

Consultation Questions

The answer boxes will expand as you type.

Procuring rail passenger services

1. What are the merits of offering the ScotRail franchise as a dual focus franchise and what services should be covered by the economic rail element, and what by the social rail element?

Q1 comments: Dual [or more] franchise so that in the event of dispute arising between Transport dept and franchisee, or within the company itself, other operators can still provide their service. [As has happened in other parts of UK]

2. What should be the length of the contract for future franchises, and what factors lead you to this view?

Q2 comments: Initially perhaps 5 years to 'test' the franchisee with the opportunity of 10 or 15 year contract later

3. What risk support mechanism should be reflected within the franchise?

Q3 comments: **UNABLE to COMMENT** -I do have the knowledge to do so.

4. What, if any, profit share mechanism should apply within the franchise?

Q4 comments: **UNABLE to COMMENT** -I do have the knowledge to do so.

5. Under what terms should third parties be involved in the operation of passenger rail services?

Q5 comments: **UNABLE to COMMENT** -I do have the knowledge to do so.

6. What is the best way to structure and incentivise the achievement of outcome measures whilst ensuring value for money?

Q6 comments: **UNABLE to COMMENT** -I do have the knowledge to do so.

7. What level of performance bond and/or parent company guarantees are appropriate?

Q7 comments: **UNABLE to COMMENT** -I do have the knowledge to do so.

8. What sanctions should be used to ensure the franchisee fulfils its franchise commitments?

Q8 comments: Appropriate penalty clauses and possible withdrawal of franchise

Achieving reliability, performance and service quality

9. Under the franchise, should we incentivise good performance or only penalise poor performance?

Q9 comments: Good performance should be the 'norm' for the railway system whatever might be appropriate in Scotland, taking in weather conditions etc., say 97%. Operating above this figure could be incentivised whilst poor performance should be penalised to encourage 'normal' operation.

10. Should the performance regime be aligned with actual routes or service groups, or should there be one system for the whole of Scotland?

Q10 comments: Good question! Weather conditions, line security etc on routes in Scotland can be so different that perhaps performance per route or route service should be considered. 'Pride in the route/service' could also lead to improved attention to performance and possibly an incentive payment

11. How can we make the performance regime more aligned with passenger issues?

Q11 comments: **UNABLE to COMMENT** -I do have the knowledge to do so.

12. What should the balance be between journey times and performance?

Q12 comments: **UNABLE to COMMENT** -I do have the knowledge to do so.

13. Is a Service Quality Incentive Regime required? And if so should it cover all aspects of stations and service delivery, or just those being managed through the franchise?

Q13 comments: If one group, say the train operators, is striving for normal or incentive working, this could be jeopardised by sub-optimal performance by station staff such as train despatchers.

14. What other mechanisms could be used for assessing train and station quality?

Q14 comments: **UNABLE to COMMENT** -I do have the knowledge to do so.

Scottish train services

15. Can better use be made of existing train capacity, such as increasing the permitted standing time beyond the limit of 10 minutes or increasing the capacity limit? What is an acceptable limit for standing times on rail services?

Q15 comments: **UNABLE to COMMENT** -I do have the knowledge to do so.

16. Should the number of services making use of interchange stations (both rail to rail and rail to other modes) be increased to reduce the number of direct services? What would be the opportunities and challenges of this?

Q16 comments: Rail to other modes should be increased to make for a better integrated transport system. Rail to rail is a tricky one because every use of an interchange station requires: [1] 'across station time' eg East Coast recommend 10 minutes is allowed at Edinburgh Waverly [2] passengers must then add 'buffer time' to allow for late running of arriving train, plus more at busy travel times (peak days times and seasonal times) [3] disabled, elderly or confused (including foreign visitors, of which Scotland has many) will need much more 'buffer time' especially if assistance with say wheel chairs are needed. Interchanging deters passengers. Why travel by train when air travel is probably more direct and certain long distance road coaches certainly are?

Advantages of travel by train include convenience and speed. Increase the inconvenience and 'door to door' time by increasing interchanging the travel by train experience loses much of its appeal.

17. Should Government direct aspects of service provision such as frequency and journey time, or would these be better determined by the franchisee based on customer demand?

Q17 comments: **UNABLE to COMMENT** -I do have the knowledge to do so.

18. What level of contract specification should we use the for the next ScotRail franchise?

Q18 comments: **UNABLE to COMMENT** -I do have the knowledge to do so.

19. How should the contract incentivise the franchisee to be innovative in the provision of services?

Q19 comments: **UNABLE to COMMENT** -I do have the knowledge to do so.

Scottish rail fares

20. What should be the rationale for, and purpose of, our fares policy?

Q20 comments: **UNABLE to COMMENT** -I do have the knowledge to do so.

21. What fares should be regulated by government and what should be set on a commercial basis? Do your recommendations change by geographic area (the Strathclyde area example), or by type of journey (for example suburban or intercity)?

Q21 comments: **UNABLE to COMMENT** -I do have the knowledge to do so.

22. How should we achieve a balance between the taxpayer subsidy and passenger revenue contributions in funding the Scottish rail network? At what rate should fares be increased, and how feasible would it be to apply higher increases to Sections of the network which have recently been enhanced?

Q22 comments: **UNABLE to COMMENT** -I do have the knowledge to do so.

23. What should the difference be between peak and off-peak fares? Will this help encourage people to switch to travelling in the off-peak?

Q23 comments: **UNABLE to COMMENT** -I do have the knowledge to do so.

Scottish stations

24. How should we determine what rail stations are required and where, including whether a station should be closed?

Q24 comments: Could not some stations on slow speed lines become 'halts' where intending passengers indicate [as with some bus stops] that they wish to board the train [Perhaps this is done already???

25. What are the merits or issues that arise from a third party (such as a local authority or local business) being able to propose, promote and fund a station or service?

Q25 comments: **UNABLE to COMMENT** -I do have the knowledge to do so.

26. Should only one organisation be responsible for the management and maintenance of stations? If this was the franchisee how should that responsibility be structured in terms of leasing, investment, and issues relating to residual capital value?

Q26 comments: **UNABLE to COMMENT** -I do have the knowledge to do so.

27. How can local communities be encouraged to support their local station?

Q27 comments: I understand that some do already. Their advice could be sought.

28. What categories of station should be designated and what facilities should be available at each category of station?

Q28 comments: **UNABLE to COMMENT** -I do have the knowledge to do so.

Cross-border services

29. Should cross-border services continue to go north of Edinburgh? In operating alongside ScotRail services, how do cross-border services benefit passengers and taxpayers? And who should specify these services, the Department of Transport or the Scottish Ministers?

Q29 comments: **Cross-border services should continue [see also comment 16 above].** It should also be noted that many passengers travelling to major UK cities or to air and sea/ferry ports will have other interchanges to make at or towards the end of their journey from/to Scotland. Please minimise hassle for them!

30. Or should the cross-border services terminate at Edinburgh Waverley, allowing opportunities for Scottish connections? And if so, what additional benefits would accrue from having an Edinburgh Hub?

Rolling stock

31. What alternative strategies or mechanisms could be used to reduce the cost of the provision of rolling stock?

Q31 comments: **UNABLE to COMMENT** -I do have the knowledge to do so.

32. What facilities should be present on a train and to what extent should these facilities vary according to the route served?

Q32 comments: **UNABLE to COMMENT** -I do have the knowledge to do so.

Passengers – information, security and services

33. How should we prioritise investment for mobile phone provision and / or Wi-Fi type high-bandwidth services?

Q33 comments: **UNABLE to COMMENT** -I do have the knowledge to do so.

34. How should we balance the need for additional seating capacity and retain the flexibility of a franchisee to offer first-class services if commercially viable?

Q34 comments: **UNABLE to COMMENT** -I do have the knowledge to do so.

35. What issues and evidence should be considered prior to determining whether or not to ban the consumption of alcohol on trains?

Q35 comments: **UNABLE to COMMENT** -I do have the knowledge to do so.

36. How can the provision of travel information for passengers be further improved?

Q36 comments: **UNABLE to COMMENT** -I do have the knowledge to do so.

Caledonian Sleeper

37. Should we continue to specify sleeper services, or should this be a purely commercial matter for a train operating company?

Q37 comments: **UNABLE to COMMENT** -I do have the knowledge to do so.

38. Should the Caledonian Sleeper services be contracted for separately from the main ScotRail franchise? Or should it be an option for within the main ScotRail franchise?

Q38 comments: If sleeper trains could 'pay their way' a separate franchise

might be useful but if it is 'loss leader' then perhaps it should be included in an 'all-in' franchise. Obviously night sleeper coaches are laid up during the day and this seems that they are underused, but most 'day train' coaches are laid up for most of the night so actual coach usage is probably not very different.

39. We would be interested in your views in the level and type of service that the Caledonian Sleeper Services should provide. Including:

- What is the appeal of the Caledonian Sleeper Service, and if there were more early and late trains would the appeal of the sleeper services change?
- What is the value of sleeper services to Fort William, Inverness and Aberdeen and are these the correct destinations, for example would Oban provide better connectivity?
- What facilities should the sleeper services provide and would you pay more for better facilities?

Q39 comments: The Caledonian Sleeper is an extremely useful way of travelling to London, and places further South including Europe, from St Pancras. Using the Sleeper makes good use of time and the arrival time in London is very useful for meetings, courses etc. Early start day and connecting trains do not arrive in London until 1246 from Dundee and 1355 from Aberdeen and the latest day train departures, using connections, from London for Aberdeen is 1700 and for Dundee 1800. (subject to checking). I work for a charity organisation and find the seated accommodation on the Sleeper the most economical way of attending London Meetings. Couchette type on-train accommodation may make some of the accommodation cheaper to operate than the present standard bunk beds. A mix of all three or perhaps beds and couchettes would be useful. Passengers I have spoken to mainly complain about the seated accommodation getting cold at floor level and the carriage end sliding doors not always operating when the train is joined up [Southbound] or separated [Northbound] at Edinburgh, and all the heat escapes.

Environmental issues

40. What environmental key performance indicators should we consider for inclusion in the franchise agreement or the High Level Output Specification?

Q40 comments: **UNABLE to COMMENT** -I do have the knowledge to do so.