

Detailed Appraisal		E2 - Co-locate Dundee Bus Station with Rail Station						
Estimated total Public Sector Funding Requirement:		<i>Capital Costs/grant</i> <i>Annual Revenue Support Present</i> <i>Value of Cost to Gvt</i> <i>BCR/PVB</i>				<£10m - <£10m N/A		
Summary Impact on STAG Criteria	Environment Safety Economy Integration Accessibility and Social Inclusion	---	--	-	0	+	++	+++
(Judgement based on available information against a 7pt. scale.)								
Intervention Description:								
This intervention supports the objective to improve bus/rail interchange opportunities in Dundee.								
It consists of re-locating the existing bus station adjacent to the existing rail station, with associated improved pedestrian access to the city centre.								
Summary: Rationale for not recommending								
Moving the bus station would improve the interchange between these strategic bus and rail services. However, there is unlikely to be a significant number of people making this interchange. The more frequent bus to rail interchange would be between local buses and rail services. These bus services would be expected to continue using the on street bus stops and would not be expected to use the proposed bus station. Critically, many strategic bus journeys currently integrate well with local bus services on the existing site. The proposed re-siting of the bus station would make it difficult to make this transfer as some local bus services would not connect with the proposed station.								

Table E2.1.1 STPR Objectives

STPR Objectives	
<p><u>STPR Objective 1:</u> To reduce the conflict between long distance and local traffic.</p> <p><u>STPR Objective 2:</u> To improve bus/rail interchange opportunities.</p> <p><u>STPR Objective 3:</u> To improve the public transport accessibility and competitiveness to Dundee West.</p> <p><u>STPR Objective 4:</u> To promote continuing reduction in accident rates and severity rates across the strategic transport network.</p> <p><u>STPR Objective 5:</u> To promote journey time reductions; particularly by public transport between Aberdeen and the Central Belt, primarily to allow business to achieve an effective working day when travelling between these centres.</p>	<p><b>1: Neutral</b> – This intervention focuses on public transport interchanges and would not reduce the conflict between long distance and local traffic.</p> <p><b>2: Negative</b> – At present, Dundee's bus and rail stations are over 1km apart and separated by busy urban routes, including the inner ring road, making the connection between them difficult. The current bus station is on the eastern edge of the city centre and is used by rural, regional and long distance bus services. Moving the bus station would improve the interchange between strategic bus services and rail services. However, there is unlikely to be a significant number of people interchanging. The more frequent bus to rail interchange would be between local buses and rail services. These bus services would be expected to continue using the on street bus stops and would not be expected to use the proposed bus station. Critically, many long distance journeys made by bus currently integrate well with local bus services on the existing site. The proposed re-siting of the bus station would make it difficult to make this transfer as some local bus services would not connect with the proposed station.</p> <p><b>3: Slightly Negative</b> – Upgrading the existing bus and railway stations and locating them on the same site would help to improve some bus/rail interchange opportunities. However, this intervention would disconnect the local and regional bus services that are currently well integrated within the city.</p> <p><b>4: Neutral</b> – This intervention is not expected to impact upon reducing accident and severity rates across the strategic transport network.</p> <p><b>5: Neutral</b> – This intervention would not impact on interchange time as strategic trips between Aberdeen and the Central Belt would be likely to be completed wholly by either bus or train without the need to change modes in Dundee.</p>

Table E2.1.2 STAG Criteria

STAG Criteria		
Criteria:	Assessment Summary:	Supporting Information:
<b>Environment:</b>	<b>Minor Benefit</b>	No substantial effects on the natural environment are forecast to this intervention, given that it lies within an already built-up, urban area. The key effect that must be considered is the potential impact on numerous listed buildings in the vicinity, and for this reason, it is recommended that consideration is given to high quality design for the new building, to fit in with the historic townscape of the local area.
<b>Safety:</b>	<b>Minor Benefit</b>	This intervention is expected to have a minor benefit on safety. Security would be improved due to more efficient interchange facilities and safer cycle storage. The interchange facility would be safe and accessible for user groups through full compliance with the DDA.

<b>Economy:</b>	<b>Neutral</b>	<p><b><u>Transport Economic Efficiency (TEE):</u></b> This intervention could have a positive economic impact through reducing travel times for multi-modal journeys to key economic development sites and encouraging modal shift from car to public transport. However, as the proposed re-siting of the bus station would remove the current connection between local and strategic bus services, the benefits are anticipated to be minimal.</p> <p><b><u>Wider Economic Benefits (WEBs):</u></b> There could be some travel time benefits for multi-modal journeys, however the proposed re-siting of the bus station would remove the current connection between local and strategic bus services and therefore the overall benefits are anticipated to be negative.</p> <p><b><u>Economic Activity and Location Impacts (EALIs):</u></b> The main intervention benefits are expected to come from time savings due to the removal of delay during interchanges between modes. However, as long distance bus or rail passengers are unlikely to switch mode, the benefits are anticipated to be minimal and therefore would not offset the cost of the relocated bus station.</p>
<b>Integration:</b>	<b>Minor Negative Impact</b>	<p><b><u>Transport Integration:</u></b> The provision of new infrastructure would provide a modern facility with up to date amenities. Additionally, it could make transfer from some local rail services to strategic bus a more feasible alternative. Alternatively longer distance bus trips would be less likely to transfer to long distance rail. Critically, the proposed re-siting of the bus station would remove the current connection between local and strategic bus services.</p> <p><b><u>Transport and Land Use Integration:</u></b> Providing an effective interchange point between bus and rail services may improve access to rail services for potential development areas and encourage the use of more sustainable bus and rail services as alternatives to the car.</p> <p><b><u>Policy Integration:</u></b> This intervention would be expected to increase accessibility for the disabled and improve social inclusion. The intervention could contribute to car travel reduction policies; however, this is expected to be marginal.</p>
<b>Accessibility and Social Inclusion:</b>	<b>Minor Negative Impact</b>	<p><b><u>Community Accessibility:</u></b> This intervention could increase the network coverage of public transport for a wide range of people and trip purposes, particularly from areas around Dundee. However, this intervention would adversely impact on the current connection between local and strategic bus services.</p> <p><b><u>Comparative Accessibility:</u></b> This intervention would primarily benefit those without access to a car. The proposed re-siting of the bus station would remove the current connection between local and strategic bus services.</p>

Table E2.1.3 Key Strategic Outcomes

Key Strategic Outcomes (KSO's)		
Objective:	Assessment Summary:	Supporting Information:
<b>Improve Journey Times and Connections:</b>	<b>Neutral</b>	Some local connections would improve marginally from co-location. At present, connections between the railway and bus stations are poor, with passengers travelling between the two having to walk approximately 1km. However, co-location would not have an impact on strategic bus / rail services, as interchanging between these services would be unlikely.
<b>Reduce Emissions:</b>	<b>Neutral</b>	It is not envisaged to result in significant modal shift away from the private car to bus or rail, with no resultant change in vehicular emissions. There could be some local, minor adverse effects as a result of dust generated during construction works.
<b>Improve Quality, Accessibility and Affordability:</b>	<b>Neutral</b>	<p>Accessibility of local public transport services would remain largely unaffected by this intervention. The quality of the passenger experience may improve, as the new stations would be more modern and provide passengers with more co-ordinated information on journeys. Passengers who would benefit most from better integrated station include the elderly, disabled, young children and commuters.</p> <p>This intervention would not impact on affordability.</p>

Table E2.1.4 Scottish Government's Strategic Objectives

Scottish Government's Strategic Objectives		
Objective:	Assessment Summary:	Supporting Information:
<b>Safer and Stronger:</b>	<b>Neutral</b>	Co-locating the bus and rail stations in Dundee may improve the quality and accessibility of some local public transport services; however, this is anticipated to be marginal. There may also be slight improvements in terms of security for those that currently walk between the two sites and at the station itself through improved lighting and upgraded CCTV.
<b>Smarter:</b>	<b>Neutral</b>	Co-locating the bus and rail stations in Dundee would not significantly impact on access to higher / further education.
<b>Wealthier and Fairer:</b>	<b>Neutral</b>	The co-location of the bus and rail stations in Dundee could result in faster journey times for those interchanging between some local rail and strategic bus services. Alternatively some connections between local and strategic bus services may be adversely effected.
<b>Greener:</b>	<b>Neutral</b>	Co-location of the bus and rail stations in Dundee would not result in significant modal shift from car to public transport. The forecast impact on emissions is minimal.
<b>Healthier:</b>	<b>Neutral</b>	Co-location of the bus and rail stations in Dundee is not likely to result in significant modal shift from car to public transport or improve transport access to health and community services.

Table E2.1.5 Implementability Appraisal

Implementability Appraisal	
<b>Technical:</b>	<p>Relocation of the bus station to a single bus/rail interchange is expected to provide significant technical issues due to the general constraints of construction in an urban environment and the extent of engineering works required.</p> <p>It is envisaged that this intervention would result in a significant amount of disruption during construction of this project and may have an impact on those who currently use direct connections between local and national bus services at the existing facility.</p>
<b>Operational:</b>	<p>There would be an opportunity for new station facilities to enrich the environment for passengers. These should include Electronic Real Time Passenger Information Displays which update passengers with information regarding their journey. Clearer and better quality information at the station may attract more passengers to use public transport services. Passengers' safety would be improved with lighting and CCTV upgrading and there would be no substantial walk required as transport modes would be integrated. There may be the opportunity for an increase in the number of cycle lockers and an improvement to bus waiting areas.</p>
<b>Public:</b>	<p>This intervention is in the public domain and it is anticipated that it would in general receive support from the public. There may however be some objections due to the disruption that would be caused during construction.</p>