a limited contribution to the landscape and/or our understanding of the historic landscape. This may include the relationship of the monument to other monuments or natural features in the landscape, and/or the significance of its setting in understanding the monument or the monument type. g) Have associations with historical, traditional, social or artistic figures, events, movements and/or practices that are of local importance.
Negligible	<p>Non-designated archaeological remains that:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a) Make a very limited contribution to our understanding or appreciation of the past, or have very limited potential to do so. It may do so in itself, or as part of a monument type, or as a geographical group of related monuments. b) Retain structural, architectural, decorative or other physical remains to the extent that it makes a very limited contribution to our understanding or appreciation of the past. The remains can be upstanding fabric, evidence of buried archaeological structures and deposits, scatters of artefacts or a combination of these. c) Are a very common example of a monument type when assessed against current knowledge of Scotland's history, archaeology and/or architecture, and of the region in which the monument is found.

Value (sensitivity)	Criteria
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> d) Are a very poorly representative example of a monument type when assessed against knowledge of Scotland's history, archaeology and/or architecture and of the region in which the monument is found. e) Have a very limited research potential which could contribute to our understanding or appreciation of the past. f) Make a very limited contribution to the landscape and/or our understanding of the historic landscape. This may include the relationship of the monument to other monuments or natural features in the landscape, and/or the significance of its setting in understanding the monument or the monument type. g) Have very limited associations with historical, traditional, social or artistic figures, events, movements and/or practices that are of local importance.

Criteria to inform the identification of key characteristics, features or elements of archaeological remains

For World Heritage Sites the key characteristics, features or elements should be defined with reference to the information contained in the Statements of Outstanding Universal Value.

For Scheduled Monuments key characteristics, features or elements should be identified with reference to information contained in the Statements of National Importance. Where required to supplement the information in the Statements of National Importance the criteria identified below will be used to inform the identification of key characteristics, features or elements for Scheduled Monuments. They will also be used to inform the identification for key characteristics, features or elements for non-designated archaeological remains:

- a) The contribution that the archaeological remains make to our understanding or appreciation of the past, or the potential to do so. It may do so in itself, or as part of a monument type, or as a geographical group of related monuments.
- b) The archaeological remains' retention of structural, architectural, decorative or other physical remains which can contribute to our understanding or appreciation of the past. Physical remains can be upstanding fabric, evidence of buried archaeological structures and deposits, scatters of artefacts or a combination of these.
- c) The rarity of the archaeological remains when assessed against current knowledge of Scotland's history, archaeology and/or architecture, and of the region in which the monument is found.
- d) The representativeness of the archaeological remains when assessed against knowledge of Scotland's history, archaeology and/or architecture and of the region in which the monument is found.
- e) The research potential of the archaeological remains which could contribute to our understanding or appreciation of the past. This should be informed by national archaeological research frameworks such as the Scottish Archaeological Research Framework (ScARF) (<https://www.socantscot.org/research-projects/scarf/>) and regional archaeological research frameworks, where these are available.

- f) The contribution that the archaeological remains make to the landscape and/or our understanding of the historic landscape. This may include the relationship of the monument to other monuments or natural features in the landscape, and/or the significance of its setting in understanding the monument or the monument type.
- g) The association of the archaeological remains with historical, traditional, social or artistic figures, events, movements and/or practices.

Table A9.1-Annex 1-2: Criteria to inform the assessment of the value (sensitivity) of historic buildings

Value (sensitivity)	Criteria
Very High	<p>World Heritage Sites (including Nominated Sites).</p> <p>Historic buildings that:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) represent a masterpiece of human creative genius; 2) exhibit an important interchange of human values, over a span of time or within a cultural area of the world, on developments in architecture or technology, monumental arts, town-planning or landscape design; 3) bear a unique or at least exceptional testimony to a cultural tradition or to a civilization which is living or which has disappeared; 4) are an outstanding example of a type of building, architectural or technological ensemble or landscape which illustrates (a) significant stage(s) in human history; 5) are an outstanding example of a traditional human settlement, land-use, or sea-use which is representative of a culture (or cultures), or human interaction with the environment especially when it has become vulnerable under the impact of irreversible change; 6) are directly or tangibly associated with events or living traditions, with ideas, or with beliefs, with artistic and literary works of outstanding universal significance³.
High	<p>Category A Listed Buildings, Category B Listed Buildings, Category C Listed Buildings.</p> <p>Non-designated historic buildings:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a) That retain a level of authenticity and completeness of design, comprising artistic skill and/or architectural detail or features, interest of the designer in relation to the building's design, interior design and fixed interior decorative scheme, the plan form of the building, materials used in the building, technological excellence or innovation demonstrated in the building type or its design, local or regional traditions that might be demonstrated in the building type, material or form that make a significant contribution to the building's architectural interest. b) That have surroundings that make a significant contribution to its setting and how other features both built and natural relate to it, such as the building's relationship with its immediate and wider surroundings, including views to and from it, the buildings relationship with its landscape, townscape or other buildings which may form a group, the degree to which the immediate and wider setting of the building

³ These are the cultural criteria from UNESCO's World Heritage List Criteria for Selection <https://whc.unesco.org/en/criteria/>. UNESCO consider that criterion (vi) should preferably be used in conjunction with other criteria.

Value (sensitivity)	Criteria
	<p>significantly contributes to our understanding and appreciation of its function or its historical context, and how it is experienced.</p> <p>c) Whose age and rarity of a building type or design make a significant contribution to its historic interest.</p> <p>d) Whose social historical interest significantly contributes to our understanding of how people lived in the past, and how our social and economic history is shown in the building and/or its setting.</p> <p>e) That are associated with people or events of national importance which have had a significant impact on Scotland's cultural heritage.</p>
Medium	<p>Non-designated historic buildings:</p> <p>a) That retain a level of authenticity and completeness of design, including artistic skill and/or architectural detail or features, interest of the designer in relation to the building's design, interior design and fixed interior decorative scheme, the plan form of the building, technological excellence or innovation demonstrated in the building type or its design, local or regional traditions that might be demonstrated in the building type, material or form that make some contribution to the building's architectural interest.</p> <p>b) Whose surroundings make some contribution to its setting and how other features both built and natural relate to it, including the building's relationship with its immediate and wider surroundings, the buildings relationship with its landscape, townscape or other buildings which may form a group, the degree to which the immediate and wider setting of the building makes some contribution to our understanding and appreciation of its function or its historical context, and how it is experienced.</p> <p>c) Whose age and rarity of building type or design makes some contribution to its historic interest.</p> <p>d) Whose social historical interest makes some contribution to our understanding of how people lived in the past, and how our social and economic history is shown in a building and/or its setting.</p> <p>e) That are associated with people or events of regional importance.</p>
Low	<p>Non-designated historic buildings:</p> <p>a) That retain a level of authenticity and completeness of design, including artistic skill and/or architectural detail or features, interest of the designer in relation to the building's design, interior design and fixed interior decorative scheme, the plan form of the building, technological excellence or innovation demonstrated in the building type or its design, local or regional traditions that might be demonstrated in the building type, material or form that make a limited contribution to the building's architectural interest.</p> <p>b) Whose surroundings make a limited contribution to its setting and how other features both built and natural relate to it, including the building's relationship with its immediate and wider surroundings, the buildings relationship with its landscape, townscape or other buildings which may form a group, the degree to which the immediate and wider setting of the building makes a limited</p>

Value (sensitivity)	Criteria
	<p>contribution to our understanding and appreciation of its function or its historical context, and how it is experienced.</p> <p>c) Whose age of and rarity of building type or design makes a limited contribution to its historic interest.</p> <p>d) Buildings whose social historical interest makes a limited contribution to our understanding of how people lived in the past, and how our social and economic history is shown in a building and/or its setting.</p> <p>e) That are associated with people or events of local importance.</p>
Negligible	<p>Non-designated historic buildings:</p> <p>a) That retain a level of authenticity and completeness of design, including artistic skill and/or architectural detail or features, interest of the designer in relation to the building's design, interior design and fixed interior decorative scheme, the plan form of the building, technological excellence or innovation demonstrated in the building type or its design, local or regional traditions that might be demonstrated in the building type, material or form that make a very limited contribution to the building's architectural interest.</p> <p>b) Whose surroundings make a very limited contribution to its setting and how other features both built and natural relate to it, including the building's relationship with its immediate and wider surroundings, the buildings relationship with its landscape, townscape or other buildings which may form a group, the degree to which the immediate and wider setting of the building makes a very limited contribution to our understanding and appreciation of its function or its historical context, and how it is experienced.</p> <p>c) Whose age and rarity of building type or design makes a very limited contribution to its historic interest.</p> <p>d) Whose social historical interest makes a very limited contribution to our understanding of how people lived in the past, and how our social and economic history is shown in a building and/or its setting.</p> <p>e) That have limited associations with people or events of local importance.</p>

Criteria to inform the identification of key characteristics, features or elements of historic buildings

For World Heritage Sites the key characteristics, features or elements should be defined with reference to the information contained in the Statements of Outstanding Universal Value. For Listed Buildings key characteristics, features or elements should be identified with reference to information contained in the Statements of Special Interest while for Conservation Areas information from Conservation Area Appraisals should be used.

Where required to supplement the information contained in the Statements of Special Interest and Conservation Area Appraisals the criteria identified below will be used to inform the identification of key characteristics, features or elements for Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas. They will also be used to inform the identification for key characteristics, features or elements for non-designated historic buildings:

- a) The level of authenticity and completeness of design, including artistic skill and/or architectural detail or features, interest of the designer in relation to the building's design, interior design and fixed interior decorative scheme, the plan form of the building, technological excellence or innovation demonstrated in the building type or its design, local or regional traditions that might be demonstrated in the building type, material or form that contribute to the building's architectural interest.
- b) The building's setting and how other features both built and natural relate to it, including the building's relationship with its immediate and wider surroundings, the buildings relationship with its landscape, townscape or other buildings which may form a group, the degree to which the immediate and wider setting of the building contributes to our understanding and appreciation of its function or its historical context, and how it is experienced.
- c) The contribution that the age and rarity of a building's type or design makes to a building's historic interest.
- d) The contribution that the social historical interest of the building makes to our understanding of how people lived in the past, and how our social and economic history is shown in a building and/or its setting.
- e) Associations with people or events that have had an impact on Scotland's cultural heritage.

Table A9.1-Annex A-3: Criteria to inform the assessment of the value (sensitivity) of historic landscapes

Value (sensitivity)	Criteria
Very High	<p>World Heritage Sites (including Nominated Sites).</p> <p>Historic landscapes that:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) represent a masterpiece of human creative genius; 2) exhibit an important interchange of human values, over a span of time or within a cultural area of the world, on developments in architecture or technology, monumental arts, town-planning or landscape design; 3) bear a unique or at least exceptional testimony to a cultural tradition or to a civilization which is living or which has disappeared; 4) are an outstanding example of a type of building, architectural or technological ensemble or landscape which illustrates (a) significant stage(s) in human history; 5) are an outstanding example of a traditional human settlement, land-use, or sea-use which is representative of a culture (or cultures), or human interaction with the environment especially when it has become vulnerable under the impact of irreversible change; 6) are directly or tangibly associated with events or living traditions, with ideas, or with beliefs, with artistic and literary works of outstanding universal significance⁴.

⁴ These are the cultural criteria from UNESCO's World Heritage List Criteria for Selection <https://whc.unesco.org/en/criteria/>. UNESCO consider that criterion (vi) should preferably be used in conjunction with other criteria.

Value (sensitivity)	Criteria
High	<p>Inventory Gardens and Designed Landscapes.</p> <p>Non-designated historic landscapes of:</p> <p>a) Outstanding or high artistic interest due to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ it being highly appreciated as a work of art in its own right, in terms of aesthetics and any other experiential qualities; ▪ where the historic landscape was formally designed, the high degree to which the design set the trend for later gardens and designed landscapes, or marked a shift in landscape design history; ▪ where the historic landscape was formally designed, high quality and excellent survival of any planned visual relationships (such as vistas or sightlines) from within the designed landscape towards landscape features beyond its boundaries (either built or naturally occurring); and ▪ where the historic landscape was formally designed, the design was by an important gardener or landscape designer and it being a rare, highly representative, highly intact or highly important work. <p>b) Outstanding or high historic interest due to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ high quantity and high quality of associated documentary or other evidence for the history of the historic landscape, including maps, plans, written accounts, tree surveys, research reports, excavation reports, photographs, film, letters and any other kind of record; ▪ the high degree to which the historic landscape as a whole represents a particular period in the history of garden or landscape design (where formally designed), and/or the degree to which one or more of the historic landscape's components form an outstanding example of a particular period or style, or sequence of styles over time; ▪ its relationship with historic individuals, communities, events, traditions and/or historic and social movements. These are reflected in the physical elements of the historic landscape to a high degree; and ▪ the evidence of the role that the historic landscape plays for communities in connecting people with the past, comprising a high degree of access and recreation, interpretation and education, or other forms of engagement. <p>c) Outstanding or high horticultural interest due to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ the presence of horticultural or arboricultural collections which are in good condition and are being renewed, and which contain a wide range of species and/or unusual species or rarities; ▪ the presence of individual trees recognised for their age, significant cultural associations or 'champion' status; ▪ the presence of scientific collections which are in good condition, documented, propagated and made available to others; and ▪ its outstanding contribution to the history of horticulture, arboriculture or silviculture. <p>d) Outstanding or high architectural interest due to:</p>

Value (sensitivity)	Criteria
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ the presence of buildings and structures that are listed in recognition of their special architectural and historic interest; and ▪ the high degree to which the buildings or structures within the historic landscape contribute to the character of the landscape, either through their own intrinsic interest, through their interest as a group or through their relationship with other aspects of the historic landscape. <p>e) Outstanding or high archaeological interest due to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ evidence of the survival of an early form of historic landscape; a high degree of survival of historic landscape elements which are legible; ▪ high research potential and/or contribution of archaeological evidence to our understanding of the development and history of the historic landscape; and ▪ presence of known archaeological sites or monuments which make an outstanding contribution to the character of the historic landscape either by virtue of their own intrinsic interest, or through their relationship with other aspects of the historic landscape. <p>f) Outstanding or high scenic interest due to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ the size, location and/or overall character, including any combination of its built, landscaped, planted, water or natural components, making a special contribution to the quality of the surrounding landscape; and ▪ a high degree of rarity and contrast with the surrounding landscape. <p>g) Outstanding or high nature conservation interest due to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ the presence of sites recognised at an international, national or local level for their flora (plants), fauna (animals), geology (rock types and forms), geomorphology (landforms) or a combination of these features; and ▪ a wide range of different habitats, or one or more habitats, which appear at the time of assessment to be managed to support nature conservation principles, or to support protected species. <p>Battlefields recorded on the Inventory of Historic Battlefields. Non-Inventory historic battlefields with:</p> <p>a) Historical associations that make a significant contribution to history and to modern society and culture, including military history, strategy and tactics, such as significant military innovations or occurrences associated with the battle, associations with nationally significant historical individuals or groups and their interactions, or with a nationally significant event or campaign, documentary and historic map evidence that may significantly enhance our understanding of historical events, and the battle has a place in the national history and consciousness as reflected through literature, oral tradition and evidence of the role that battlefield plays for communities.</p> <p>b) Special qualities comprising significant physical remains, including built structures that were present at the time of the battle, such as field walls or buildings, route ways like roads, bridges and paths, or elements resulting from the battle itself, or elements resulting from the battle itself, including earthworks or graves, archaeological evidence that can support and enhance documentary records and</p>

Value (sensitivity)	Criteria
	<p>provide, details about events, weaponry and combatants that are not available through other sources and the potential for buried archaeological deposits, such as the remains of earthworks, camps, burials or entrenchments, and/or archaeological potential which can contribute significantly to our understanding of the broader archaeology and history of Scotland.</p> <p>c) Landscape characteristics including features of terrain such as hills and other high ground, or valleys, natural obstacles such as watercourses, bogs and cliffs, areas providing concealment such as slopes, ditches and woodland routes of movement and manoeuvre such as paths and narrow passes, historic settlements and memorials which are often located to relate to elements of the battlefield landscape and significantly contribute to our understanding and appreciation of a battle and its associations, which significantly contribute to understanding why events unfolded as they did, to our sense of place and how battlefields are remembered today.</p>
Medium	<p>Non-designated historic landscapes of:</p> <p>a) Some artistic interest due to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ it being appreciated as a work of art in its own right, in terms of aesthetics and any other experiential qualities; ▪ where the historic landscape was formally designed, some degree to which the design set the trend for later gardens and designed landscapes, or marked some shift in landscape design history; ▪ where the historic landscape was formally designed, good quality and survival of any planned visual relationships (such as vistas or sightlines) from within the designed landscape towards landscape features beyond its boundaries (either built or naturally occurring); and ▪ where the historic landscape was formally designed the design was by a regionally important gardener or landscape designer and is an uncommon, representative, intact or important work. <p>b) Some historic interest due to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ some quantity and good quality of associated documentary or other evidence for the history of the historic landscape, including maps, plans, written accounts, tree surveys, research reports, excavation reports, photographs, film, letters and any other kind of record; ▪ the degree to which the historic landscape as a whole represents a particular period in the history of garden or landscape design (where formally designed), and/or the degree to which one or more of the historic landscape's components form a good example of a particular period or style, or sequence of styles over time; ▪ some relationship with historic individuals, communities, events, traditions and/or historic and social movements. These are reflected in the physical elements of the historic landscape to some degree; and

Value (sensitivity)	Criteria
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ some evidence of the role that the historic landscape plays for communities in connecting people with the past, including some access and recreation, interpretation and education, or other forms of engagement. <p>c) Some horticultural interest due to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ the presence of horticultural or arboricultural collections which are in a fair condition with some renewal, and which contain a range of species and/or may have some unusual species or rarities; ▪ the presence of some individual trees which are recognised for their age, and cultural associations. Some may be of ‘champion’ status; ▪ the presence of scientific collections which are in a fair condition, some documentation, propagation and availability to others; and ▪ some contribution to the history of horticulture, arboriculture or silviculture. <p>d) Some architectural interest due to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ the presence of historic buildings and structures, some of which may be listed; and ▪ the degree to which the buildings or structures within the historic landscape contribute to the character of the landscape, either through their own intrinsic interest, through their interest as a group or through their relationship with other aspects of the historic landscape. <p>e) Some archaeological interest due to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ some evidence of the survival of an early form of historic landscape; some historic landscape elements survive and are legible; ▪ some research potential and/or contribution of archaeological evidence to our understanding of the development and history of the historic landscape; and ▪ the presence of known archaeological sites or monuments which make some contribution to the character of the historic landscape either by virtue of their own intrinsic interest, or through their relationship with other aspects of the historic landscape. <p>f) Some scenic interest due to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ the size, location and/or overall character, including any combination of its built, landscaped, planted, water or natural components, which make some contribution to the quality of the surrounding landscape; and ▪ some degree of rarity and contrast with the surrounding landscape. <p>g) Some nature conservation interest due to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ the presence of some sites recognised at a national or local level for their flora (plants), fauna (animals), geology (rock types and forms), geomorphology (landforms) or a combination of these features; and ▪ a range of different habitats, or one or more habitats, which appear at the time of assessment to be managed to support nature conservation principles, or to support protected species. <p>Non-Inventory historic battlefields with:</p>

Value (sensitivity)	Criteria
	<p>a) Historical associations that make a contribution to history and to modern society and culture, including military history, strategy and tactics, such as military innovations or occurrences associated with the battle, associations with regionally significant historical individuals or groups and their interactions, or with a regionally significant event or campaign, documentary and historic map evidence that may enhance our understanding of historical events, and the battle has a place in the regional history and consciousness as reflected through literature, oral tradition and evidence of the role that battlefield plays for communities.</p> <p>b) Special qualities comprising physical remains, including built structures that were present at the time of the battle, such as field walls or buildings, route ways like roads, bridges and paths, or elements resulting from the battle itself, or elements resulting from the battle itself, including earthworks or graves, archaeological evidence that can support and enhance documentary records and provide, details about events, weaponry and combatants that are not available through other sources and the potential for buried archaeological deposits, such as the remains of earthworks, camps, burials or entrenchments, and/or archaeological potential which can contribute to the archaeology and areas in which the battlefield is located.</p> <p>c) Landscape characteristics including features of terrain such as hills and other high ground, or valleys, natural obstacles such as watercourses, bogs and cliffs, areas providing concealment such as slopes, ditches and woodland routes of movement and manoeuvre such as paths and narrow passes, historic settlements and memorials which are often located to relate to elements of the battlefield landscape and significantly contribute to our understanding and appreciation of a battle and its associations, which contribute to understanding why events unfolded as they did, to our sense of place and how battlefields are remembered today.</p>
Low	<p>Non-designated historic landscapes of:</p> <p>d) Limited artistic interest due to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ limited appreciation as a work of art in its own right, in terms of aesthetics and any other experiential qualities; ▪ where the historic landscape was formally designed, the limited degree to which the design set the trend for later gardens and designed landscapes, or marked a limited shift in landscape design history; ▪ where the historic landscape was formally designed, poor quality and limited survival of any planned visual relationships (such as vistas or sightlines) from within the designed landscape towards landscape features beyond its boundaries (either built or naturally occurring); and ▪ where the historic landscape was formally designed was by a locally important gardener or landscape designer and is a common, poorly representative, fragmentary or unimportant work. <p>e) Limited historic interest due to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ limited quantity and poor quality of associated documentary or other evidence for the history of the historic landscape, including maps, plans, written

Value (sensitivity)	Criteria
	<p>accounts, tree surveys, research reports, excavation reports, photographs, film, letters and any other kind of record;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ the limited degree to which the historic landscape as a whole represents a particular period in the history of garden or landscape design (where formally designed), and/or the degree to which one or more of the historic landscape's components form a poor example of a particular period or style, or sequence of styles over time; ▪ limited relationship with historic individuals, communities, events, traditions and/or historic and social movements. Limited reflection of these in the physical elements of the historic landscape to a limited degree; and ▪ limited evidence of the role that the historic landscape plays for communities in connecting people with the past, including limited access and recreation, interpretation and education, or other forms of engagement. <p>f) Limited horticultural interest due to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ the presence of horticultural or arboricultural collections which are in poor condition, with limited renewal and a limited range of species and/or limited unusual species or rarities; ▪ a limited number of individual trees which are recognised for their age, and cultural associations. A limited number likely to be of 'champion' status; ▪ the presence of scientific collections which are in a poor condition, with limited documentation, propagation and availability to others; and ▪ a limited contribution to the history of horticulture, arboriculture or silviculture. <p>g) Limited architectural interest due to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ the limited presence of historic buildings and structures; and ▪ the limited degree to which the buildings or structures within the historic landscape contribute to the character of the landscape, either through their own intrinsic interest, through their interest as a group or through their relationship with other aspects of the historic landscape. <p>h) Limited archaeological interest due to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ limited evidence of the survival of an early form of historic landscape; limited survival of historic landscape elements with limited legibility; ▪ the limited research potential and/or contribution of archaeological evidence to our understanding of the development and history of the historic landscape; and ▪ the limited presence of known archaeological sites or monuments which make a limited contribution to the character of the historic landscape either by virtue of their own intrinsic interest, or through their relationship with other aspects of the historic landscape. <p>i) Limited scenic interest due to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ the size, location and/or overall character, including any combination of its built, landscaped, planted, water or natural components, that make a limited contribution to the quality of the surrounding landscape; and

Value (sensitivity)	Criteria
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ the limited degree of rarity and contrast with the surrounding landscape. <p>j) Limited nature conservation interest due to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ the limited presence of sites recognised at a local level for their flora (plants), fauna (animals), geology (rock types and forms), geomorphology (landforms) or a combination of these features; and ▪ the limited range of different habitats, or one or more habitats, with limited evidence for management to support nature conservation principles, or to support protected species. <p>Non-Inventory historic battlefields with:</p> <p>a) Historical associations that make a limited contribution to history and to modern society and culture, including military history, strategy and tactics, such as military innovations or occurrences associated with the battle, associations with locally significant historical individuals or groups and their interactions, or with a locally significant event or campaign, documentary and historic map evidence that may result in a limited enhancement to our understanding of historical events, and the battle has a place in the local history and consciousness as reflected through literature, oral tradition and evidence of the role that battlefield plays for communities.</p> <p>b) Special qualities comprising physical remains, including built structures that were present at the time of the battle, such as field walls or buildings, route ways like roads, bridges and paths, or elements resulting from the battle itself, or elements resulting from the battle itself, including earthworks or graves, archaeological evidence that can support and enhance documentary records and provide, details about events, weaponry and combatants that are not available through other sources and the potential for buried archaeological deposits, such as the remains of earthworks, camps, burials or entrenchments, and/or archaeological potential which can provided a limited contribution to the archaeology and areas in which the battlefield is located.</p> <p>c) Landscape characteristics including features of terrain such as hills and other high ground, or valleys, natural obstacles such as watercourses, bogs and cliffs, areas providing concealment such as slopes, ditches and woodland routes of movement and manoeuvre such as paths and narrow passes, historic settlements and memorials which are often located to relate to elements of the battlefield landscape and significantly contribute to our understanding and appreciation of a battle and its associations, which provide a limited contribution to understanding why events unfolded as they did, to our sense of place and how battlefields are remembered today.</p>
Negligible	<p>Non-designated historic landscape of:</p> <p>a) Very limited artistic interest due to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ very limited appreciation as a work of art in its own right, in terms of aesthetics and any other experiential qualities;

Value (sensitivity)	Criteria
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ where the historic landscape was formally designed, the very limited degree to which the design set the trend for later gardens and designed landscapes, or marked a very limited shift in landscape design history; ▪ where the historic landscape was formally designed, very poor quality and very limited survival of any planned visual relationships (such as vistas or sightlines) from within the designed landscape towards landscape features beyond its boundaries (either built or naturally occurring); and ▪ where the historic landscape was formally designed the design was by a locally important gardener or landscape designer and it being a very common, very poorly representative, very fragmentary or a very unimportant work. <p>b) Very limited historic interest due to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ very limited quantity and very poor quality of associated documentary or other evidence for the history of the historic landscape, including maps, plans, written accounts, tree surveys, research reports, excavation reports, photographs, film, letters and any other kind of record; ▪ the very limited degree to which the historic landscape as a whole represents a particular period in the history of garden or landscape design (where formally designed), and/or the degree to which one or more of the historic landscape's components form a very poor example of a particular period or style, or sequence of styles over time; ▪ the very limited relationship with historic individuals, communities, events, traditions and/or historic and social movements. Very limited reflection of these in the physical elements of the historic landscape; and ▪ very limited evidence of the role that the historic landscape plays for communities in connecting people with the past, including very limited access and recreation, interpretation and education, or other forms of engagement. <p>c) Very limited horticultural interest due to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ the presence of horticultural or arboricultural collections which are in a very poor condition with very limited renewal, and a very limited range of species and/or very limited unusual species or rarities; ▪ very few individual trees which are recognised for their age, and cultural associations, and none of 'champion' status; ▪ the presence of scientific collections which are in a very poor condition, with very limited documentation, propagation and availability to others; and ▪ a very limited contribution to the history of horticulture, arboriculture or silviculture. <p>d) Very limited architectural interest due to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ the very limited presence of historic buildings and structures, none of which may be listed; ▪ the very limited degree to which the buildings or structures within the historic landscape contribute to the character of the landscape, either through their own intrinsic interest, through their interest as a group or through their relationship with other aspects of the historic landscape.

Value (sensitivity)	Criteria
	<p>e) Very limited archaeological interest due to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ very limited evidence of the survival of an early form of historic landscape; very limited survival of historic landscape elements with very limited legibility; ▪ the very limited research potential and/or contribution of archaeological evidence to our understanding of the development and history of the historic landscape; and ▪ the very limited presence of known archaeological sites or monuments which make a very limited contribute to the character of the historic landscape either by virtue of their own intrinsic interest, or through their relationship with other aspects of the historic landscape. <p>f) Very limited scenic interest due to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ the size, location and/or overall character, including any combination of its built, landscaped, planted, water or natural components, making a very limited contribution to the quality of the surrounding landscape; and ▪ the very limited degree of rarity and contrast with the surrounding landscape. <p>g) Very limited nature conservation interest due to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ the very limited presence of sites recognised at a local level for their flora (plants), fauna (animals), geology (rock types and forms), geomorphology (landforms) or a combination of these features; and ▪ a very limited range of different habitats, or one or more habitats, with very limited evidence for management to support nature conservation principles, or to support protected species.
	<p>Non-Inventory historic battlefields with:</p> <p>a) Historical associations that make a very limited contribution to history and to modern society and culture, including military history, strategy and tactics, such as military innovations or occurrences associated with the battle, associations with locally significant historical individuals or groups and their interactions, or with a locally significant event or campaign, documentary and historic map evidence that may result in a very limited enhancement to our understanding of historical events, and the battle has a limited place in the local history and consciousness as reflected through literature, oral tradition and evidence of the role that battlefield plays for communities.</p> <p>b) Special qualities comprising physical remains, including built structures that were present at the time of the battle, such as field walls or buildings, route ways like roads, bridges and paths, or elements resulting from the battle itself, or elements resulting from the battle itself, including earthworks or graves, archaeological evidence that can support and enhance documentary records and provide, details about events, weaponry and combatants that are not available through other sources and the potential for buried archaeological deposits, such as the remains of earthworks, camps, burials or entrenchments, and/or archaeological potential which can provided a very limited contribution to the archaeology and areas in which the battlefield is located.</p>

Value (sensitivity)	Criteria
	c) Landscape characteristics including features of terrain such as hills and other high ground, or valleys, natural obstacles such as watercourses, bogs and cliffs, areas providing concealment such as slopes, ditches and woodland routes of movement and manoeuvre such as paths and narrow passes, historic settlements and memorials which are often located to relate to elements of the battlefield landscape and significantly contribute to our understanding and appreciation of a battle and its associations, which provide a very limited contribution to understanding why events unfolded as they did, to our sense of place and how battlefields are remembered today.

Criteria to inform the identification of key characteristics, features or elements of historic landscapes

For World Heritage Sites the key characteristics, features or elements should be defined with reference to the information contained in the Statements of Outstanding Universal Value.

For Inventory Gardens and Designed Landscapes, the identification of key characteristics, features or elements (articulated as key landscape features and special features) should be based on the information contained in the Inventory of Gardens and Designed Landscapes. Where required to supplement this information the criteria identified below can be used to inform the identification of key characteristics, features or elements for Inventory Gardens and Designed Landscapes. They will also be used to inform the identification for key characteristics, features or elements for non-designated historic landscapes:

- a) Artistic interest (the design of a garden and designed landscape as is currently evident) including:
 - appreciation of the landscape as a work of art in its own right, in terms of aesthetics and any other experiential qualities;
 - the quality and survival of any planned visual relationships (such as vistas or sightlines) from within the designed landscape towards landscape features beyond its boundaries (either built or naturally occurring);
 - the degree to which the design set the trend for later gardens and designed landscapes, or marked a shift in landscape design history; and
 - whether it was designed by an important garden or landscape designer and is a rare or particularly representative, intact or important work.
- b) Historic interest (the historical context, the survival of evidence for its development and the relationship of the historic landscape with people, both past and present) including:
 - the amount and quality of associated documentary or other evidence for the history of the historic landscape, including maps, plans, written accounts, tree surveys, research reports, excavation reports, photographs, film, letters and any other kind of record;

- the degree to which the historic landscape as a whole represents a particular period in the history of garden or landscape design (where formally designed) and/or the degree to which one or more of the historic landscape's components form an outstanding example of a particular period or style, or sequence of styles over time;
 - its relationship with historic individuals, communities, events, traditions and/or historic and social movements, and the degree to which these can be reflected in the physical elements of the historic landscape; and
 - evidence of the role that the historic landscape plays for communities in connecting people with the past – this can be reflected through access and recreation, interpretation and education, or other forms of engagement.
- c) Horticultural interest (the plants, trees, shrubs and woodlands in a garden and designed landscape or historic landscape). It covers any important associations with the history of horticulture, arboriculture (the cultivation of trees and shrubs) or silviculture (the cultivation of forest trees, or forestry) including:
- the presence of horticultural or arboricultural collections, their condition and renewal, and range of species and/or unusual species or rarities;
 - the presence of individual trees recognised for their age, significant cultural associations or 'champion' status;
 - the presence of scientific collections, their condition, documentation, propagation and availability to others; and
 - the site's overall place in the history of horticulture, arboriculture or silviculture.
- d) Architectural interest (the built features within a garden and designed landscape or historic landscape) including:
- the presence of buildings and structures that are listed in recognition of their special architectural and historic interest; and
 - the degree to which the buildings or structures contribute to the character of the historic landscape, either through their own intrinsic interest, through their interest as a group or through their relationship with other aspects of the landscape.
- e) Archaeological interest (archaeological features contained within the garden and designed landscape or historic landscape) including:
- evidence of the survival of an early form of historic landscape, surviving historic landscape elements and their legibility;
 - the research potential and/or contribution of archaeological evidence to our understanding of the development and history of the historic landscape; and
 - other known archaeological sites or monuments which contribute to the character of the historic landscape either by virtue of their own intrinsic interest, or through their relationship with other aspects of the historic landscape.
- f) Scenic interest (the special contribution that the garden and designed landscape or historic landscape makes to the quality of the surrounding landscape) including:

- size, location and/or overall character, including any combination of its built, landscaped, planted, water or natural components; and
 - rarity and contrast with the surrounding landscape.
- g) Nature conservation interest (the quality and diversity of the environments and habitats within the garden and designed landscape of historic landscape) including:
- the presence of sites recognised at an international, national or local level for their flora (plants), fauna (animals), geology (rock types and forms), geomorphology (landforms) or a combination of these features; and
 - the degree to which it contains a range of different habitats, or one or more habitats, which appear at the time of assessment to be managed to support nature conservation principles, or to support protected species.

Assessments should also be undertaken based on the guidance provided by Managing Change in the Historic Environment: Gardens and Design Landscapes (HES, 2020c).

For Inventory Battlefields, the starting point for the identification of key characteristics, features or elements of historic battlefields (articulated as special qualities and key landscape characteristics) will be the information contained in the Inventory of Historic Battlefields. Where required to supplement this information the criteria identified below will be used to inform the identification of these. They should also be used to inform the identification for key characteristics, features or elements for non-designated historic battlefields. Based on the criteria identified in Table A9.1-Annex A-3, the key characteristics, features or elements of historic battlefields will be considered with reference to:

- a) Historical associations;
- b) Significant physical remains and/or archaeological potential (special qualities); and
- c) Battlefield landscape (Key landscape characteristics).

Assessments should be undertaken based on the guidance provided by Managing Change in the Historic Environment: Historic Battlefields (HES, 2020d).

1.3 References

Historic Environment Scotland (2020a). Designation Policy and Selection Guidance. [Online]. Available at: <https://www.historicenvironment.scot/archives-and-research/publications/publication/?publicationId=8d8bbaeb-ce5a-46c1-a558-aa2500ff7d3b> (Accessed March 2021).

Historic Environment Scotland (2020b). *Managing Change in the Historic Environment: Setting*. [Online]. Available at: <https://www.historicenvironment.scot/archives-and-research/publications/publication/?publicationid=80b7c0a0-584b-4625-b1fd-a60b009c2549> (Accessed February 2021).

Historic Environment Scotland (2020c). Managing Change in the Historic Environment: Gardens and Designed Landscapes [Online]. Available at: <https://www.historicenvironment.scot/archives-and-research/publications/publication/?publicationid=83214207-c4e7-4f80-af87-a678009820b9> (Accessed March 2021).

Historic Environment Scotland (2020d). Managing Change in the Historic Environment: Historic Battlefields [Online]. Available at: <https://www.historicenvironment.scot/archives-and-research/publications/publication/?publicationid=b7a05b45-f2a9-4c71-8450-a60b0094c62e> (Accessed March 2021).

UNESCO (2021). The Criteria for Selection. [Online]. Available at: <https://whc.unesco.org/en/criteria/> (Accessed March 2021).