

Detailed Appraisal		E15 – Rail Freight Access Enhancements to Greenock Port						
Estimated total Public Sector Funding Requirement:		Capital Costs/grant Annual Revenue Support Present Value of Cost to Gvt BCR/PVB		£100m - £250m - £50m - £100m <0.75				
Summary Impact on STAG Criteria	Environment Safety Economy Integration Accessibility and Social Inclusion	---	--	-	0	+	++	+++
Intervention Description:		(Judgement based on available information against a 7pt. scale.)						
<p>This intervention supports the objectives to improve access to Greenock Port and improve the operation of the A8/M8 by transferring freight from road to rail.</p> <p>It would re-open the closed branch line between Container Base Junction (on the Wemyss Bay branch) and Greenock Container Base. Additional capacity may be required between Paisley and Shields Junction depending on the volume of rail freight that would serve the container base, although the provision of improvements associated with Ayrshire/Inverclyde may provide alternatives for freight services on the western approaches to Glasgow.</p>								
Summary: Rationale for Not Recommending <p>The level of expenditure required to re-open the rail access to Greenock Port is high in comparison to the potential benefits. Intervention D27 (Rail Enhancements between Inverclyde, Ayrshire and Glasgow) is likely to limit the movement of freight trains through the Paisley to Shields section of route, thus limiting the benefits of this intervention.</p> <p>These rail constraints, in addition to the significant costs, mean that this intervention provides poor value for money and limited impact on the wider objectives.</p>								

Table E15.1.1 STPR Objectives

STPR Objectives	
<p><u>STPR Objective 1:</u> To Increase capacity and reduce journey times by public transport between Glasgow and Inverclyde.</p> <p><u>STPR Objective 2:</u> To facilitate freight access to Greenock port.</p> <p><u>STPR Objective 3:</u> To improve the efficiency of the A8 / M8 during periods of peak demand with a focus on reducing the conflict between longer distance and local traffic.</p> <p><u>STPR Objective 4:</u> To reduce the accident rate to the national road type average on the M8 and A8.</p> <p><u>STPR Objective 5:</u> To promote efficient and effective transport links to support the development and implementation of the proposed national development at Glasgow Airport identified in the NPF2.</p>	<p>1: Neutral - This intervention would not have any impact on this objective as it is aimed at improving provision for freight services.</p> <p>2: Strongly Positive - The re-opening of the Greenock freight branch would greatly enhance the accessibility of Greenock port by reducing the need for goods to enter and leave the port using the A8.</p> <p>3: Neutral - This intervention would contribute to a reduction in HGVs on the A8/M8 by encouraging a transfer of freight movement from road to rail, however the impact on the A8 / M8 is expected to be marginal.</p> <p>4: Neutral - This intervention would not have any significant effect on reducing accident rates and severity rates across the strategic transport network. However, the intervention could encourage modal shift for freight from road to rail which could result in a reduction in the number of accidents due to fewer HGVs on the A8 and M8. This is expected to be marginal.</p> <p>5: Neutral - This intervention is unlikely to have any significant effect on this objective.</p>

Table E15.1.2 STAG Criteria

STAG Criteria		
Criteria:	Assessment Summary:	Supporting Information:
Environment:	Neutral/Minor Benefit	This intervention could potentially have positive impacts on air quality and climatic factors, as modal shift of freight from road to rail would reduce road vehicle traffic (particularly HGVs) and thereby result in a slight reduction in overall emissions.
Safety:	Neutral	This intervention would not have any significant impact on improving safety. However, the intervention could encourage modal shift for freight from road to rail and there could potentially be a reduction in the number of accidents if there are fewer goods vehicles on the road, although this impact is expected to be marginal.
Economy:	Minor Negative Impact	<p>Transport Economic Efficiency (TEE): Providing rail access to Greenock Port for freight would encourage a modal shift from road to rail. This would reduce the number of HGV's entering and leaving the port facility and help reduce congestion in Greenock and on the A8 through the town. However, the benefits are not considered to compare favourably with the cost and therefore the intervention will not provide value for money, compared to other interventions considered.</p> <p>Wider Economic Benefits (WEBs): There could be a wider benefit to road users by reducing the volume of freight on the roads, but this is likely to be marginal.</p> <p>Economic Activity and Location Impacts (EALIs): Providing rail freight access to Greenock Port would improve overall access to its facilities. However, there is limited room for growth of those facilities due to the constrained site, so any benefits of providing rail freight access will be limited.</p>
Integration:	Minor Benefit	<p>Transport Integration: This intervention would provide a new rail link into Greenock Port, allowing freight entering or leaving the country by ship to transfer directly to rail.</p> <p>Transport and Land-Use Integration: This intervention would integrate rail access for freight into the port and distribution facilities at Greenock, supporting the development and expansion of the port.</p> <p>Policy Integration: This intervention is consistent with the policy aims of the National Transport Strategy, Scotland's Railways and the Freight Action Plan.</p>
Accessibility and Social Inclusion:	Neutral	<p>Community Accessibility: This intervention would not impact on the public transport network coverage or any local accessibility issues.</p> <p>Comparative Accessibility: There are no comparative accessibility issues associated with this intervention.</p>

Table E15.1.3 Key Strategic Outcomes

Key Strategic Outcomes (KSO's)		
Objective:	Assessment Summary:	Supporting Information:
Improve Journey Times and Connections:	Minor Negative Impact / Minor Positive	This intervention would improve journey times for freight, which transfers from road to rail, as it would allow the avoidance of the congested motorway network through Glasgow. Rail access would also allow freight to be distributed across Scotland and the rest of the UK by rail. However, there could be an impact on journey times for passenger services due to the increased number of freight services operating over the congested section of line between Paisley Gilmour Street and Shields Junction.
Reduce Emissions:	Minor Benefit	This intervention would encourage some freight modal shift from road to rail, which could result in a slight reduction in CO ₂ e emissions.
Improve Quality, Accessibility and Affordability:	Minor Benefit	Access to Greenock Port for freight is likely to be improved due to the avoidance of the congested road network. This intervention will not impact on affordability.

Table E15.1.4 Scottish Government's Strategic Objectives

Scottish Government's Strategic Objectives		
Objective:	Assessment Summary:	Supporting Information:
Safer and Stronger:	Neutral	The reduction of HGVs journeys would have a marginally positive impact on road safety in Greenock and along the A8. This intervention would not affect the quality, accessibility and affordability of public transport.
Smarter:	Neutral	This intervention would not impact on access to education.
Wealthier and Fairer:	Minor Benefit	Better use of existing infrastructure to reduce freight transport costs, speed up rail links and better connect the west coast with the rest of Scotland, could lead to economic growth, job creation and prosperity. The rail freight access to the freight hub at Greenock Port could lead to inward investment; however, there is limited room for growth of the freight facilities due to the constrained site.
Greener:	Minor Benefit	This intervention promotes a modal shift to rail with resultant improvements to air quality and reduced carbon emissions. It also promotes the use of sustainable transport.
Healthier:	Neutral	This intervention would encourage modal shift from road vehicles to more sustainable rail trips for freight journeys, marginally reducing emissions and their impact on the community. It would also not affect access to healthcare.

Table E15.1.5 Implementability Appraisal

Implementability Appraisal	
Technical:	<p>This intervention would involve upgrading an existing railway line to allow a regular freight service to be introduced. The current status of this infrastructure is unknown. However, no untried technologies would be required when implementing this intervention. As the design stages progress, localised issues may arise which require increased technical capabilities to overcome.</p> <p>Construction of some aspects of this intervention may have an impact on operating existing services, however much of this work could be carried out at times when the disruption would be minimised.</p>
Operational:	Running more freight trains on the already congested line from Paisley Gilmour Street to Shields Junction could reduce the reliability of this section of line for passenger services.
Public:	Public opinion on this intervention is likely to be neutral as it should not have a significant impact on passenger services.