

## Consultation Questions

There is an electronic form with all of the questions, on the website at:  
[www.transportscotland.gov.uk/rail2014](http://www.transportscotland.gov.uk/rail2014)

### Procuring rail passenger services

1. What are the merits of offering the ScotRail franchise as a dual focus franchise and what services should be covered by the economic rail element, and what by the social rail element?

Q1 comments: ONLY MERIT WOULD BE IF THERE WAS AN INCREASE IN SERVICES OFFERED. SCOTRAIL MUST BE KEPT AS ONE SYSTEM, WITHIN THE U.K. WIDE NETWORK.

2. What should be the length of the contract for future franchises, and what factors lead you to this view?

Q2 comments: LONGER FRANCHISES SHOULD INCLUDE INVESTMENT CONTRACTS TO PROVIDE NEW TRAINS AND FACILITIES.

3. What risk support mechanism should be reflected within the franchise?

Q3 comments: USE THE EXISTING SYSTEMS

4. What, if any, profit share mechanism should apply within the franchise?

Q4 comments: USE THE EXISTING SYSTEMS SUBJECT TO PERFORMANCE

5. Under what terms should third parties be involved in the operation of passenger rail services?

Q5 comments: ONLY IF FULL INCLUSION IN THE NATIONAL SYSTEM IS PROPOSED, I.E. JOINT AND THROUGH TICKETING

6. What is the best way to structure and incentivise the achievement of outcome measures whilst ensuring value for money?

Q6 comments: UNABLE TO ANSWER

7. What level of performance bond and/or parent company guarantees are appropriate?

Q7 comments: UNABLE TO ANSWER.

8. What sanctions should be used to ensure the franchisee fulfils its franchise commitments?

Q8 comments: BINDING CONTRACT COMMITMENTS.

## Achieving reliability, performance and service quality

9. Under the franchise, should we incentivise good performance or only penalise poor performance?

Q9 comments: INCENTIVISE GOOD PERFORMANCE UP TO A PRESET LIMIT. GREATER PENALTIES FOR POOR PERFORMANCE.

10. Should the performance regime be aligned with actual routes or service groups, or should there be one system for the whole of Scotland?

Q10 comments: WHOLE OF SCOTLAND TO PREVENT SOME SERVICES BEING NEGLECTED.

11. How can we make the performance regime more aligned with passenger issues?

Q11 comments: BY INDEPENDANT SURVEYS AND USER GROUP INPUT.

12. What should the balance be between journey times and performance?

Q12 comments: JOURNEY TIMES SHOULD NEVER BE INCREASED TO IMPROVE PERFORMANCE FIGURES. (NO CHARTER MINUTES!)

13. Is a Service Quality Incentive Regime required? And if so should it cover all aspects of stations and service delivery, or just those being managed through the franchise?

Q13 comments: A "SQUIRE" IS REQUIRED AND SHOULD COVER ALL ASPECTS OF PASSENGER EXPERIENCE.

14. What other mechanisms could be used for assessing train and station quality?

Q14 comments: GET USER GROUPS TO SUBMIT REGULAR SURVEYS.

## Scottish train services

15. Can better use be made of existing train capacity, such as increasing the permitted standing time beyond the limit of 10 minutes or increasing the capacity limit? What is an acceptable limit for standing times on rail services?

Q15 comments: ACCEPTABLE JOURNEY TIME FOR STANDING IS 30 MINUTES.

16. Should the number of services making use of interchange stations (both rail to rail and rail to other modes) be increased to reduce the number of direct services? What would be the opportunities and challenges of this?

Q16 comments: NO PASSENGER BENEFITS TO INTERCHANGE WHERE THROUGH SERVICES COULD OPERATE. PASSENGERS DO NOT LIKE CHANGING.



17. Should Government direct aspects of service provision such as frequency and journey time, or would these be better determined by the franchisee based on customer demand?

Q17 comments: *GOVERNMENT DIRECT FREQUENCY AND MINIMUM JOURNEY TIMES - ALSO FIRST AND LAST SERVICES.*

18. What level of contract specification should we use for the next ScotRail franchise?

Q18 comments: *TARGETED SPECIFICATION - AS DESCRIBED ON PAGE 35.*

19. How should the contract incentivise the franchisee to be innovative in the provision of services?

Q19 comments: *BY SUBSIDISING NEW SERVICES FOR AN INITIAL PERIOD TO SEE IF THEY ARE USED.*

### **Scottish rail fares**

20. What should be the rationale for, and purpose of, our fares policy?

Q20 comments: *TO MAXIMISE USE OF RAIL SERVICES AND ALSO TO MAXIMISE AMOUNT TAKEN IN FARES.*

21. What fares should be regulated by government and what should be set on a commercial basis? Do your recommendations change by geographic area (the Strathclyde area example), or by type of journey (for example suburban or intercity)?

Q21 comments: *ALL FARES EXCEPT PROMOTIONAL FARES SHOULD BE REGULATED.*

22. How should we achieve a balance between the taxpayer subsidy and passenger revenue contributions in funding the Scottish rail network? At what rate should fares be increased, and how feasible would it be to apply higher increases to Sections of the network which have recently been enhanced?

Q22 comments: *INCREASE FARES NO MORE THAN INFLATION. ENHANCED SERVICES WILL INCREASE USE AND THEREFORE REVENUE.*

23. What should the difference be between peak and off-peak fares? Will this help encourage people to switch to travelling in the off-peak?

Q23 comments: *KEEP THE DIFFERENCE AT SAME PERCENTAGE AS NOW. INCREASING PEAK FARES MAY SEND MORE PEOPLE TO ROAD.*

## Scottish stations

24. How should we determine what rail stations are required and where, including whether a station should be closed?

Q24 comments: ONGOING LIAISON WITH EXISTING USER GROUPS AND ALSO OVERALL OPERATING REQUIREMENTS.

25. What are the merits or issues that arise from a third party (such as a local authority or local business) being able to propose, promote and fund a station or service?

Q25 comments: ONLY IF THERE IS NO ADVERSE EFFECT ON EXISTING USERS OR ON OVERALL JOURNEY TIMES.

26. Should only one organisation be responsible for the management and maintenance of stations? If this was the franchisee how should that responsibility be structured in terms of leasing, investment, and issues relating to residual capital value?

Q26 comments: LET LOCAL ORGANISATIONS CARE FOR STATIONS - SUBJECT TO SCOTRAIL SUPERVISION.

27. How can local communities be encouraged to support their local station?

Q27 comments: THROUGH COMMUNITY PARTNERSHIP GROUPS (THESE EXIST IN ENGLAND AND WALES)

28. What categories of station should be designated and what facilities should be available at each category of station?

Q28 comments: CURRENT SCOTRAIL PROVISION SHOULD CONTINUE WITH IN ADDITION TOILET FACILITIES AT ALL STAFFED STATIONS

## Cross-border services

29. Should cross-border services continue to go north of Edinburgh? In operating alongside ScotRail services, how do cross-border services benefit passengers and taxpayers? And who should specify these services, the Department of Transport or the Scottish Ministers? JOINTLY SPECIFY.

Q29 comments: THEY MUST CONTINUE NORTH OF EDINBURGH. PASSENGERS ON LONG DISTANCE JOURNEYS DON'T LIKE CHANGING.

30. Or should the cross-border services terminate at Edinburgh Waverley, allowing opportunities for Scottish connections? And if so, what additional benefits would accrue from having an Edinburgh Hub?

Q30 comments: NO BENEFITS TO PASSENGERS. CONSIDER MORE CROSS BORDER SERVICES POSSIBLY RUN JOINTLY BY SCOTRAIL AND ENGLISH FRANCHISES. FOR INSTANCE GLASGOW TO LIVERPOOL (PLACES WITH STRONG SOCIAL LINKS)



## Rolling stock

31. What alternative strategies or mechanisms could be used to reduce the cost of the provision of rolling stock?

Q31 comments: LONGER FRANCHISE WITH COMMITMENT ~~FOR~~ TO OBTAIN NEW STOCK

32. What facilities should be present on a train and to what extent should these facilities vary according to the route served?

Q32 comments: AT LEAST ONE TOILET PER COACH ON REGIONAL AND INTER CITY ROUTES. AIR CONDITIONING NOT REQUIRED ON LOCAL ROUTES.

## Passengers – information, security and services

33. How should we prioritise investment for mobile phone provision and / or Wi-Fi type high-bandwidth services?

Q33 comments: NO FRANCHISE PROVISION SHOULD BE MADE FOR WI-FI OR INFO-TECHNOLOGY. SHOULD BE FINANCED BY PROVIDER AND USER.

34. How should we balance the need for additional seating capacity and retain the flexibility of a franchisee to offer first-class services if commercially viable?

Q34 comments: IF FRANCHISEE REQUIRES COMMERCIAL Viable FIRST CLASS ADDITIONAL CARRIAGES SHOULD BE PAID FOR ON COMMERCIAL BASIS.

35. What issues and evidence should be considered prior to determining whether or not to ban the consumption of alcohol on trains?

Q35 comments: ONLY ALLOW ALCOHOL IF PURCHASED ON TRAINS. BAN ALCOHOL IF A POLICY CAN BE ENFORCED

36. How can the provision of travel information for passengers be further improved?

Q36 comments: EXISTING SYSTEMS WORK GENERALLY WELL

## Caledonian Sleeper

37. Should we continue to specify sleeper services, or should this be a purely commercial matter for a train operating company?

Q37 comments: SPECIFY SERVICES ONLY IF A WIDER BUSINESS, TOURIST OR SOCIAL CASE CAN BE MADE.

38. Should the Caledonian Sleeper services be contracted for separately from the main ScotRail franchise? Or should it be an option for within the main ScotRail franchise?

Q38 comments: *CONTRACTED SEPERATELY BUT MUST REMAIN WITHIN THE U.K. WIDE TICKETING SYSTEM (GREATS RAIL SETTLEMENT PLAN)*

39. We would be interested in your views in the level and type of service that the Caledonian Sleeper Services should provide. Including:

- What is the appeal of the Caledonian Sleeper Service, and if there were more early and late trains would the appeal of the sleeper services change?
- What is the value of sleeper services to Fort William, Inverness and Aberdeen and are these the correct destinations, for example would Oban provide better connectivity?
- What facilities should the sleeper services provide and would you pay more for better facilities?

Q39 comments: *THE APPEAL WOULD INCREASE WITH BETTER RELIABILITY. OBAN WOULD BE A MORE USED TERMINAL THAN FORT W.*

### Environmental issues

40. What environmental key performance indicators should we consider for inclusion in the franchise agreement or the High Level Output Specification?

Q40 comments: *ONLY INCLUDE THOSE REQUIRED BY LEGISLATION. OTHER ISSUES SHOULD BE BASED ON GOOD HOUSEKEEPING.*