

Cliff Shardalow

## Consultation Questions

The answer boxes will expand as you type.

### Procuring rail passenger services

1. What are the merits of offering the ScotRail franchise as a dual focus franchise and what services should be covered by the economic rail element, and what by the social rail element?

Q1 comments: ALL SOCIAL

2. What should be the length of the contract for future franchises, and what factors lead you to this view?

Q2 comments: 5 YEARS, CAN'T TRUST OPERATOR TO INVEST BECAUSE OF LONGER TERM SO NO VALUE IN LONGER

3. What risk support mechanism should be reflected within the franchise?

Q3 comments: NONE, SIMPLE STRATEGY OF MINIMISING SUBSIDY & PUNITIVE SERVICE PENALTIES FOR FAILURE IS BEST APPROACH

4. What, if any, profit share mechanism should apply within the franchise?

Q4 comments: NONE, AS Q3

5. Under what terms should third parties be involved in the operation of passenger rail services?

Q5 comments: TO IMPROVE INTEGRATION & COMMUNITY INTERACTION

6. What is the best way to structure and incentivise the achievement of outcome measures whilst ensuring value for money?

Q6 comments: AS Q3

7. What level of performance bond and/or parent company guarantees are appropriate?

Q7 comments: SUBSIDY MUST BE SUBJECT TO PERFORMANCE

8. What sanctions should be used to ensure the franchisee fulfils its franchise commitments?

Q8 comments: AS Q3 & Q7

### **Achieving reliability, performance and service quality**

9. Under the franchise, should we incentivise good performance or only penalise poor performance?

Q9 comments: MOSTLY JUST PENALISE POOR BUT WITH SOME LESSER CREDITS FOR GOOD - SPECIFY WHAT WE NEED & ENSURE IT'S MET

10. Should the performance regime be aligned with actual routes or service groups, or should there be one system for the whole of Scotland?

Q10 comments: ONE SYSTEM WITH A FEW FACTORS RELEVANT TO THE REQUIREMENTS E.G. DIFFERENT MEASURES FOR COMMUTER SERVICES & OFF PEAK RURAL

11. How can we make the performance regime more aligned with passenger issues?

Q11 comments: GIVE SEASON TICKET HOLDERS A SEAT! PUBLISH PENALTIES FOR A SPECIFIC FAILURE AT STATIONS

12. What should the balance be between journey times and performance?

Q12 comments: MORE ON PERFORMANCE, ON TIME BETTER THAN 10 MINS QUICKER

13. Is a Service Quality Incentive Regime required? And if so should it cover all aspects of stations and service delivery, or just those being managed through the franchise?

Q13 comments: ALL BUT DON'T MAKE TOO COMPLEX

14. What other mechanisms could be used for assessing train and station quality?

Q14 comments: LOO QUALITY MEASURE, REVENUE PROTECTION MEASURE

### **Scottish train services**

15. Can better use be made of existing train capacity, such as increasing the permitted standing time beyond the limit of 10 minutes or increasing the

capacity limit? What is an acceptable limit for standing times on rail services?

Q15 comments: ADVERTISE CHEAP OFF PEAK FARES BETTER

16. Should the number of services making use of interchange stations (both rail to rail and rail to other modes) be increased to reduce the number of direct services? What would be the opportunities and challenges of this?

Q16 comments: EDINBURGH-INVERNESS/ABERDEEN? ONLY 1 KGX TO INV ANYWAY & GOOD TO KEEP AS FLAGSHIP BUT COULD REPLACE WEST COUNTRY/SOUTHAMPTON TO ABERDEENS WITH MORE EDINBURGH-ABERDEENS.

17. Should Government direct aspects of service provision such as frequency and journey time, or would these be better determined by the franchisee based on customer demand?

Q17 comments: MOSTLY DIRECT THEM

18. What level of contract specification should we use the for the next ScotRail franchise?

Q18 comments: SPECIFY IN DETAIL

19. How should the contract incentivise the franchisee to be innovative in the provision of services?

Q19 comments: LET THEM CONCENTRATE ON PERFORMANCE TO STANDARD AND PRICE

### **Scottish rail fares**

20. What should be the rationale for, and purpose of, our fares policy?

Q20 comments: IT'S GOOD AS IT IS EXCEPT ANNUAL INCREASES TOO HIGH, FREEZE FOR 1 YEAR THEN CPI INCREASES

21. What fares should be regulated by government and what should be set on a commercial basis? Do your recommendations change by geographic area (the Strathclyde area example), or by type of journey (for example suburban or intercity)?

Q21 comments: ALL REGULATED

22. How should we achieve a balance between the taxpayer subsidy and passenger revenue contributions in funding the Scottish rail network? At what rate should fares be increased, and how feasible would it be to apply higher increases to Sections of the network which have recently been enhanced?

Q22 comments: SUBSIDY SINCE PRIVATISATION IS MUCH TOO HIGH BUT OUTSIDE YOUR CONTROL - FARES ARE A BIT TOO HIGH, SO ALL YOU CAN DO IS LOOK FOR COST EFFICIENCY BUT NOT CUTS. KEY IS REDUCING WHAT YOU PAY FRANCHISEES.

23. What should the difference be between peak and off-peak fares? Will this help encourage people to switch to travelling in the off-peak?

Q23 comments: AS NOW BUT ADVERTISE CHEAP OFF PEAK FARES MORE

## **Scottish stations**

24. How should we determine what rail stations are required and where, including whether a station should be closed?

Q24 comments: AS NOW, DON'T CLOSE STATIONS, BUT DO REDUCE COST OF RUNNING LITTLE USED STATIONS

25. What are the merits or issues that arise from a third party (such as a local authority or local business) being able to propose, promote and fund a station or service?

Q25 comments: ALL GOOD BUT IF THERE'S A NEED THEN GOVT SHOULD SPECIFY

26. Should only one organisation be responsible for the management and maintenance of stations? If this was the franchisee how should that responsibility be structured in terms of leasing, investment, and issues relating to residual capital value?

Q26 comments: GOODNESS ONLY KNOWS .. JUST HIGHLIGHTS MADNESS OF PRIVATISATION!

27. How can local communities be encouraged to support their local station?

Q27 comments: USE IT, MAINTAIN IT, RUN KIOSKS AT ...

28. What categories of station should be designated and what facilities should be available at each category of station?

Q28 comments:

## **Cross-border services**

29. Should cross-border services continue to go north of Edinburgh? In operating alongside ScotRail services, how do cross-border services benefit passengers and taxpayers? And who should specify these services, the Department of Transport or the Scottish Ministers?

Q29 comments: SHOULD BE KGX-INV AS NOW, & SLEEPERS AS NOW BUT COULD REDUCE SERVICES TO ABERDEEN IN FAVOUR OF BETTER EDN-ABERDEEN SERVICES

30. Or should the cross-border services terminate at Edinburgh Waverley, allowing opportunities for Scottish connections? And if so, what additional benefits would accrue from having an Edinburgh Hub?

Q30 comments: AS Q29

## **Rolling stock**

31. What alternative strategies or mechanisms could be used to reduce the cost of the provision of rolling stock?

Q31 comments: NATIONALISE BUT YOU CAN'T! GET FOREIGN STATE RAILWAYS INVOLVED TP MARKET TEST

32. What facilities should be present on a train and to what extent should these facilities vary according to the route served?

Q32 comments: GOOD LOOS! TROLLEYS ON ALL SERVICES > 1 HOUR, WIFI ON SAME IF COST EFFECTIVE

## **Passengers – information, security and services**

33. How should we prioritise investment for mobile phone provision and / or Wi-Fi type high-bandwidth services?

Q33 comments: AS Q32 BUT MAYBE CAN'T BE SELF FUNDING? SELL TEA & WIFI TICKETS FOR + £5?

34. How should we balance the need for additional seating capacity and retain the flexibility of a franchisee to offer first-class services if commercially viable?

Q34 comments: CONSIDER HI DENSITY CARRIAGES INCLUDING PULL DOWN SEATS

35. What issues and evidence should be considered prior to determining whether or not to ban the consumption of alcohol on trains?

Q35 comments: RISK.

36. How can the provision of travel information for passengers be further improved?

Q36 comments: DISPLAYS VISIBLE OUTSIDE STATIONS "ALL SERVICES ON TIME"? GIVE REAL REASONS FOR DELAYS

## **Caledonian Sleeper**

37. Should we continue to specify sleeper services, or should this be a purely commercial matter for a train operating company?

Q37 comments: SPECIFY

38. Should the Caledonian Sleeper services be contracted for separately from the main ScotRail franchise? Or should it be an option for within the main ScotRail franchise?

Q38 comments: WITHIN

39. We would be interested in your views in the level and type of service that the Caledonian Sleeper Services should provide. Including:

- What is the appeal of the Caledonian Sleeper Service, and if there were more early and late trains would the appeal of the sleeper services change?
- What is the value of sleeper services to Fort William, Inverness and Aberdeen and are these the correct destinations, for example would Oban provide better connectivity?
- What facilities should the sleeper services provide and would you pay more for better facilities?

Q39 comments: AS NOW PLUS BETTER BREAKFAST - SHOULDN'T COST YOU MUCH & YES I'D PAY MORE. CLASSIC RAILWAY EXPERIENCE. NEEDS NEW STOCK.

### **Environmental issues**

40. What environmental key performance indicators should we consider for inclusion in the franchise agreement or the High Level Output Specification?

Q40 comments: ENERGY EFFICIENT TRAINS & STATIONS