

Detailed Appraisal		E9 - Rail Freight connections to Rosyth Port						
Estimated total Public Sector Funding Requirement:		<i>Capital Costs/grant</i>			£50m - £100m			
		<i>Annual Revenue Support Present</i>			-			
		<i>Value of Cost to Gvt</i>			£10m - £50m			
		<i>BCR/PVB</i>			Estimated BCR <0.75			
Summary Impact on STAG Criteria	Environment Safety Economy Integration Accessibility and Social Inclusion	---	--	-	0	+	++	+++
(Judgement based on available information against a 7pt. scale.)								
Intervention Description:								
This intervention supports the objective to promote efficient and effective transport links to support the development and implementation of developments at Rosyth, identified in NPF2. The proposed improvement in rail access to Rosyth, would consist of:								
<ul style="list-style-type: none">A direct freight line (together with associated infrastructure enhancements) between the Dunfermline to Longannet line and Rosyth, allowing services from Stirling and the West Coast Main Line to access Rosyth directly, by-passing Inverkeithing station and junctions.								
Summary:- Rationale for Not Recommending								
The proposed option performs only moderately well against planning objectives and has a potential major adverse environmental impact on biodiversity. This is in part due to the need for new rail track and the impact that this may have on the environmentally sensitive shoreline of the Firth of Forth. This intervention is also anticipated to have potential moderate adverse effects on cultural heritage and landscape.								
Although this intervention would provide a direct freight line to Rosyth, Intervention D31 (Inverkeithing to Halbeath Rail Line) has the added advantage of providing benefits to rail passengers, as well as making better use of the existing rail connections to the port.								

Table E9.1.1 STPR Objectives

STPR Objectives	
<p><u>STPR Objective 1:</u> To reduce Edinburgh to Perth public transport journey times and increase opportunities to travel by public transport.</p> <p><u>STPR Objective 2:</u> To promote continuing reduction in accident rates and severity rates across the strategic transport network.</p> <p><u>STPR Objective 3:</u> To promote journey time reductions between the Central Belt and Aberdeen / Inverness primarily to allow business to achieve an effective working day when travelling between these centres.</p> <p><u>STPR Objective 4:</u> To promote efficient and effective transport links to support the development and implementation of the proposed national developments at Rosyth, Forth Crossing and Edinburgh Airport identified in the NPF2.</p> <p><u>STPR Objective 5:</u> To improve the efficiency of the M90/A90 during periods of peak demand with a focus on reducing the conflict between longer distance and local traffic</p>	<p>1: Neutral – This intervention would not have any significant effect in helping to reduce Edinburgh to Perth public transport journey times and increase opportunities to travel by public transport.</p> <p>2: Neutral – This intervention would not have any significant effect in promoting continuing reduction in accident rates and severity rates across the strategic transport network.</p> <p>3: Neutral – This intervention would not have any significant effect in promoting journey time reductions between the Central Belt and Aberdeen / Inverness.</p> <p>4: Strongly Positive –The provision of a new rail freight connection to the Port of Rosyth would promote a more efficient and effective transport link, for freight, to the nationally significant, proposed development at Rosyth identified in the NPF2. This intervention would allow more freight trains to access the Port of Rosyth by connecting to the west via Kincardine, providing a more efficient connection by reducing conflict with passenger trains at Inverkeithing.</p> <p>5: Slightly Positive – The provision of a new rail line to the Port of Rosyth would not impact significantly on the operation of the A90/M90 however, there would be some benefit by facilitating a larger proportion of future freight traffic to be carried by rail rather than road.</p>

Table E9.1.2 STAG Criteria

STAG Criteria		
Criteria:	Assessment Summary:	Supporting Information:
Environment:	Major Negative Impact / Minor Benefit	This intervention is anticipated to have adverse effects on the natural environment, including water, geology and soils, landscape, biodiversity (particularly the Firth of Forth) and landscape and cultural heritage assets, where there is potential for substantial effects on nationally important sites. However, these effects would be dependent on the location of the final works. It is considered that mitigation could be possible, but the degree of effect remains uncertain at this stage. These effects would be partially offset by potential beneficial effects in air quality and noise. However, given that the benefits are largely as a result of freight rather than passenger transport, it is envisaged that these effects would be fairly minimal.
Safety:	Minor Benefit	Increased rail freight adoption by major freight companies operating out of Rosyth could lead to a reduction in long distance freight journeys by road. Rail freight enhancements could therefore lead to a reduction in total HGV kilometres travelled on corridors leading to and from Rosyth and contribute to a reduction in accidents involving goods vehicles in the area.
Economy:	Minor Negative Impact / Minor Benefit	<p>Transport Economic Efficiency (TEE): With a cost in the range of £50m to £100m, it is unlikely that this intervention will represent good value for money, with a benefit to cost ratio less than 0.75.</p> <p>Wider Economic Benefits (WEBs): This intervention would facilitate the development of the proposed container facility by improving access, resulting in benefits to the wider economy. It would also improve access to and support growth in the dockyard facilities and ferry services.</p> <p>Economic and Location Impacts (EALIs): This intervention would support the proposed national development to provide a major port facility at Rosyth for containerised traffic. Improved freight connections are one of the policy requirements of the National Planning Framework (NPF2), which encourages economic growth through sustainable development.</p>
Integration:	Moderate Benefit	<p>Transport Integration: This intervention would improve integration between road, rail and sea.</p> <p>Transport and Land Use Integration: This intervention would support development of the port at Rosyth.</p> <p>Policy Integration: This intervention would support the national designation of Rosyth in the National Planning Framework 2.</p>
Accessibility and Social Inclusion:	Neutral	<p>Community Accessibility: This intervention would not impact on community accessibility.</p> <p>Comparative Accessibility: While freight accessibility to the rail network would be improved, the impact on personal accessibility and social inclusion would be neutral.</p>

Table E9.1.3 Key Strategic Outcomes

Key Strategic Outcomes (KSO's)		
Objective:	Assessment Summary:	Supporting Information:
Improve Journey Times and Connections:	Minor Benefit	This intervention would reduce journey times for rail freight accessing the Port of Rosyth by avoiding the heavily congested Forth Bridge and the need to reverse at Inverkeithing. The intervention would also provide a more direct link to the rail freight distribution facilities in and around Mossend, Coatbridge and Grangemouth. However the intervention would not provide a reduction in passenger journey times between the main population centres.
Reduce Emissions:	Minor Benefit	This intervention will help to reduce the overall growth in HGV mileage, which will contribute to a reduction in emissions in the localised area resulting in improvements to local air quality and a reduction in CO ₂ e emissions. However, acting partially against this, rail freight is predominantly hauled by diesel locomotives and noise, vibration and exhaust pollution close to the new rail spur will impact on private properties in the immediate area.
Improve Quality, Accessibility and Affordability:	Neutral	Rail freight enhancements would not directly affect public transport links, accessibility issues and the affordability of public transport.

Table E9.1.4 Scottish Government's Strategic Objectives

Scottish Government's Strategic Objectives		
Objective:	Assessment Summary:	Supporting Information:
Safer and Stronger:	Minor Benefit	A reduction in HGV mileage as a result of improved usage of rail freight would result in a small reduction in the number of goods vehicles serving Rosyth, with potentially small improvements in road safety in the area. This intervention would not affect the quality, accessibility and affordability of public transport.
Smarter:	Neutral	This intervention would not affect access to education facilities.
Wealthier and Fairer:	Minor Benefit	The Port of Rosyth has good connections to sea and road links. Improved rail freight connections have been identified as one of the policy requirements of the National Planning Framework (NPF2), a document which encourages economic growth through sustainable development. Expansion of the freight hub at Rosyth should stimulate investment in the area, leading to the creation of jobs both in primary and secondary employment and therefore a rise in wealth of the local community which has suffered from high unemployment due to the decline of the former Royal Navy facilities at Rosyth and decline in coal mining in Fife. Realising the full potential of the container hub will rely on having good access by road, rail and sea.
Greener:	Minor Benefit	It is envisaged that this intervention could encourage modal shift for freight from road to rail. This could relieve traffic congestion to provide an improvement in local air quality and emissions through a reduction in road vehicle emissions (particularly HGVs).
Healthier:	Neutral	This intervention would not affect access to health services or encourage modal shift from car to public transport or more sustainable modes.

Table E9.1.5 Implementability Appraisal

Implementability Appraisal	
Technical:	<p>There are a number of technical issues associated with this intervention. However, these are unlikely to be significantly different from the construction of any new railway line. The geology beneath the route includes various limestones. However, although these have been quarried in the vicinity of Limekilns and Charlestown to the west of Rosyth, at this stage the risk of mining beneath the routes is low. However this remains a potential risk affecting deliverability of this intervention.</p> <p>A large proportion of the work would be carried out on a new alignment and there may be disruption for people living and working close to the construction of the line. There may be further disruption when connecting the line to the Longannet Branch however, the number of freight trains on this route will be low following the opening of the Stirling – Alloa – Kincardine Railway and this work could be timed to coincide with closures for routine maintenance.</p>
Operational:	An increase in freight trains to Rosyth may impact on capacity elsewhere on the rail network however, these issues are not anticipated to be significant.
Public:	There has been no detailed consultation specifically on this individual intervention however, it is expected that any measure which promotes modal shift to more sustainable transport would achieve public support.