

## Consultation Questions

There is an electronic form with all of the questions, on the website at:  
[www.transportscotland.gov.uk/rail2014](http://www.transportscotland.gov.uk/rail2014)

### Procuring rail passenger services

1. What are the merits of offering the ScotRail franchise as a dual focus franchise and what services should be covered by the economic rail element, and what by the social rail element?

Q1 comments: *One uniform organisation supply the service*

2. What should be the length of the contract for future franchises, and what factors lead you to this view?

Q2 comments: *Not more than 7 years Keep organisation on toes*

3. What risk support mechanism should be reflected within the franchise?

Q3 comments: */*

4. What, if any, profit share mechanism should apply within the franchise?

Q4 comments: */*

5. Under what terms should third parties be involved in the operation of passenger rail services?

Q5 comments: *Open access provides competition ✓ monopolies*

6. What is the best way to structure and incentivise the achievement of outcome measures whilst ensuring value for money?

Q6 comments: */*

7. What level of performance bond and/or parent company guarantees are appropriate?

Q7 comments: */*

8. What sanctions should be used to ensure the franchisee fulfils its franchise commitments?

Q8 comments: *Failure to keep up standards for more than 1 year should lead to loss of franchise*

## Consultation Questions

There is an electronic form with all of the questions, on the website at:  
[www.transportscotland.gov.uk/rail2014](http://www.transportscotland.gov.uk/rail2014)

### Procuring rail passenger services

1. What are the merits of offering the ScotRail franchise as a dual focus franchise and what services should be covered by the economic rail element, and what by the social rail element?

Q1 comments:

2. What should be the length of the contract for future franchises, and what factors lead you to this view?

Q2 comments:

3. What risk support mechanism should be reflected within the franchise?

Q3 comments:

4. What, if any, profit share mechanism should apply within the franchise?

Q4 comments:

5. Under what terms should third parties be involved in the operation of passenger rail services?

Q5 comments:

6. What is the best way to structure and incentivise the achievement of outcome measures whilst ensuring value for money?

Q6 comments:

7. What level of performance bond and/or parent company guarantees are appropriate?

Q7 comments:

8. What sanctions should be used to ensure the franchisee fulfils its franchise commitments?

Q8 comments:

## Achieving reliability, performance and service quality

9. Under the franchise, should we incentivise good performance or only penalise poor performance?

Q9 comments: *Intention beyond franchise bounds should be encouraged & rewarded*

10. Should the performance regime be aligned with actual routes or service groups, or should there be one system for the whole of Scotland?

Q10 comments: *One system*

11. How can we make the performance regime more aligned with passenger issues?

Q11 comments: *Strengthen role of Passenger Focus which should be more representative of passengers*

12. What should the balance be between journey times and performance?

Q12 comments: *Do not allow "Recovery time" to be built in*

13. Is a Service Quality Incentive Regime required? And if so should it cover all aspects of stations and service delivery, or just those being managed through the franchise?

Q13 comments:

14. What other mechanisms could be used for assessing train and station quality?

Q14 comments: *See Q11 answer*

## Scottish train services

15. Can better use be made of existing train capacity, such as increasing the permitted standing time beyond the limit of 10 minutes or increasing the capacity limit? What is an acceptable limit for standing times on rail services?

Q15 comments:

16. Should the number of services making use of interchange stations (both rail to rail and rail to other modes) be increased to reduce the number of direct services? What would be the opportunities and challenges of this?

Q16 comments: *Bad move. Changing trains (especially prolonged connection times) must be avoided.*

*Surprised no reference to restoring connections in Glasgow  
H. It could allow cross city journeys to Edinburgh*

## Scottish stations

24. How should we determine what rail stations are required and where, including whether a station should be closed?

*If stations are not in the "right place" then*  
Q24 comments: *may be care to re-locate but not close.*  
*System of evaluation shown to be outdated. All regional studies*

25. What are the merits or issues that arise from a third party (such as a local authority or local business) being able to propose, promote and fund a station or service?

*The railway should co-operate or be*  
Q25 comments: *penalised - too ready to put up silly reasons for not making improvements*

26. Should only one organisation be responsible for the management and maintenance of stations? If this was the franchisee how should that responsibility be structured in terms of leasing, investment, and issues relating to residual capital value?

*Where other TOC use a station then*  
Q26 comments: *that station should not be run by ScotRail*

27. How can local communities be encouraged to support their local station?

Q27 comments: *franchise holders should be expected to carry out local consultations - ongoing.*

28. What categories of station should be designated and what facilities should be available at each category of station?

*Minimum provision should be shelter & lighting*  
Q28 comments: *Then toilets & manned ticket selling.*

## Cross-border services

29. Should cross-border services continue to go north of Edinburgh? In operating alongside ScotRail services, how do cross-border services benefit passengers and taxpayers? And who should specify these services, the Department of Transport or the Scottish Ministers?

Q29 comments: *Yes. See answers to 16*

30. Or should the cross-border services terminate at Edinburgh Waverley, allowing opportunities for Scottish connections? And if so, what additional benefits would accrue from having an Edinburgh Hub?

*Edinburgh Waverley already a Hub & very crowded*  
Q30 comments: *Make more use of Haymarket for connections from the West Coast*

17. Should Government direct aspects of service provision such as frequency and journey time, or would these be better determined by the franchisee based on customer demand?

Q17 comments:

*Demand a minimum service, & especially ensure 1<sup>st</sup> & last train times & 7 days a week service*

18. What level of contract specification should we use the for the next ScotRail franchise?

Q18 comments:

*Encourage franchise operator to use innovation*

19. How should the contract incentivise the franchisee to be innovative in the provision of services?

Q19 comments:

### Scottish rail fares

20. What should be the rationale for, and purpose of, our fares policy?

Q20 comments:

*Keep it very simple. Universal Rate per mile & no penalties for which day you travel.*

21. What fares should be regulated by government and what should be set on a commercial basis? Do your recommendations change by geographic area (the Strathclyde area example), or by type of journey (for example suburban or intercity)?

Q21 comments:

*All & overall rates*

22. How should we achieve a balance between the taxpayer subsidy and passenger revenue contributions in funding the Scottish rail network? At what rate should fares be increased, and how feasible would it be to apply higher increases to Sections of the network which have recently been enhanced?

Q22 comments:

*Apply pressure to close the gap between European rail costs & those within UK*

23. What should the difference be between peak and off-peak fares? Will this help encourage people to switch to travelling in the off-peak?

Q23 comments:

*Nil*

## Rolling stock

31. What alternative strategies or mechanisms could be used to reduce the cost of the provision of rolling stock?

Q31 comments:

Get rid of DMU like the 150's, of longer journeys  
Underfloor engines are noisy & vibrate

32. What facilities should be present on a train and to what extent should these facilities vary according to the route served?

Q32 comments:

longer journeys need proper carriages & good  
toilets, plus plenty of space for luggage & goods area  
for bikes

## Passengers – information, security and services

33. How should we prioritise investment for mobile phone provision and / or Wi-Fi type high-bandwidth services?

Q33 comments:

Low

34. How should we balance the need for additional seating capacity and retain the flexibility of a franchisee to offer first-class services if commercially viable?

Q34 comments:

The better the standard provided for all passengers  
the less need to create space for special 1<sup>st</sup> class areas

35. What issues and evidence should be considered prior to determining whether or not to ban the consumption of alcohol on trains?

Q35 comments:

Ban, but allow purchase on board when  
food is also bought

36. How can the provision of travel information for passengers be further improved?

Q36 comments:

TH should last a full year. Reduce M to F/Sat/Sun  
variations. Go back to T/T posters with  
station be highlighted. Train all staff & do not allow

## Caledonian Sleeper

37. Should we continue to specify sleeper services, or should this be a purely commercial matter for a train operating company?

Q37 comments:

Yes

38. Should the Caledonian Sleeper services be contracted for separately from the main ScotRail franchise? Or should it be an option for within the main ScotRail franchise?

Q38 comments: *Could be a case for being run as separate franchise  
Need to have an East coast service too*

39. We would be interested in your views in the level and type of service that the Caledonian Sleeper Services should provide. Including:

- What is the appeal of the Caledonian Sleeper Service, and if there were more early and late trains would the appeal of the sleeper services change?
- What is the value of sleeper services to Fort William, Inverness and Aberdeen and are these the correct destinations, for example would Oban provide better connectivity?
- What facilities should the sleeper services provide and would you pay more for better facilities?

Q39 comments: */*

### Environmental issues

40. What environmental key performance indicators should we consider for inclusion in the franchise agreement or the High Level Output Specification?

Q40 comments: *An on going system to improve the service  
& network. - Not stop & go for each franchise  
period.*

*There is nothing in document about freight  
services & in environmental terms there could  
be greater benefits than just for improved  
passenger usage.*

*Why has the Freight Facilities fund from the Scottish  
Government be slashed to just £750k\* yet  
spending on roads is well up*

*\* less than to be spent on cycling!*

*Additonal comment on No 25 We seem to have  
given up on creating an integrated transport system  
largely because of silly competition rules. This is  
fundamental to providing transport to / from stations.  
No bus service from Edinburgh Park to Heriot Watt*