

Scottish Financial Enterprise  
Scottish Funding Council  
Scottish Pensioners Forum  
Scottish Prison Service  
Scottish Property Federation  
Scottish Railways Preservation Society  
Scottish Rural Network  
Skills Development Scotland  
SPOKES  
Stranraer to Ayr Line Support Association  
Sustrans  
Transform Scotland  
Universities Scotland  
Visit Scotland

## Consultation Questions

There is an electronic form with all of the questions, on the website at:  
[www.transportscotland.gov.uk/rail2014](http://www.transportscotland.gov.uk/rail2014)

### Procuring rail passenger services

1. What are the merits of offering the ScotRail franchise as a dual focus franchise and what services should be covered by the economic rail element, and what by the social rail element?

Q1 comments: *All services covered by both elements*

2. What should be the length of the contract for future franchises, and what factors lead you to this view?

Q2 comments: *5 years with possibility of extending or curtailing depending upon performance Performance of previous and current operations*

3. What risk support mechanism should be reflected within the franchise?

Q3 comments: *None*

4. What, if any, profit share mechanism should apply within the franchise?

Q4 comments: *All profits should be shared by franchisee and Government*

5. Under what terms should third parties be involved in the operation of passenger rail services?

Q5 comments: *Companies such as Hull Rail and Grand Central should be encouraged to operate their own rival passenger services*

6. What is the best way to structure and incentivise the achievement of outcome measures whilst ensuring value for money?

Q6 comments: *Don't know*

7. What level of performance bond and/or parent company guarantees are appropriate?

Q7 comments: *As at present*

8. What sanctions should be used to ensure the franchisee fulfils its franchise commitments?

Q8 comments: *Chairman of operating company should be imprisoned or hung if capital punishment is reintroduced*

## Achieving reliability, performance and service quality

9. Under the franchise, should we incentivise good performance or only penalise poor performance?

Q9 comments: *Good performance should be guaranteed by the terms of the franchise contract. Poor performance should be heavily penalised followed by loss of franchise if repeated*

10. Should the performance regime be aligned with actual routes or service groups, or should there be one system for the whole of Scotland?

Q10 comments: *Whole of Scotland*

11. How can we make the performance regime more aligned with passenger issues?

Q11 comments: *The Passengers Charter should be produced by ORR*

12. What should the balance be between journey times and performance?

Q12 comments: *Good performance should not be a cost to Government. Lateness measured according to time table*

13. Is a Service Quality Incentive Regime required? And if so should it cover all aspects of stations and service delivery, or just those being managed through the franchise?

Q13 comments: *Yes all aspects*

14. What other mechanisms could be used for assessing train and station quality?

Q14 comments: *Quality of train & stations should be dictated by usage*

## Scottish train services

15. Can better use be made of existing train capacity, such as increasing the permitted standing time beyond the limit of 10 minutes or increasing the capacity limit? What is an acceptable limit for standing times on rail services?

Q15 comments: *Train capacity should be managed as and when necessary. Acceptable limits could be increased to 30 minutes*

16. Should the number of services making use of interchange stations (both rail to rail and rail to other modes) be increased to reduce the number of direct services? What would be the opportunities and challenges of this?

Q16 comments: *Passengers prefer to make journey without changing which lengthens journey time and are inconvenienced especially considering the poor quality of stations*



17. Should Government direct aspects of service provision such as frequency and journey time, or would these be better determined by the franchisee based on customer demand?

Q17 comments: *Government directed*

18. What level of contract specification should we use for the next ScotRail franchise?

Q18 comments: *Something between Option 2 and 3 but operator should be encouraged to run extra trains.*

19. How should the contract incentivise the franchisee to be innovative in the provision of services?

Q19 comments: *Extension of franchise*

### Scottish rail fares

20. What should be the rationale for, and purpose of, our fares policy?

Q20 comments: *Value for money*

21. What fares should be regulated by government and what should be set on a commercial basis? Do your recommendations change by geographic area (the Strathclyde area example), or by type of journey (for example suburban or intercity)?

Q21 comments: *All fares should have a maximum price set by Government with operator free to have lower fares.*

22. How should we achieve a balance between the taxpayer subsidy and passenger revenue contributions in funding the Scottish rail network? At what rate should fares be increased, and how feasible would it be to apply higher increases to Sections of the network which have recently been enhanced?

Q22 comments: *Taxpayer subsidy should be increased. Fares should increase by RPI + 0%. Operators profits should be limited. Enhancements are too far between so would not be feasible or desirable.*

23. What should the difference be between peak and off-peak fares? Will this help encourage people to switch to travelling in the off-peak?

Q23 comments: *Differences should be at least 20% with more off peak offers*

## Scottish stations

24. How should we determine what rail stations are required and where, including whether a station should be closed?

Q24 comments: *Have stations near the settlements they serve not like long new station on the Airdrie Balmgate new one which is in the middle of nowhere.*

25. What are the merits or issues that arise from a third party (such as a local authority or local business) being able to propose, promote and fund a station or service?

Q25 comments: *They should be able to help with funding*

26. Should only one organisation be responsible for the management and maintenance of stations? If this was the franchisee how should that responsibility be structured in terms of leasing, investment, and issues relating to residual capital value?

Q26 comments: *Network rail should manage all stations and provide what is needed by franchisees.*

27. How can local communities be encouraged to support their local station?

Q27 comments: *Communities which adopt station should receive financial reward from Government. Local firms could be encouraged to be involved.*

28. What categories of station should be designated and what facilities should be available at each category of station?

Q28 comments: *Often facilities are provided at stations which are needed. Each station should be individually assessed for its needs.*

## Cross-border services

29. Should cross-border services continue to go north of Edinburgh? In operating alongside ScotRail services, how do cross-border services benefit passengers and taxpayers? And who should specify these services, the Department of Transport or the Scottish Ministers?

Q29 comments: *Cross border services to places like Perth Inverness and Aberdeen are essential and should be enhanced and specified by DfT and Scottish Ministers consultation.*

30. Or should the cross-border services terminate at Edinburgh Waverley, allowing opportunities for Scottish connections? And if so, what additional benefits would accrue from having an Edinburgh Hub?

Q30 comments: *No There are no benefits only inconvenience*



**Rolling stock**

31. What alternative strategies or mechanisms could be used to reduce the cost of the provision of rolling stock?

Q31 comments: Rolling stock should be to an improved specification  
Diesel trains should be replaced with electric ones

32. What facilities should be present on a train and to what extent should these facilities vary according to the route served?

Q32 comments: Working clean toilets (very rare at present) room for luggage  
Room for bicycles without needing to book. (The For World  
line has no room on train for leisure equipment i.e. bicycles  
golf clubs, surf boards etc.)

**Passengers – information, security and services**

33. How should we prioritise investment for mobile phone provision and / or Wi-Fi type high-bandwidth services?

Q33 comments: Don't bother concentrate on comfort & convenience  
Specify which trains should provide buffet services

34. How should we balance the need for additional seating capacity and retain the flexibility of a franchisee to offer first-class services if commercially viable?

Q34 comments: Balance supply with demand on each service

35. What issues and evidence should be considered prior to determining whether or not to ban the consumption of alcohol on trains?

Q35 comments: Alcohol should not be banned. Many passengers  
enjoy refreshment on trains and should be encouraged  
Drunk passengers can be put off. Mobile phone using should be banned  
which is far more objectionable

36. How can the provision of travel information for passengers be further improved?

Q36 comments: Have announcers who speak English  
Journey planners are often inaccurate and misleading  
and should be better researched.

**Caledonian Sleeper**

37. Should we continue to specify sleeper services, or should this be a purely commercial matter for a train operating company?

Q37 comments: Should be an enhanced specification

38. Should the Caledonian Sleeper services be contracted for separately from the main ScotRail franchise? Or should it be an option for within the main ScotRail franchise?

Q38 comments: *Should be part of main franchise*

39. We would be interested in your views in the level and type of service that the Caledonian Sleeper Services should provide. Including:

- What is the appeal of the Caledonian Sleeper Service, and if there were more early and late trains would the appeal of the sleeper services change?
- What is the value of sleeper services to Fort William, Inverness and Aberdeen and are these the correct destinations, for example would Oban provide better connectivity?
- What facilities should the sleeper services provide and would you pay more for better facilities?

Q39 comments: *The sleeper is an essential service for Inverness & Fort William to use these trains. Why are they not listed in time tables? In a separate booklet? Facilities should be upgraded to provide a can't bar serving freshly cooked meals. Oban can join at Crainlarich*

#### **Environmental issues**

40. What environmental key performance indicators should we consider for inclusion in the franchise agreement or the High Level Output Specification?

Q40 comments: *Emissions & noise from diesel trains should be reduced*