John Miller

Consultation Questions

The answer boxes will expand as you type.

Procuring rail passenger services

1. What are the merits of offering the ScotRail franchise as a dual focus franchise and what services should be covered by the economic rail element, and what by the social rail element?

Q1 reasonable

2. What should be the length of the contract for future franchises, and what factors lead you to this view?

Q2 5 years

3. What risk support mechanism should be reflected within the franchise?

Q3 quarterly returns and review with get out clauses

4. What, if any, profit share mechanism should apply within the franchise?

Q4 % must be invested internally

5. Under what terms should third parties be involved in the operation of passenger rail services?

Q5 catering and retail – on train service is appalling

6. What is the best way to structure and incentivise the achievement of outcome measures whilst ensuring value for money?

Q6 john lewis model for staff

7. What level of performance bond and/or parent company guarantees are appropriate?

Q7 not sure

8. What sanctions should be used to ensure the franchisee fulfils its franchise commitments?

Q8 directors held legally responsible & if nec restrict limited liability

Achieving reliability, performance and service quality

9. Under the franchise, should we incentivise good performance or only penalise poor performance?

Q9 wary of targets as per gaming widespread in NHS misleading public

10. Should the performance regime be aligned with actual routes or service groups, or should there be one system for the whole of Scotland?

Q10 one system, Scotland is small enough

11. How can we make the performance regime more aligned with passenger issues?

Q11 passenger reps on boards and regulatory boards, publish audits

12. What should the balance be between journey times and performance?

Q12 essential

13. Is a Service Quality Incentive Regime required? And if so should it cover all aspects of stations and service delivery, or just those being managed through the franchise?

Q13 all

- 14. What other mechanisms could be used for assessing train and station quality?
- Q14 get the managers to travel on service

Scottish train services

15. Can better use be made of existing train capacity, such as increasing the permitted standing time beyond the limit of 10 minutes or increasing the capacity limit? What is an acceptable limit for standing times on rail services?

Q15 standing times 20 mins.

16. Should the number of services making use of interchange stations (both rail to rail and rail to other modes) be increased to reduce the number of direct services? What would be the opportunities and challenges of this?

Q16 not much room for this

17. Should Government direct aspects of service provision such as frequency and journey time, or would these be better determined by the franchisee based on customer demand?

Q17 yes thru framework

18. What level of contract specification should we use the for the next ScotRail franchise?

Q18 ????????

19. How should the contract incentivise the franchisee to be innovative in the provision of services?

Q19 comments: ???? ask an expert, not like tram fiasco

Scottish rail fares

20. What should be the rationale for, and purpose of, our fares policy?

Q20 comments: Cheaper than road alternatives.

21. What fares should be regulated by government and what should be set on a commercial basis? Do your recommendations change by geographic area (the Strathclyde area example), or by type of journey (for example suburban or intercity)?

Q21 comments: All fares should be monitored as part of contract.

22. How should we achieve a balance between the taxpayer subsidy and passenger revenue contributions in funding the Scottish rail network? At what rate should fares be increased, and how feasible would it be to apply higher increases to Sections of the network which have recently been enhanced?

Q22 comments: National network. Where no alternative to rail then more subsidy. Roads north of Perth are national disgrace – divided country.

23. What should the difference be between peak and off-peak fares? Will this help encourage people to switch to travelling in the off-peak?

Q23 comments: DK

Scottish stations

24. How should we determine what rail stations are required and where, including whether a station should be closed?

Q24 Minimal set of stations already. Should be looking to open more.

25. What are the merits or issues that arise from a third party (such as a local authority or local business) being able to propose, promote and fund a station or service?

Q25 If so let them. Cant be worse than present.

26. Should only one organisation be responsible for the management and maintenance of stations? If this was the franchisee how should that responsibility be structured in terms of leasing, investment, and issues relating to residual capital value?

Q26 No.

27. How can local communities be encouraged to support their local station?

Q27 ask them

28. What categories of station should be designated and what facilities should be available at each category of station?

Q28 Shelter and clean loo at all.

Cross-border services

29. Should cross-border services continue to go north of Edinburgh? In operating alongside ScotRail services, how do cross-border services benefit passengers and taxpayers? And who should specify these services, the Department of Transport or the Scottish Ministers?

Q29 Yes. When Scotland is independent then can agree between London and Edinburgh. Now it is national UK asset. No brainer question!

30. Or should the cross-border services terminate at Edinburgh Waverley, allowing opportunities for Scottish connections? And if so, what additional benefits would accrue from having an Edinburgh Hub?

Q30 No way. No benefits. More to Scotland than M8 corridor. Wind, sea, oil, gas is all in the north and west.

Rolling stock

31. What alternative strategies or mechanisms could be used to reduce the cost of the provision of rolling stock?

Q31 how do I know?

32. What facilities should be present on a train and to what extent should these facilities vary according to the route served?

32 Agequate clean toilets with lockable doors. No option.

Passengers – information, security and services

33. How should we prioritise investment for mobile phone provision and / or Wi-Fi type high-bandwidth services?

Q33 On busiest routes first. Not a priority before clean timely trains.

34. How should we balance the need for additional seating capacity and retain the flexibility of a franchisee to offer first-class services if commercially viable?

Q34 need to keep business travellers happy. Who makes the money to support public services!

35. What issues and evidence should be considered prior to determining whether or not to ban the consumption of alcohol on trains?

Q35 Non issue if presence of guards. Otherwise its a jungle.

36. How can the provision of travel information for passengers be further improved?

Q36 better website

Caledonian Sleeper

37. Should we continue to specify sleeper services, or should this be a purely commercial matter for a train operating company?

Q37 National prerogative – essential service. Hidden losses if it goes.

38. Should the Caledonian Sleeper services be contracted for separately from the main ScotRail franchise? Or should it be an option for within the main ScotRail franchise?

Q38 Yes and made secure as national asset

39. We would be interested in your views in the level and type of service that the Caledonian Sleeper Services should provide. Including:

- What is the appeal of the Caledonian Sleeper Service, and if there were more early and late trains would the appeal of the sleeper services change?
- What is the value of sleeper services to Fort William, Inverness and Aberdeen and are these the correct destinations, for example would Oban provide better connectivity?
- What facilities should the sleeper services provide and would you pay more for better facilities?

Q3 utterly essential service, catering rubbish, nec for international links via London

Environmental issues

40. What environmental key performance indicators should we consider for inclusion in the franchise agreement or the High Level Output Specification?

Q40 DK

This is worst survey I have ever filled out. Very unimaginative. Heard of survey monkey etc?