

Detailed Appraisal		Intervention D28 – Upgrade Edinburgh Haymarket Public Transport Interchange						
Estimated total Public Sector Funding Requirement:		<i>Capital Costs/grant</i> <i>Annual Revenue Support Present</i> <i>Value of Cost to Gvt</i> <i>BCR/PVB</i>				£50m - £100m. £3.5m over 30 years £10m - £50m <0.75 / £10m – £50m		
Summary Impact on STAG Criteria	Environment Safety Economy Integration Accessibility and Social Inclusion	---	--	-	0	+	++	+++
(Judgement based on available information against a 7pt. scale.)								
Intervention Description:								
This intervention is targeted at a number of objectives for Edinburgh relating to improvements in public transport interchange, connections to the airport and providing for enhanced rail capacity.								
This intervention would consist of:								
<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>Improvements to platform level access; and</li><li>New at-grade concourse.</li></ul>								
Summary: Rationale for Selection								
This intervention would provide a significant contribution towards two of the objectives for Edinburgh, 'to maintain the 60-minute commutable labour market area at the current level, with a particular focus on linking areas of economic activity' and 'to enhance public transport interchange opportunities, where feasible to do so', by providing a step change in interchange facilities in Edinburgh. There is a forecast 50 per cent increase in rail demand between 2005 and 2022, as well as the growth in bus and tram passengers. By providing the opportunity for transfer between heavy rail, light rail and bus, opportunities for travel to areas in West Edinburgh, including the airport, would be greatly enhanced.								
This intervention would complement measures to maximise the use of the station and reduce pressure on Waverley Station and the link between the two, such as the additional bay platform.								

Table D28.1.1 STPR Objectives

STPR Objectives	
<p><u>STPR Objective 1:</u> To maintain the 60-minute commutable labour market area at the current level, with a particular focus on linking areas of economic activity.</p> <p><u>STPR Objective 2:</u> To enhance public transport interchange opportunities, where feasible to do so.</p> <p><u>STPR Objective 3:</u> To increase public transport capacity and frequency between Fife and Edinburgh.</p> <p><u>STPR Objective 4:</u> To promote continuing reduction in accident rates and severity rates across the strategic transport network.</p> <p><u>STPR Objective 5:</u> To promote journey time reductions, particularly by public transport, between the Central Belt and Aberdeen/Inverness primarily to allow business to achieve an effective working day when travelling between these centres.</p> <p><u>STPR Objective 6:</u> To promote efficient and effective transport links to support the development and implementation of the proposed national development at Edinburgh Airport identified in the NPF2.</p>	<p><b>1: Strongly Positive</b> - This intervention would significantly improve access to and from the city centre via Haymarket. Platform and concourse improvements mean passengers can board and alight trains more efficiently with improved integration of rail, tram, bus, coach and taxi facilities providing benefits for all commuters.</p> <p><b>2: Strongly Positive</b> – This intervention would deliver co-ordinated and integrated rail, tram, bus, coach and taxi facilities with real time information. In addition it would result in enhanced pedestrian access, compliance with the Disability Discrimination Act (DDA) and improved access to and from the city centre for all users of all modes.</p> <p><b>3. Neutral</b> – This intervention would help to improve public transport interchange opportunities at Edinburgh Haymarket Station. However, it is unlikely this intervention would increase public transport capacity and frequency between Fife and Edinburgh.</p> <p><b>4: Neutral</b> - This intervention would improve personal safety and security by providing a multi-modal interchange at Haymarket, but is not expected to impact directly on accident rates and severity rates.</p> <p><b>5: Slightly Positive</b> – There would be no improvements to rail journey times but better integration with other transport modes could result in reduced overall journey times for those passengers using Haymarket Station.</p> <p><b>6: Positive</b> – The creation of a multi-modal interchange at Haymarket would help to enhance public transport interchange opportunities and therefore improve efficiency and effectiveness of transport links through Haymarket Station. This intervention would also help to support the development at Edinburgh Airport.</p>

Table D28.1.2 STAG Criteria

STAG Criteria		
Criteria:	Assessment Summary:	Supporting Information:
<b>Environment:</b>	<b>Moderate Benefit/ Moderate Negative Impact</b>	This intervention aims to improve the transport interchange in Edinburgh with a consequential improvement to air quality. This intervention has the potential to affect Edinburgh's diverse range of internationally important cultural heritage designations. The effects it could have would depend on the exact form of works required and it should be designed to avoid or mitigate these potential adverse effects.
<b>Safety:</b>	<b>Minor Benefit</b>	This intervention is expected to have a minor benefit for safety. Security would be improved due to more efficient interchange facilities and safer cycle storage. The interchange facility would be safe and accessible for user groups through full compliance with the DDA, albeit the overall impact is expected to be minor benefit.
<b>Economy:</b>	<b>Moderate Benefit</b>	<b>Transport Economic Efficiency (TEE):</b> This intervention would have a positive impact on TEE through reducing travel times for multi-modal journeys to key economic development sites and encouraging modal shift towards the more efficient public

		<p>transport option over the car. Furthermore, modal shift would result in reduced vehicle operating costs for drivers.</p> <p><b>Wider Economic Benefits (WEBs):</b> It is anticipated that a significant upgrade to the interchange at Haymarket would increase the capacity and efficiency of public transport in Edinburgh and help maintain the ability of commuters to access employment in the city centre. Reductions in travel times for multi-modal journeys and reductions in road travel time (arising from modal shift and reduced congestion) would also have a positive impact on the efficiency and productivity of businesses in the region. The upgraded interchange could provide the capacity for the increased movement of people to development sites such as Edinburgh Airport, and the areas of Economic Activity of Edinburgh City Centre and West Edinburgh. Given the current and predicted growth in West Edinburgh, it is probable that the centre of gravity for travel would move westwards, increasing the importance of Haymarket relative to Waverley Station.</p> <p><b>Economic Activity and Location Impacts (EALIs):</b> This intervention would go some way to assisting in the progression of development areas in Edinburgh through enhanced transport provision and would have some impact on the continued competitiveness of the area as a strategic investment location. In particular, the intervention would benefit businesses which depend on recruiting staff commuting from areas outwith the city as well as tourism businesses. The upgraded interchange could improve access to and from Edinburgh Airport and surrounding sites and support further development in these areas.</p>
<b>Integration:</b>	<b>Moderate Benefit</b>	<p><b>Transport Integration:</b> The integration of transport at Haymarket Station would be enhanced by this intervention. The integration of modes and interchange possibilities afforded by the measure would help provide existing users with a seamless journey and encourage new users to use public transport. The opportunity for the use of integrated ticketing would be enhanced by this development. The upgrade of the interchange at Haymarket would allow seamless integrated travel to Edinburgh Airport following the implementation of the proposed Edinburgh Tram link. There is a direct significant impact on providing a step change in interchange facilities in Edinburgh that would accommodate the forecast 50 per cent increase in rail demand between 2005 and 2022, as well as growth in bus passengers and passengers using the tram network.</p> <p><b>Transport Land-Use Integration:</b> This intervention could have a positive effect on reducing the need to travel by car, a positive impact on economic growth of the city and help “support the City’s... ability to compete in the global economy” (<i>Edinburgh and Lothians Structure Plan 2015</i>). An upgraded interchange at Haymarket would help maintain a prosperous and competitive city economy and promote direct investment in sustainable and accessible locations such as Edinburgh City Centre and the strategic business centres at Edinburgh Park / South Gyle, Leith and Granton.</p> <p><b>Policy Integration:</b> The interchange would be designed to be fully compliant with the DDA, whilst any promotion of public transport over car use would have a positive effect on health services.</p>
<b>Accessibility and Social Inclusion:</b>	<b>Moderate Benefit</b>	<p><b>Community Accessibility:</b> While this intervention would not improve public transport network coverage; it would promote non-motorised trips.</p> <p><b>Comparative Accessibility:</b> It is considered that the accessibility impact of the intervention would have a greater benefit to existing and potential users of the Haymarket interchange and would promote public transport use for socially excluded groups such as the elderly or mobility impaired. In addition, it would have a positive impact on regeneration areas in Edinburgh such as Edinburgh City Centre. There would be a positive impact for mobility impaired users as the new interchange would cater for all traveller groups and would be fully DDA compliant.</p>

Table D28.1.3 Key Strategic Outcomes

Key Strategic Outcomes (KSO's)		
Objective:	Assessment Summary:	Supporting Information:
<b>Improve Journey Times and Connections:</b>	<b>Moderate Benefit</b>	This intervention would significantly improve connections by improving the transport hub, allowing better access to and from the city centre from the south, west and north for public transport users. Journey times would not be improved as a result of this intervention, but overall journey time benefits are likely for public transport users, due to improved connections and better integration of all modes.
<b>Reduce Emissions:</b>	<b>Moderate Benefit</b>	The upgrade of Haymarket Station would promote modal shift to public transport in Edinburgh as a result of the creation of an enhanced multi-modal interchange and could contribute to a reduction in CO <sub>2</sub> e emissions and an improvement in local air quality, especially in the Air Quality Management Areas.
<b>Improve Quality, Accessibility and Affordability:</b>	<b>Major Benefit</b>	The quality and accessibility of the interchange would be improved through station enhancements to platform and concourse areas, resulting in full DDA compliance. This intervention would not impact on affordability.

Table D28.1.4 Scottish Government's Strategic Objectives

Scottish Government's Strategic Objectives		
Objective:	Assessment Summary:	Supporting Information:
<b>Safer and Stronger:</b>	<b>Minor Benefit</b>	This measure would improve the quality and accessibility of public transport and improve access to essential services and economic opportunities although it would not offer support to communities in less accessible parts of the country. Safety would be an integral part of the redevelopment. While road accidents could decrease as a result of the induced modal shift anticipated from this measure, the overall impact is expected to be minor.
<b>Smarter:</b>	<b>Minor Benefit</b>	This intervention would generally result in improved access to schools, colleges and universities in Edinburgh.
<b>Wealthier and Fairer:</b>	<b>Moderate Benefit</b>	While individual journey times would remain similar, improved connections resulting from the proposed measure would improve inter-modal journey times and improve reliability. This would help meet the objective of a Wealthier and Fairer Scotland by helping to sustain economic growth in Edinburgh and the surrounding area.
<b>Greener:</b>	<b>Moderate Positive</b>	This intervention promotes a modal shift away from the car to public transport and could result in improvements to air quality and reduced CO <sub>2</sub> e emissions. It also promotes the use of sustainable transport.
<b>Healthier:</b>	<b>Minor Benefit</b>	Although this intervention would not increase access to health services, the forecast modal shift to public transport would support the development of a healthier Scotland.

Table D28.1.5 Implementability Appraisal

Implementability Appraisal	
<b>Technical:</b>	<p>It is unlikely that any untried techniques would be required when implementing this intervention. However, as the design stages progress, localised issues could arise which require increased technical capabilities to overcome them.</p> <p>Given the proximity of the site to a busy railway and to the future tram route, issues related to constructability and phasing, whilst allowing continued operations, would be critical considerations to successful project delivery.</p>
<b>Operational:</b>	There are no envisaged operational issues related to this intervention during its projected life.
<b>Public:</b>	Consultations have been undertaken with key stakeholders, local residents and businesses. The results were incorporated into to the preferred option for the existing intervention ( <a href="http://www.haymarketinterchange.com/index.php">http://www.haymarketinterchange.com/index.php</a> ). While there is likely to be a general positive attitude towards this intervention, there would potentially be some opposition due to the impact on the existing station building.