Initial Appraisal	**Intervention 114: Edinburgh Suburban Line Services**
Estimated total Public Sector Funding Requirement:	***Capital Costs/grant*** £20m - £50m

Summary Impact on Key Strategic Outcomes

Improve Journey Times and Connections
Reduce Emissions
Improve Quality, Accessibility and Affordability

- - -	- -	-	*0*	+	++	+++

(Judgement based on available information against a 7pt. scale.)

Intervention Description:

Cross Edinburgh service from Livingston North to Shawfair utilising the Edinburgh South Suburban Line. This would require enhancement of the infrastructure, additional rolling stock and signalling.

Summary: Rationale for Not Progressing

Recent studies have concluded that the business case for introducing passenger services on this line is poor. This intervention uses very scarce capacity through Waverly and Haymarket and uses train paths that could be deployed more effectively for use by strategically important services.

Other interventions in this urban network or adjacent corridors, such as D6 (Using Intelligent Transport Systems on Parts of the Road Network to Enhance Capacity and Operations), D11 ((Strategic) Park-&-Ride/Park-&-Choose Strategy) and D23 (Rail Enhancements in the East of Scotland) give similar benefits and are more cost effective.

Table C114.1.1 STPR Objectives

STPR Objectives	
STPR Objective 1: To maintain the 60-minute commutable labour market area at the current level, with a particular focus on linking areas of economic activity.	**1: Positive -** This work would enhance the 60 minute commutable labour market by providing direct services to Edinburgh, improving access to jobs and other facilities.
STPR Objective 2: To enhance public transport interchange opportunities, where feasible to do so.	**2: Slightly Positive -** The provision of these services would provide direct interchange opportunities that do not currently exist, improving connections and journey times.
STPR Objective 3: To increase public transport capacity and frequency between Fife and Edinburgh.	**3: Neutral –** This Intervention is not expected to have a resultant impact on services travelling between Fife and Edinburgh other than improving connections in general terms.
STPR Objective 4: To promote continuing reduction in accident rates and severity rates across the strategic transport network.	**4: Neutral –** This intervention is unlikely to have a significant impact on addressing this objective.
STPR Objective 5: To promote journey time reductions, particularly by public transport, between the Central Belt and Aberdeen/Inverness primarily to allow business to achieve an effective working day when travelling between these centres.	**5: Neutral -** This intervention may add additional movements to and from the east end of Waverley station. This should not restrict the arrival of services from the north (which arrive from the west) but would do nothing to enhance their arrival.
STPR Objective 6: To promote efficient and effective transport links to support the development and implementation of the proposed national development at Edinburgh Airport identified in the NPF2.	**6: Neutral –** This intervention is unlikely to have a significant impact on addressing this objective.

This intervention also addresses an objective in another corridor.

STPR Objective	Corridor, Urban Network or Strategic Node
To increase public transport capacity and frequency between Livingston and Edinburgh.	Corridor 13

Table C114.1.2 Key Strategic Outcomes

Key Strategic Outcomes (KSO's)		
Objective:	**Assessment Summary:**	**Supporting Information:**
Improve Journey Times and Connections:	**Neutral**	Provision of a rail service between Livingston and Shawfair is likely to improve journey time and enhance connections between Edinburgh and Livingston; however impacts are forecast for some long distance strategic services.
Reduce Emissions:	**Minor/Moderate Benefit**	Rail service improvement is likely to encourage use of public transport and potentially reduce car travel and associated road vehicle emissions, as well as bring an improvement to air quality. The resultant reduction in emissions is forecast to be minimal.
Improve Quality, Accessibility and Affordability:	**Minor Benefit**	This intervention is likely to increase rail capacity, improving journey quality and making rail a more attractive and affordable alternative to journeys by car for the Edinburgh suburban area. Rail travel between Edinburgh and Livingston would be accessible to more communities.

Table C114.1.3 Implementability Appraisal

Implementability Appraisal	
Technical:	Infrastructure enhancements will be required including track and nearby structures where appropriate. Some resignalling may also be required, as well as the procurement of rolling stock.
Operational:	Significant problems could arise if this intervention were to be implemented, as there is little spare capacity at Haymarket and Waverley. Also, a report by Halcrow (March 2008) highlighted the fact that substantial subsidies would be required were this intervention to be implemented, as demand is unlikely to be enough to cover operational costs now and in the future. Timetable amendments will be required to ensure no adverse impacts on existing freight traffic along the route.
Public:	No consultation has been undertaken on this option.

Table C114.1.4 Comparative Appraisal

Comparative Appraisal	
Intervention Hierarchy:	This is a Level 3 intervention as it would require significant investment and infrastructure change.
Interaction:	There is the possibility of interaction between this intervention and others in this urban network which aim to improve public transport accessibility across the city.
Mutually Exclusive:	This intervention is mutually exclusive with intervention 84 (Rail Service Frequency Enhancements between Edinburgh and Newcraighall).

Table C114.1.5 Environmental Appraisal

Environmental Appraisal	
Assessment Summary	This intervention will encourage the use of rail, potentially resulting in an improvement to air quality and CO_2e emissions as a result of modal shift.

Transport Scotland
Strategic Transport Projects Review
Report 3 Generation, Sifting and Appraisal of Interventions
Annex 1