

**Mobility and Access Committee for Scotland (MACS)
Main Committee meeting**

**Minutes of meeting held on Tuesday 22 October 2019
Conference Room 2, Victoria Quay Edinburgh**

Present:

Naghat Ahmed
Linda Bamford, Convener
Audrey Birt
Marsali Craig
Joanne Fairweather
Sheila Fletcher
Susan Fulton
David Hunter
Hussein Patwa – via telephone
Keith Robertson
Hilary Stubbs
Fraser Sutherland
Michael Tornow – via telephone
John Whitfield

Secretariat:

Karen Armstrong – Deputy Sponsor
Douglas Adams – Secretary
Daniel Bulawa – Transport Scotland
Aga Lysak – Secretary

Agenda Item 1 - Welcome and Apologies

1.1 The Convener welcomed all attendees. For voice orientation purposes and for the benefit of those “dialling in” she invited everyone to introduce themselves.

1.2 Linda confirmed that no speakers were attending the meeting but the agenda was busy, with three escalation papers, a discussion on MACS statement regarding ‘Any Disability’ Sign and to agree a statement in response to a request from Office for Disability Issues on ‘Grace’s Sign’.

Agenda Item 2 - Minutes of the previous meeting, matters arising and action points

2.1 The minutes of the previous meeting of 23 July 2019 had been previously agreed electronically. However, for accuracy purposes, it was noted by Keith Robertson that people's titles should be added or omitted in a consistent manner. Therefore it was agreed that in paragraph 3.1 'MSP' title should be added to all listed Ministers.

Action Point 1: Secretariat to amend paragraph 3.1 of the July meeting by adding MSP title to all three ministers.

2.2 Action Points from the July meeting have been completed with the exception to:

- a) AP 1 - Steering Group will discuss the term of 'accessibility' at its meeting on 20 November and the outcome will be shared with MACS. It was agreed, however, that this action could be closed and Karen would feed back to the committee as appropriate.
- b) AP 6 - Go Upstream survey result will be available at the end of October. The action would be closed when the report was distributed to the committee.
- c) AP 7 – It was agreed to be re-opened to find out about Rail Equality Advisory Panels. Karen agreed to discuss the issue with Pauline Meenan

Action Point 2: Karen to discuss with Pauline Meenan Rail Equality Advisory Panels and find out who/what they are.

- d) AP 8 – in order for the Planning and Strategy (P&S) Workstream to review the 2019/2020 Accessible Travel Annual Delivery Plan the Convener wrote to MACS Sponsor, Claire Smith, in September enquiring about available data allowing MACS to measure progress and identify blockages. The Convener asked for response by 19th November to enable the P&S workstream to review work in December/January and feed back to the Accessibility Team by end February 2020.

David reaffirmed that the data should not only be limited to measuring progress of the ATF and the NTS but should also allow measurement of accessibility of transport in the wider context.

AGENDA ITEM 2

Linda confirmed that the letter to the Accessibility Team also asked what can and cannot be measured and Claire, together with Paul Sloan of TS Analytical Team, are in the process of developing options on how to realistically progress this work.

It is anticipated that those options will be presented to the Ministers in November 2019 for his decision. Karen confirmed she was going to meet with Paul and agreed to feed back to MACS. She also confirmed that the Accessibility Team is progressing the 8 priority areas of the Delivery Plan and progress of that work is monitored quarterly in the form of Highlight Reports. She noted, that staff capacity has been recently reduced due to EU Exit work, which has an impact on the work progress.

- e) AP 14 – it was agreed that in order for MACS to set up a bus accessibility sub-group, Sheila should chase up CPT, who will act as a key stakeholder facilitating engagement with operators.

This action was closed and moved to the Bus and Community Transport Workstream.

- f) AP 20 was not yet completed due to the change in ScotRail's Access and Inclusion Manager. MACS agreed that they should continue to highlight a need for a fully accessible facility to allow everybody, including screen reader users, to book Passenger Assist online, together with booking the ticket. Currently, many features of the ScotRail website are inaccessible and the rail workstream aims to take this up with Patrick. ScotRail is undertaking user testing of some aspects of their website and they have invited screen reader users to this. Michael unfortunately is unable to attend this on 30 October. Hussein will attend. Karen offered to raise the issue with Pauline Meenan and feed back to the Committee.

<p>Action Point 3: Karen to discuss with Pauline Meenan from TS Rail Team the accessibility aspect of the online booking facility for Passenger Assist.</p>
--

- a) AP 21 – the report of the success measures for the “Making Connections” project will be available at the end of October at which time this action will be closed.

AGENDA ITEM 2

- b) AP 22 was about of the lack of accessible spaces and Braille signs on buttons in the first class carriages on ScotRail trains. Hussein confirmed that the delay was caused by the change of the Access and Inclusion Manager – Patrick had recently returned to ScotRail and his in-depth understanding of the roles and regulations is anticipated to speed the progress of this action point. In discussion members noted that the lack of provision of accessible spaces applied to other providers as well as ScotRail.

Members agreed that although this was an equality issue it would be neither practical nor feasible to push for a retrofitting of current fleet. Instead the Rail Workstream should write to all Train Operating Companies (TOCs) to make them aware of the need for accessible design of all new stock.

Action Point 4: The Rail Workstream to write to all Train Operating Companies requesting them to make every effort to ensure that all new train stocks to be introduced are fully accessible and include Braille signs on all buttons and accessible wheelchair space and toilet in the first class.

- c) It was noted that AP11 was completed – Traveline had confirmed on 14 October that **“At the moment it is not possible to offer a guaranteed fully-accessible public transport journey to users of the journey planner as we do not have enough data on stop and station accessibility”**

MACS members expressed their dissatisfaction that the app does not cater for the needs of disabled people. Members agreed that MACS should write to Traveline to express their disappointment and ask for a potential timescale for a review.

Susan also suggested that the lack of accessible options may be a breach of the Equality Act 2010 and advice should be sought from the Equality and Human Rights Commission (EHRC).

Sheila volunteered to raise this issue during her meeting with the EHRC on Friday 25 October 2019.

Action Point 5: MACS to write to Traveline expressing its disappointment that the travel journey mobile app is not accessible and does not cater for the needs of disabled people. The letter also to enquire about potential timescale for review.

Note: Hussein Patwa agreed to progress this action point.

- d) Keith noted that although AP 23 was completed, more work to ensure all LEV charging point are fully accessible is still required to be undertaken by the Roads, Infrastructure and Active Travel workstream. Keith will get back in touch with Graeme McQuaker to push for standards before the good practice guide is rewritten.

Agenda Item 3 – Convener’s update

3.1 The Convener explained that the new, larger format of the report stems from presenting the Committee’s work based on the high level recommendations, and is produced in coproduction with all leads to holistically present all cross-cutting issues all workstreams deal with and how these link into the high level recommendations.

3.2 Linda then introduced and welcomed Daniel Bulawa, a new member of the Accessibility Team, who replaced Karl Zaczek.

3.3 She then proceeded to provide an update on all consultations responses Leads are working on:

- a) NTS consultation – thanks to David for coordination and all members who contributed.
- b) National Islands Plan – being finalised by Hilary. It was agreed that the response should be discussed with Mr Wheelhouse MSP and Convener asked Secretariat to schedule a meeting with him. Members agreed that this meeting would also provide the opportunity to discuss with Mr Wheelhouse the findings from the Transport to Health event.

Action Point 6: Aga to schedule a meeting with Mr Wheelhouse MSP, ideally for 16 January 2020.

- c) Hussein and Marsali are preparing a response to DfT’s accessibility dispensation request relating to services operated by ScotRail on the Fife Loop.
- d) Subway response – Hussein confirmed that this submission should be easier than anticipated as it is reasonable for dispensation to be applied since rolling stock is being updated. He made a point that MACS approach should focus on advocating for enhancing customer service during the refurbishment.

3.4 Four Nation Meeting – Linda confirmed that the first meeting was very successful and the next one is scheduled to take place in Belfast on 10 March 2020.

3.5 Linda acknowledged that her ambition is to streamline MACS recommendations down to 5 or 6 for the next reporting period (2020/21) and introduce one overarching workplan for the entire committee, which would span across all workstreams.

She confirmed that she intended to discuss her proposed plans with the P&S Workstream at the November Leads meeting (P&S WS have been cited on the draft and her initial thoughts) and after this her intention was to bring the proposals to the full Committee in Jan 2020.

She confirmed that some of the content and rationale in these proposals were picked up through conversations and “listening in” to group discussions at the team building/scoping day on 11 September 2019, so hopefully the committee would recognise some of what is being proposed for 2020 and beyond.

She stated that her thoughts are that the session to discuss this and agree the work plans and recommendations for next year will form the afternoon session of the Jan 2020 Committee meeting and be **closed to MACS members only**.

It is proposed that MACS move to 1 overarching work-plan, with the committee structure/areas of engagement by work-streams underlying this, supported by 5-6 high level recommendations and complemented by our strategic remits giving 3 layers of governance checks and balances around our annual work programme.

As this is the plan **no** WSL updates or escalation papers will be tabled at the Jan 2020 meeting (unless urgent) to allow more time to go through the plans and gain agreements.

Members agreed for her to present her proposal to Leads at their November 2019 meeting and discuss the outcome with all members at the January 2020 MACS meeting.

3.6 March Development Day (DD) is planned to be themed around Transport to Health and collaborative working to ensure good practice is spread. It was agreed that Scottish Ambulance Service should be invited to discuss their eligibility criteria for transport, escort criteria, booking processes and other issues that arose from the Transport to Health roundtable.

AGENDA ITEM 2

It was also suggested that Getting Better Together (GBT), a community-based initiative that aims to improve the health and wellbeing of the local community in North Lanarkshire could also be invited.

It was agreed that this could be discussed by MACS Transport to Health sub group after the roundtable and wider discussions.

Action Point 7: Secretariat to invite Scottish Ambulance Service to the March Development Day.

3.7 It was agreed that Karen would explore with EHRC, during their meeting on Thursday 24 October, if they would also wish to be invited to the MACS DD or if that would be too early to engage at this stage.

This invite was aimed at the committee being updated on their work around Strategic Goal 1, Priority Aim 2 “Public Transport supports the economic and social inclusion of disabled people and older people”.

Action Point 8: Karen to scope with EHRC at their meeting on Thursday 24 October 2019 if it would be beneficial to engage with them on the subject of transport to health issue and update on their Strategic Goal 1, Priority Aim 2.

3.8 Scottish Law Commission (SLC) issued Autonomous Vehicle consultation. It was confirmed that Keith and Sheila are working on the response and this would be shared with the committee.

3.9 David confirmed that when the papers for the Transport to Health roundtable were circulated he would send a copy of the briefing pack to Audit Scotland for information in compliance with a previous request.

3.10 Hilary asked Aga to check if Claire or Secretariat received contact details for CEO of the Canals and Rivers Trust from Chris Wilcock.

Action Point 9: Aga to check whether Chris Wilcock sent contact details for CEO of the Canals and Rivers Trust.

Agenda Item 4 - Sponsor Team update

4.1 Karen Armstrong gave an overview on the work currently being undertaken by the Sponsor Team on the eight priority areas of the Framework:

- a) Taxis and Clear Pathways are progressing as planned.

In relation to the Sponsor Team Update Paper on Taxis: “At this stage Transport Scotland do not propose a highly prescriptive guidance document, because local situations will differ across the country. Instead it proposes to develop guidance for licensing authorities that underlines the importance of regular policy review, informed by high-quality Equality Impact Assessments and quality engagement. **Comments from the Committee on this approach, are welcomed**”.

The Convener asked if it would be possible to send these proposals to Sheila to allow MACS to formally respond, including a deadline for response.

Action Point 10: Secretariat to ask taxi licensing team to share with MACS Bus, Taxis and CT Workstream proposed guidance for licensing authorities and ask for the deadline for response.

- b) Passenger Assist – progress as scheduled. Introduction of the one hour notice is anticipated by 2021. MACS confirmed that their push would remain for spontaneous travel.
- c) Thistle Assistance – is progressing well with SEStran presenting at the Steering Group meeting on 20 November.
- d) Hate Crime – the progress is slower than anticipated. Currently work is focusing on getting a buy-in from Police Scotland, who could assist in production of raising awareness video. Karen is working jointly on this with DES.
- e) Aviation – progress as scheduled.
- f) Bus – will be taken over by Daniel and Sheila noted she would be willing to be closely involved.
- g) Signs, information and wayfinding –on-going. The Convener signposted the Accessibility Team to IMTACs (Inclusive Mobility Transport Advisory Committee) report on pavement cafes, which may be a useful tool and reference point.

4.2 Transport Bill – passed Stage 3 and no further amendments are expected.

4.3 Programme for Government – Karen confirmed that £500 million was allocated for bus industry but the initial phase of the work will be exploratory with little spending anticipated.

AGENDA ITEM 2

4.4 Team capacity – Karen confirmed that Douglas had gained promotion and is leaving the team on Friday 25 October 2019. Although Daniel joined the team last month, the team's capacity is hugely reduced due to EU exit work, with Robert and Mark working on shifts in the Transport EU Exit Resilience Hub.

4.5 At the Strategic TS Directors meeting on 8 November Karen and Claire will present and talk about Accessibility, its challenges and potential solutions to make Directors aware of the need to embed accessibility in everything the Agency does. Karen would appreciate input from some members and confirmed she would contact individuals by email.

4.6 Claire is keen to follow up the conversation on pushing for a Minister for Disabled People. In discussion members agreed that the Minister's remit should focus not only on disability but on accessibility for all. Karen explained that across all ministerial portfolios many areas touch on inclusion and accessibility. They all have small pots of funding available and it would be beneficial not only to explore more opportunities for cross-cutting spending in order to progress the accessibility agenda but also ensure that officials are working together and the silo working approach is fully broken. Transport should be seen more as enabler and Karen and Claire will try to present this to Directors.

MACS confirmed their support for this work.

4.7 Claire was at the World Road Congress in Abu Dhabi, which was a successful event. She participated in an international panel and as a result is now exploring the possibility of organising a follow-up event in Edinburgh in February/March 2020. MACS Convener had accepted an invite from Claire to participate and represent MACS.

4.8 Sheila expressed her concerns about the Community Transport short distance exemption (10 miles) as it jeopardises the feasibility of continuation for some operators, especially in rural areas. MACS will keep a watching brief.

4.9 Karen confirmed that NTS consultation is closing this week and the feedback received so far is largely positives. It is not, however, clear where focus should be: Paths for All – more health and wellbeing focus, or rural – with focus on more roads.

AGENDA ITEM 2

4.10 Susan updated the committee that she was asked to represent her Local Authority, Head of Planning, on the Inclusive Design Working Group.

4.11 David made an observation that Karen's report on the progress on all eight priorities of the Delivery Plan does not tally up with the Sponsor Team Update paper, which states that there is nothing to report on taxis and aviation.

Aga explained that the Sponsor Team Update Paper is created based on the contribution received from colleagues from various policy areas. She acknowledged that relationship with policy colleagues varies from very good and efficient to hardly existing.

She also suggested that the format of the paper could be revised, with Accessibility Team taking more ownership of it and incorporating update on the Framework priority areas into it.

Action Point 11: Accessibility Team to revise the format of the Sponsor Team Update papers to ensure it is fit for purpose and includes updates on the eight priority areas of the Delivery Plan.

4.12 It was confirmed that Social Security officials, who contributed to the paper will not be attending the Motability event on 5 November due to conflict of interest.

4.13 Naghat asked how a blue badge may cause harm, as stated within the update:

"The research identified that in some instances issuing a Blue Badge may not be in someone's best interests and may cause harm. A recommendation was made to legislate to allow refusals on this basis, but this was not done. Therefore badges may be issued even though it is not in someone's best interests".

Karen will ask Robert to provide an answer.

Action Point 12: Karen to ask Robert to explain how a Blue Badge could cause harm to people.

Agenda Item 5 – Escalation Papers

Agenda Item 5a - Transport to Health – Linda Bamford

5.1 Convener confirmed that the main aim of the event on 21 November is to discuss the issues/findings from MACS evidence gathering and research and also to discuss the potential to share best practice.

She thanked the sub-group for all their work on evidence gathering and preparing papers. She confirmed that the papers had been circulated to all MACS members for information only, not to propose any changes as they had already agreed to the sub group working autonomously to the full committee (under the agreed remit) given the time constraints of the 6 point action plan.

Members agreed with the agenda, papers and subgroup's 4 recommendations within the escalation paper.

5.2 Linda confirmed that the event will be facilitated by an external facilitator and report will be prepared in-house.

She confirmed that she had prepared a draft outline for the report to give the report writers a steer on what MACS wanted to capture. She also explained that she analysed feedback from external engagements, surveys and poll returns and constructed initial draft recommendations from this to ensure these voices were not lost as many of these people would not be at the roundtable but had taken time to comment and suggest improvements. This audience was just shy of 1,000 responses and it would be remiss for the report and recommendation not to allow their voices to be heard.

She established a deadline for report finalisation before Christmas, in time for the Ministerial meetings on 16 January.

Agenda Item 5b – Chronic Pain – Hussein Patwa

5.3 In his paper Hussein advocated for raising awareness amongst stakeholders that pain has psychological and behavioural impact on people's wellbeing. He argued that chronic pain should not be disregarded as a factor when travel is considered and recommended that it should be taken into account and cited when responding to relevant consultations and calls for evidence.

5.4 Members agreed that chronic pain, including that undiagnosed, has a massive impact on people's physical and mental wellbeing and has an impact on their ability to travel.

AGENDA ITEM 2

In discussion it was agreed that MACS should promote digital services and technology solutions allowing those, who are unable to travel, to participate without a need to travel. However, it was noted, that a balance needs to be struck to ensure that accessible travel catering for those in pain is still available to avoid danger of increasing social isolation.

Members agreed that alternative options should always be available, to allow people make informative choices.

Agenda Item 5c – Online vs offline – Hussein Patwa

5.5 In his second paper Hussein discussed lack of equity between online and offline channels and advocated that MACS should raise awareness of the issue and object the Government's push for digitalisation and online-only solutions. Moving online is often incentivised, leaving those not connected disadvantaged (purchasing tickets is one of several examples).

5.6 Members agreed that protecting those not digitally connected should be embedded in the Committee's work programmes, especially in light of the Brexit and EU protection of disabled people jeopardised. MACS agreed that it needs to push to ensure that accessibility is at the heart of what SG does.

5.7 Sheila pointed out that other protected characteristics are also often very disadvantaged, including elderly and low-income families. Linda confirmed that the Poverty and Inequality Commission is working on transport affordability.

5.8 David highlighted that many disabled people actually benefit from online facilities and prefer digital solutions to manual and those off-line. He emphasised that it is important to strike the balance right and not go too far in either direction. It was agreed that any changes should be a subject to EqlA.

5.9 Sheila was suggested as a Non-Digital MACS champion.

Agenda item 6a – Update from Hilary Stubbs on the Ferries and Aviation Workstream

AGENDA ITEM 2

6.1 Hilary updated the committee on her ongoing work on preparing MACS response to the National Island Plan, which will include reference to difficult ferry situation amongst other issues.

6.2 Hilary also confirmed that she had now arranged a visit to Prestwick Airport.

6.3 Following on from the August Development Day, Hilary facilitated an engagement between Helen Dolphin and Calmac Ferries regarding the possibility of installing QUANTUM/Q'Straint system on vessels to ensure safety of wheelchair users.

She confirmed that MACS has a very good working relationship with Calmac Ferries and acknowledged that it is impossible to engage and maintain contacts with all ferry companies due to lack of resources and capacity.

6.4 Hilary confirmed that the Ferry Access Fund has launched call for responses. Audrey and Hillary will sift the applications.

6.5 Hilary was asked to comment on disability assessment for CalMmac ferry to Dumbarton. It was noted that the toolkit she has produced for Ferries was being used by the UK Government, Department for Transport as the launch the latest Toolkit for maritime transport passenger rights. It was noted that it had been largely based upon the success of the Mobility and Access Committee for Scotland (MACS) toolkit on improving accessibility at ferry terminals.

The Committee and Sponsor Team congratulated Hilary on this success.

6.6 On Aviation, the workstream is working hard to engage with Scottish airports (especially Inverness) to ensure they all meet the 'Very Good' standard of CAA rating. Hilary briefly summarised the finding of a recent survey conducted via NetFlight, which again showed the improved performance rating of Scottish Airports.

Agenda item 6b – Update from David Hunter on the Planning and Strategy Workstream

6.7 David repeated his thanks to those, who contributed to the NTS response. MACS position highlighted the importance of equality as the first of the four principles, which should be used as leverage to progress accessibility of transport to all.

He also noted that a Delivery Board was being established, with responsibility for overseeing implementation of the National Transport Strategy. MACS recommended that an 'access and inclusion champion' should be represented on the Board to ensure that the good principles were translated into action.

6.8 David confirmed that the next Motability meeting will take place on 5 November 2019 and the papers had already been circulated. He noted that the most significant developments since the March event were:

- a) Motability Operations made another donation to the Motability Charity, which can be used as the charity sees fit. This demonstrates that Motability generate more profit than necessary. Over all the donations were in excess of £1 billion.
- b) Scottish Government Social Security officials announced last month that they are going to set-up a Scottish Motability scheme (Accessible Vehicle and Equipment Scheme), following devolution of social security benefits to Scotland. It is going to be accreditation-based, however at this stage no detailed information is yet available. Scottish Government is currently seeking notes of interest from organisations that can provide services meeting the established criteria.
- c) A new Chief Executive was appointed, Barry Le Grys, replacing Paul Atkinson.

6.9 Members agreed that Motability should remain on MACS agenda and the committee should advocate for a better engagement with Scottish users to enhance customers' satisfaction.

6.10 Members expressed their concerns about the continuity of the scheme, the impact of the switch towards the green energy cars (as the electric cars are smaller and pose difficulties for guide dogs owners or carrying mobility equipment) and the future of Scottish share of the Motability assets. David confirmed that no changes are anticipated during the changeover period.

Agenda item 6c – Update from Sheila Fletcher on the Bus and Community Transport Workstream

6.11 The Bus and Community Transport Workstream has been busy with work around NTS, participating in the Strategic Transport Project Review and engagements at local level ensuring accessibility is at the core of all decisions undertaken.

AGENDA ITEM 2

6.12 Sheila expressed her concerns about the lack of accessibility of the Motability as a Service (MaaS). She noted that the concept of MaaS idea is more specific for urban areas and not really feasible in rural regions, where there is no suitable infrastructure in place to allow walking, wheeling and cycling. Members agreed that MACS should continue to highlight accessibility needs.

6.13 Sheila met with CTA in Scotland to discuss the response they have received from their members to the Transport to Health Questionnaire. A summary of the responses has been written and will be used as background to the Transport to Health project.

6.14 Sheila is also in the process of collating local authorities responses to the ATCO (Association of Transport Coordinating Officers) questionnaire on the Transport to Health . The summary will be presented at the event on 21 November.

6.15 On Friday 25 October 2019 Sheila will chair EHRC meeting in Inverness, where she will use Joanne's report on accessibility of buses and coaches in her presentation to raise accessibility of public transport issues.

6.16 Sheila mentioned the document received from ORR, which included legal advice they had sought on rail replacement services. The legal advice is that buses and coaches used on rail replacement journeys should conform to PSVAR.

Agenda item 6d – Update from Hussein Patwa and Marsali Craig on the Rail Workstream

6.17 Marsali advised MACS had been asked to provide accessibility advise to Caledonian Sleeper, however she clarified that MACS role is to advise Ministers and not individual train operating companies.

6.18 Fraser and Hussein worked together on the Glasgow subway request for dispensation with the agreement that as SPT is introducing new specialist rolling stock in the immediate future a current dispensation is reasonable. Hussein would add to our response the need for better passenger assist in the underground. ScotRail have also applied for dispensation for the Fife Circle Line with the main advice given that it would be unreasonable to ask for dispensation in this instance given the length of lead-in time.

AGENDA ITEM 2

6.19 Susan plans to visit the Kilmarnock depot and will visit ScotRail to discuss the new design of the carriages allowing more bike storage.

6.20 Linda suggested that the work on the review of the Disabled People's Protection Policy (DPPP) should also include a link to the Hate Crime Charter and Hussein offered to feed that back to ORR.

Action Point 13: Hussein to suggest to ORR that their DPPP policy should include a link to the Hate Crime Charter.

6.21 It was noted that Hussein's and Michael's comments provided to ScotRail in May and June were taken on board and triggered actions on ScotRail side.

6.22 Fraser asked for a copy of the Fife Circle Dispensation consultation and it was agreed that the Rail Leads will circulate the document to all workstream members.

Action Point 14: Hussein/Marsali to circulate the Fife Cycle Dispensation consultation to Rail workstream members.

Agenda item 6e – Update from Keith Robertson on the Roads, Infrastructure and Active Travel Workstream

6.23 MACS members acknowledged the report from Fraser on pavement parking and expressed their disappointment with the provision of 20 minutes parking exemption for loading and unloading.

6.24 Keith confirmed that work is ongoing to clarify whether the blue badge exemption from LEZ charges could be implemented by local authorities and how the enforcement process would work.

6.25 Keith confirmed that, to his knowledge, the parking levy would not provide exception for Blue badge holders.

6.26 Keith confirmed that he is continuing to work with DfT on tactile surfaces and has agreed with Graham McQuaker that there is no need for both of them attend the same meetings and instead they would rotate attendance.

6.27 Keith clarified that Inclusive Street design will not be completed by March 2020 and the design principles will be finalised in the next financial year.

6.28 Discussion paper on 'Any Disability' and 'Grace's sign':

- a) In discussion MACS members agreed that although they welcome work on alternative design to reflect needs of people with a variety of disabilities, including non-visible conditions, the proposed signs are not satisfactory, accessible and inclusive.

MACS does not support either of the signs.

MACS recommends that any potential new design should be coproduced with disabled people and be heavily supported by a PR campaign to raise people's awareness and understanding.

It was also stated that signage should follow universally recognised signs and those within the British standards.

- b) MACS requested the Secretariat to send a letter to SEStran, Office for Disability Issues and Martin Whitfield MP advising them of its position.

Action Point 15: Secretariat to send a letter to SEStran, Office for Disability Issues and Martin Whitfield MP advising them MACS does not support either the 'Any Disability' not 'Grace's Sign'.

- c) Karen confirmed that the 'Any Disability' sign is a free resource available for all to use, however MACS expressed their concerns that too many different signs available will inevitably contribute to disabled's people confusion and increased anxiety.

Agenda Item 7 – Any Other Business (AOB)

7.1 Hilary asked members to be mindful when replying to emails. She invited members to reply to sender only and use the 'Reply to all' function only when there is a need for all members to be kept informed.

7.2 Members thanked Douglas for the support he had offered the Committee over the previous 14 months and wished him well in his promotion.

AGENDA ITEM 2

Action Points from the meeting held on 23 July 2019

No.	Ref	Action	Update
6	4.5.1	Karen Armstrong to obtain and share with MACS the Go Upstream survey result.	Complete, available here ¹
7	4.5.2	Secretariat to contact the TS Rail Team and find out what and who Rail Equality Advisory Panels are.	Karen will meet Pauline Meenan from the Rail Team and report back – in progress
8	4.5.3	Planning and Strategy Workstream to review the Accessible Travel Annual Delivery Plan 2019/2020 between December 2019 and February 2020.	In progress. Data is being collected and Paul Sloan of Analytical Team is liaising with David and Linda. An options paper was sent to Mr Matheson before Christmas and an update on progress of the Annual Delivery plan is provided to MACS quarterly.
20	6.22	Hussein to ask Marsali to liaise with ScotRail Accessibility Manager to seek an update on the online facility to book Passenger Assist.	Karen will also raise this issue with Pauline Meenan, TS Rail Team – in progress
21	6.23	Karen Armstrong to obtain a copy of the success measures for the “Making Connections” project and circulate this document to the Committee.	Complete – please see Go Upstream Connection, which is the same report.

¹ https://drive.google.com/file/d/1UEVuY38nTYLQyXTW5JYpoAOijehwHNI_/view?usp=sharing

AGENDA ITEM 2


22	6.24	Marsali Craig to discuss with Andrew Marshall-Roberts the lack of wheelchair space in First Class carriages and no braille on buttons on the latest trains introduced into service.	Karen to discuss this also with Pauline Meehan – in progress
----	------	---	--

AGENDA ITEM 2

Action points for the meeting held on 23 October 2019

No.	Ref	Action	Update
1	2.1	Secretariat to amend paragraph 3.1 of the July meeting by adding MSP title to all three ministers.	Complete
2	2.2.c	Karen to discuss with Pauline Meenan Equality Advisory Panels and find out who/what they are.	In progress
3	2.2.f	Karen to discuss with Pauline Meenan from TS Rail Team the lack of online booking facility for Passenger Assist.	In progress
4	2.2.h	The Rail Workstream (W/S) to write to all Train Operating Companies requesting them to make every effort to ensure that all new train stocks to be introduced are fully accessible and include Braille signs on all buttons and accessible wheelchair space and toilet in the first class.	Ongoing. The Rail W/S are considering how best to take this forward. Given the Overarching Work Plan set out in the Change Theory Driver Map it might be best to we liaise with Transport Scotland or the Director of Rail rather than TOCs. The issues raised are included in the Recommendations set out in the <i>Railway for Everyone</i> draft report and once these are confirmed and published the W/S will want to discuss how to include them in approaching TS or DoR to use future franchising/ contract discussions to make sure these Recommendations are fully taken on board by all TOCs.
5	2.2.i	MACS to write to Traveline expressing its disappointment that the travel journey mobile app is not accessible and does not cater for the needs of disabled people. The letter also to	Complete, awaiting response

AGENDA ITEM 2

		enquire about potential timescale for review. Note: Hussein Patwa agreed to progress this action point.	
6	3.3.b	Aga to schedule a meeting with Mr Wheelhouse MSP, ideally for 16 January 2020.	Complete. Scheduled for 23 Jan 2020.
7	3.6	Secretariat to invite Scottish Ambulance Service to the March Development Day.	In progress
8	3.7	Karen to scope with EHRC at their meeting on Thursday 24 October 2019 if it would be beneficial to engage with them on the subject of transport to health issue and update on their Strategic Goal 1, Priority Aim 2.	In progress
9	3.10	Aga to check whether Chris Wilcock sent contact details for CEO of the Canals and Rivers Trust.	Complete
10	4.1.a	Secretariat to ask taxi licensing team to share with MACS Bus, Taxis and CT Workstream proposed guidance for licensing authorities and ask for the deadline for response.	In progress – the proposed guidance is not yet complete.
11	4.11	Accessibility Team to revise the format of the Sponsor Team Update papers to ensure it is fit for purpose and includes updates on the eight priority areas of the Delivery Plan.	Complete
12	4.13	Karen to ask Robert to explain how a Blue Badge could cause harm to people.	Complete  How a BB could harm (002).docx
13	6.20	Hussein to suggest to ORR that their DPPP policy should include a link to the Hate Crime Charter.	Complete
14	6.22	Hussein/Marsali to circulate the Fife Circle Dispensation consultation to Rail workstream members.	Complete
15	6.28b	Secretariat to send a letter to SEStran, Office for Disability Issues and Martin Whitfield MP advising them MACS does not support either the 'Any Disability' not 'Grace's Sign'.	Complete

AGENDA ITEM 2