

## **Expert Ferry Group**

### **Report to Meeting of 10 March 2016**

#### **Transport Integration**

##### **Purpose of Report**

To facilitate a discussion at the EFG on how well multi modal transport integration works at ferry terminals. This is set in the context of an understanding that with limited resources (physically in terms of vessels / assets to be timetabled) and different needs from service users the majority of ferry passengers might at times be best served by a timetable that does not integrate with other modes. This does not absolve operators from a duty to try hard to offer good integration where they can.

##### **National Transport Strategy**

The National Transport Strategy (NTS) sets the long term vision for our transport policies. It was first published in 2006 after the Scottish Government consulted the public, interested individuals and a wide range of organisations on their views for the future of transport in Scotland. The NTS was refreshed in 2015 and recommended a fuller, collaborative review of the NTS in the next Scottish Parliamentary term.

The NTS introduced three key strategic outcomes, which are:

- Improved journey times and connections between our cities and towns and our global markets to tackle congestion and lack of integration and connections in transport
- Reduced emissions to tackle climate change, air quality, health improvement
- Improved quality, accessibility and affordability of transport, to give choice of public transport, better quality services and value for money, or alternative to car

Good quality public transport systems that integrate well with one another ensuring seamless journeys with the minimum of barriers be that in relation to fares and smart ticketing; information to the traveller and the quality of infrastructure at interchanges all play a role in optimising the journey experience and it takes a bit of everything to make a journey truly integrated. However, this utopia can fall down where real world challenges are factored in not least where integration needs to balance the very different and often competing interests of different service users.

##### **Integration of Ferries with other Modes**

Ferry service operators have a particular challenge in balancing the needs of their diverse customer base. They often have to balance the needs of sectors with very different priorities in terms of sailing time for example freight customers will prioritise access to market of the goods they carry – often favouring early departures that other sectors such as tourism would consider anti social / unattractive for that market. Local service users will want the first departure to be from the island side while tourism might favour a first departure from the mainland side.

The easiest way of serving all markets segments very well is by offering high frequency that ensures relatively seamless connections with other travel modes as this will also serve those customers with their own onward travel means. In the event that integration works well due to frequency the other tools needed to make transport truly integrated come in to play to add further value including a good interchange experience and the ability to travel on Oyster style smart ticketing. The size of the market, length of routes and in some cases sharing of vessels between more than one route means that the option of increasing frequency of sailings or onward connections is not always available.

If frequency of service can offer a way of serving all user needs and improve integration the counter is that where service frequency is limited on a route, for example a single daily service, greater emphasis must be paid to the integration needs of the non motorised user.

## **Routes**

The following sections of the report pick out the current (based on Summer 2016 timetables) to understand how well services integrate. For a more detailed analysis of Modal Integration for Ferry Services across Scotland HITRANS had a public transport consultant produce the Ferry Connections Study. This report was based on analysis undertaken in 2010. The full summary report can be accessed on the HITRANS website at - [http://www.hitrans.org.uk/Documents/Ferry\\_Connections\\_Study\\_Part\\_1.pdf/m=1](http://www.hitrans.org.uk/Documents/Ferry_Connections_Study_Part_1.pdf/m=1)

Integration is not limited to timetables as the key driver and in the case of connections at Aberdeen for Shetland the main focus is narrative in the case studies listed below.

### **Ardrossan to Brodick**

A good example of providers working together to improve integration was the response of ScotRail to requests made through the Clyde Ferry User Group for more Glasgow – Ardrossan trains to extend to Ardrossan Harbour rather than the previous practice of terminating at Ardrossan Town. This obvious solution was duly delivered offering a much improved journey for foot passengers travelling to and from Arran.

The Ardrossan – Brodick Summer 2016 timetable is reproduced below from [www.calmac.co.uk](http://www.calmac.co.uk) and this shows how well connected this service is. This recognises the very high volume of foot passengers on the route and the continued popularity of Arran as a day trip / short stay option from the central belt.

# ARRAN



Check-in closes - vehicles 30 minutes,  
passengers 10 minutes prior to departure

## ARDROSSAN - BRODICK

Table 5

TEXT  
CODE 05



DAY	Glasgow Central Depart	Ardrossan Harbour Arrive	Ardrossan Depart	Brodick Arrive	Brodick Depart	Ardrossan Arrive	Ardrossan Harbour Depart	Glasgow Central Arrive
MON- WED	-	-	0700	0755	0700 A	0755 A	0819	0911
	0645	0736	0820 A	0915 A	0820	0915	0936	1022
	0834	0920	0945	1040	0945 A	1040 A	1136	1222
	0918	1002	1105 A	1200 A	1105	1200	1236	1322
	1118	1205	1230	1325	1230 A	1325 A	1336	1422
	1218	1304	1350 A	1445 A	1355	1450	1536	1621
	1418	1504	1520	1615	1515 A	1610 A	1636	1722
	1518	1603	1640 A	1735 A	1640	1735	1807	1851
	1650	1736	1800	1855	1800 A	1855 A	1931	2024
THU	1818	1903	1920 A	2015 A	1920	2015	2031	2125
	-	-	0700	0755	0700 A	0755 A	0819	0911
	0645	0736	0820 A	0915 A	0820	0915	0936	1022
	0834	0920	0945	1040	0945 A	1040 A	1136	1222
	0918	1002	1105 A	1200 A	1105	1200	1236	1322
	1118	1205	1230	1325	1230 A	1325 A	1336	1422
	1218	1304	1350 A	1445 A	1355	1450	1536	1621
	1418	1504	1520	1615	1515 A	1610 A	1636	1722
	-	-	-	-	1640	1735	1807	1851
FRI	1650	1736	1800	1855	1920	2015	2031	2125
	-	-	0700	0755	0820	0915	0936	1022
	0834	0920	0945	1040	-	-	-	-
	0918	1002	1105 A	1200 A	1105	1200	1236	1322
	1118	1205	1230	1325	1230 A	1325 A	1336	1422
	1218	1304	1350 A	1445 A	1355	1450	1536	1621
	1418	1504	1520	1615	1515 A	1610 A	1636	1722
	-	-	-	-	1640	1735	1807	1851
	1650	1736	1800	1855	1920	2015	2031	2125
SAT	1915	2006	2030	2125	2140	2235	-	-
	-	-	0700	0755	0820	0915	0936	1022
	0834	0920	0945	1040	0945 A	1040 A	1136	1222
	0918	1002	1105 A	1200 A	1105	1200	1236	1322
	1118	1205	1230	1325	1230 A	1325 A	1336	1422
	1218	1304	1350 A	1445 A	1355	1450	1536	1621
	1418	1504	1520	1615	1515 A	1610 A	1636	1722
	1518	1603	1640 A	1735 A	1640	1735	1807	1851
	1650	1736	1800	1855	1800 A	1855 A	1931	2023
SUN	-	-	-	-	1920	2015	2031	2125
	2015	2108	2200 A	2255 A	-	-	-	-
	-	-	-	-	0905 A	1000 A	-	-
	0840	0928	0945	1040	1105	1200	1235	1318
	-	-	1105 A	1200 A	1230 A	1325 A	-	-
	1115	1200	1230	1325	1355	1450	1502	1546
	1405	1450	1520	1615	1640	1735	1800	1844
	1655	1740	1800	1855	1920	2015	2031	2114
	-	-	2000 A	2055 A	-	-	-	-

### CODE

A	Additional sailings from 28 April to 26 September
---	---

## Lochboisdale to Mallaig

The Lochboisdale to Mallaig service is a new service that will feature in the Summer timetable this year after a long hiatus as a Summer service. The service will operate as a single daily rotation with the base for the MV Lord of the Isles being Lochboisdale. The timetable will be more focussed on the needs of the Uists that the previous service that operated 2 days per week in the evening / late night until Summer 2000.

The Summer 2016 service follows a long campaign from the South Uist community for a link to Mallaig and the earlier introduction of a Winter pilot service in 2014/15. The Summer 2016 timetable was shared with the Ferry User Group Membership in November 2015 and one of the key points highlighted in the subsequent consultation exercise that HITRANS facilitated was that there would be no connection with the available rail connections to/from Glasgow. A timetable adjustment of an earlier departure from Lochboisdale (Mon to Sun) by 30 minutes to 0630 and from Mallaig by 25 minutes to 1755 (Mon – Sat) would have allowed a rail connection to be achieved. The only connection achieved in the current timetable is from the 1334 train arriving in Mallaig to catch the 1500 Sunday only sailing to Lochboisdale. The Ferry User Group consultation asked that the connection issue be reconsidered and this was endorsed by the local Councillors for both Mallaig and Lochboisdale at the subsequent round of ferry user group meetings. While no response was provided to the Ferry User Group consultation from the operator or Transport Scotland it is our understanding that concerns around the length of operating day available to MV Lord of the Isles prevented both train connections to be achieved although an argument could be made that connecting at either end of the day with trains either to or from Glasgow would be better than not at all and this could be achieved within the same daily overall hours of work.

The current Summer 2016 timetable with the missed rail connections is recreated below:

Lochboisdale		07:00		
Mallaig		10:30		
Mallaig dep	06:03	10:10	16:05	18:15
Fort William	07:25	11:32	17:28	19:37
GLQ arr	11:40	15:40	21:40	00:14
GLQ dep		08:21	12:19	18:21
Fort William	08:30	12:08	16:09	22:06
Mallaig arr	09:53	1334	17:43	2335
	Sun	Mon-Sat		
Mallaig	1500	17:30		
Lochboisdale	1830	21:00		

## Oban to Colonsay

Rail and coach links to Oban from Glasgow have been subject to significant enhancement in recent years. This now sees Oban served by 6 trains in both directions each day. The Colonsay timetable including where rail connections exist is reproduced below:

	Mon	Tue	Wed	Thu	Fri	Sat	Sun
GLQ	12:19	05:23	10:22	12:19	12:19	12:19	12:12
Oban	15:28	08:35	13:43	15:28	15:28	15:28	15:27
Oban	16:30	09:00	15:30	16:30	16:30	16:30	16:30
Colonsay	18:45	11:25	18:00	18:45	18:45	18:45	18:45
Colonsay	19:00	11:40		19:00	19:00	13:40	19:00
Oban	21:15	14:05		21:15	21:15	16:10	21:15
Oban		14:41				18:11	
GLQ		18:10				21:40	

While connections are not achieved with all services the main constraint is the late arrival in Oban at 2115 hrs and this is a consequence of there not being a dedicated vessel for Colonsay. The Scottish Ferries Plan does include an aspiration for Colonsay to have a dedicated vessel and should this be achieved there will be considerable scope to improve integration. With the limitations imposed on the operator it is difficult to see how this service could be more integrated with other modes than it is today.

## Dunoon to Glasgow (Integrated solutions from Western Ferries and Argyll Ferries)

McGills service 907 offers a seamless journey option from Dunoon to Glasgow with the coach travelling on Western Ferries service between Hunter's Quay and McInroy's Point. With up to 8 return journeys a day the service is strongly promoted by McGills with marketing materials and information prominent on their website. Information on the Clyde Flyer service is available at <http://www.mcgillsbuses.co.uk/mcgills-bus-timetables/907-dunoon-to-glasgow-.aspx> The service being a McGills route is not promoted strongly on the Western Ferries website but does appear within the useful links information on Western Ferries site. Through ticketing is achieved by the passenger only having to purchase their bus ticket with ferry travel taken care of separately by agreement between McGills and Western Ferries. This makes for a very straightforward transaction for the passenger.

Argyll Ferries operate the town centre to town centre passenger service between Dunoon and Gourock. Again frequency on the route is such that it would be impractical to reproduce the timetable in full. Argyll Ferries operates 60 services each day with connections to / from Glasgow (Monday to Saturday) and 30 sailings on Sunday. This affords passengers a first departure from Dunoon of 0645 and a last departure from

Glasgow of 2250 (Monday to Thursday) and 2350 (Friday and Saturday). Combined rail and ferry tickets are available for this route.

### **Lerwick to Aberdeen**

At Aberdeen the ferry terminal is approximately a 10-minute walk from the bus and rail station. This affords passengers to Lerwick and Kirkwall the opportunity of frequent connections to and from Glasgow, Edinburgh and Inverness. A walking route through Union Square shopping centre helps limit foot passengers' exposure to the elements on the walk to the ferry terminal.

The Northlink website carries information in a Travel Connections section. There could be value in including the best travel connections in the timetable section of the website too as a means of encouraging sustainable travel.

For travel onwards from Lerwick Ferry Terminal there is a bus link from the Ferry Terminal (which is located 2 miles from the town Centre, on Holmsgarth Road) that goes into the town and to the Bus Station, for onward travel around Shetland.

### **Conclusions**

The Conclusions from the the HITRANS Ferry Connections Study do appear to remain broadly valid today. This report concluded that,

“To many, the relative ease by which one is able to travel around the Highlands and Islands may come as a pleasant surprise.

The ferry network is relatively well-connected with other forms of public transport but there is always room for improvement. Some enhancements will require funding e.g. additional buses, but others e.g. slightly rescheduling some services to create robust connections, should not.

Clarification on check-in deadlines is needed. As mentioned earlier, many 'connections' work but, given the published rules about when a passenger should be on board, may not.

Better provision of accurate timetable publicity is needed. Ferry terminals and the ships themselves should always have details of the connecting buses and trains and vice versa. Services must not run in isolation; it would be helpful if staff on all modes of transport were aware of connections e.g. details to be shown on bus drivers 'running boards'.

Finally, 'to wait or not to wait!' Publicising 'guaranteed connections' together with a note of arrangements should something go awry would go a long way to allaying the 'what if ...' fears of potential passengers.”

There is work to do on Ferry Connections and this must be seen as an ongoing and constant process as small changes as timetables alter can see existing connections severed unless there is a focus from partners and stakeholders. In October 2014 HITRANS hosted a Transport Integration Forum in partnership with Calmac Ferries Limited. This was a very successful event and identified a number of opportunities for partners to take action to improve the quality of the interchange experience for passengers. There is scope to build on this event. HITRANS would be happy to support a biennial event with a main focus on integration with ferry services.

Plans are also in place for Regional Transport Integration Groups to be established in each mainland Regional Transport Partnership (RTP) area as a commitment that Abellio made in their bid for the ScotRail franchise. This will require the relevant RTP to work with Abellio on the focus and for the HITRANS area this will inevitable ensure a focus on connections between rail and ferry.

### **Recommendations**

1. Members are asked to note the report
2. Members are asked to discuss the issue of how modal integration can be optimised for ferry users.
3. Members are asked to consider ways forward on improving how bus, rail and ferry operators can be supported to deliver better modal integration to passengers.

<b>Report by:</b>	Ranald Robertson
<b>Designation:</b>	Partnership Director, HITRANS
<b>Date:</b>	29 <sup>th</sup> February 2016