Transport Scotland Strategic Transport Projects Review Report 3 Generation, Sifting and Appraisal of Interventions Annex 1



Initial Appraisal	Intervention 120: New Rail Line from the Borders	Rai	il Link at l	Eskbank t	o Penicuik						
Estimated total Public S	ector Funding Requirement:			C	apital Costs	s/grant	£100m - £	:500m			
					-	0	+		++	+++	
Summary Impact	Improve Journey Times and Connections										
on Key Strategic	Reduce Emissions										
Outcomes	Improve Quality, Accessibility and Affordability										
				(Judgement based on available information against a 7pt. scale.)							
Intervention Description	1:										
Heavy rail branch line from	m the Borders Rail Link at Eskbank to Penicuik, using the existing dis	suse	ed alignme	ent past Ro	sewell and /	Auchenc	inny where	possible	е.		

Summary: Rationale for Not Progressing

The costs of this intervention would be excessive relative to the potential benefits. Other interventions in this corridor and in Edinburgh are therefore likely to contribute more significantly to meeting the objectives and provide greater value for money.





Transport Scotland Strategic Transport Projects Review Report 3 Generation, Sifting and Appraisal of Interventions Annex 1



Table C120.1.1 STPR Objectives

STPR Objectives	
STPR Objective 1: To increase the attractiveness and capacity of public transport into Edinburgh to reduce crowding and forecast road congestion.	1: Slightly Positive- This intervention would allow additional mode choice to commuters in Penicuik, and provide rail links to Edinburgh City Centre and the Borders, which are presently only readily accessible by car. This intervention may also help to alleviate road congestion build up in Edinburgh City Centre by providing a new rail service. However this route is only going to serve Penicuik limiting the amount of passengers using the service.
. <u>STPR Objective 2:</u> To promote continuing reduction in accident rates and severity rates across the strategic transport network.	2: Neutral - If more people use public transport (i.e. rail) instead of their car this may help to reduce road accidents and severity rates. However, this intervention is unlikely to have any significant effect on this objective.

This intervention also addresses objectives in another urban network.

STPR Objective	Corridor, Urban Network or Strategic Node
To maintain the 60-minute commutable labour market area at the current level, with a particular focus on linking areas of economic activity.	Edinburgh
To enhance public transport interchange opportunities, where feasible to do so.	Edinburgh

Table C120.1.2 Key Strategic Outcomes

Key Strategic Outcomes (K		
Objective:	Assessment Summary:	Supporting Information:
Improve Journey Times and Connections:	Minor Benefit	Public transport journey times would improve, as would connections. However, these times may only be marginally better than car journey times to the Borders. If this route is only going to serve Penicuik, limiting the potential number of passengers using the service, these benefits will be limited.
Reduce Emissions:	Minor Benefit	The new branch line potentially would result in a slight reduction in emissions due to modal shift from travel by car.
Improve Quality, Accessibility and Affordability:	Minor Benefit	Commuters would have access to a frequent service providing an alternative to car use. At present, road travel is the most accessible means of travel to Edinburgh and the Borders, so this intervention would provide a competitive alternative. Although if this route is only going to serve Penicuik, limiting the potential number of passengers using the service, these benefits will be limited.





Transport Scotland Strategic Transport Projects Review Report 3 Generation, Sifting and Appraisal of Interventions Annex 1



Table C120.1.3 Implementability Appraisal

Implementability	/ Appraisal
Technical:	This intervention would utilise the old Penicuik branch line as much as possible. However, this would still be a major engineering intervention, with some sections of new track, and new rolling stock required. A new station, possibly with Park-&-Ride facilities, would be required in Penicuik, and it is possible that the route will be electrified. This intervention should not impact on existing traffic or public transport, so disruption should be minimal.
Operational:	Careful consideration of the interaction with future services on the Borders Rail Line and on the east approaches to Waverly would be required to allow effective operation over the life of the project.
Public:	This intervention would have public interest at both local and regional levels.

Table C120.1.4 Comparative Appraisal

Comparative Appraisal				
Intervention Hierarchy:	The provision of a new branch line is classed as a Level 3 intervention as significant infrastructure changes are required to implement the intervention.			
Interaction:	This intervention would potentially interact with and complement intervention 119 (New Light Rapid Transit Line from Edinburgh to Dalkeith and Penicuik) and provide an improved public transport service along this route.			
Mutually Exclusive:	This intervention is not mutually exclusive with any other intervention specified for this corridor route.			

Table C120.1.5 Environmental Appraisal

Environmental Appraisal					
Assessment	This intervention has the potential for modal shift resulting in a slight improvement to air quality and mitigation of adverse climatic factors. The new rail line would				
Summary	have a slight adverse impact on noise levels and landscape with the potential for further impacts on biodiversity, water, soils / geology and cultural heritage				
-	depending on the location of the new line.				



