



## **A83 Trunk Road Route Study**

### **Stakeholder Consultation Workshop: Summary of Discussion**

**Inveraray 22 August 2012**

**30 August 2012**

## Contents

<b>1</b>	<b>Introduction</b>	<b>1</b>
1.1	Purpose of the Workshop	1
1.2	Format of the Workshop	1
<b>2</b>	<b>Workshop Attendees</b>	<b>4</b>
<b>3</b>	<b>Summary of Workshop Outputs</b>	<b>5</b>
3.1	Introduction	5
3.2	Draft Study Objectives	5
3.3	Summary of Discussion Groups	5
<b>4</b>	<b>Next Steps</b>	<b>6</b>
Appendix A	Briefing Note	
Appendix B	Feedback Form	
Appendix C	Summary of First Break-Out Session Discussions (Rest and be Thankful)	
Appendix D	Summary of Second Break-Out Session Discussions (Target to Kennacraig)	

# 1 Introduction

## 1.1 Purpose of the Workshop

<b>What</b>	A83 Trunk Road Route Study Stakeholder Workshop
<b>When</b>	Wednesday 22 August 2012 (10:00 – 15:30)
<b>Where</b>	Loch Fyne Hotel, Inveraray
<b>Who</b>	JACOBS, Transport Scotland and Stakeholders

The objective of this workshop was to provide stakeholders with an opportunity to discuss the issues along the A83 Trunk Road and allow them to contribute their views on any ideas or possible solutions that might help remedy those issues. A set of draft objectives for the study was also presented and discussed and suggestions for changes or additions invited.

## 1.2 Format of the Workshop

**Before the workshop:** Stakeholders who had confirmed their attendance at the event were provided with a copy of a briefing note prior to the workshop. This briefing note detailed the objective of the workshop, the agenda, the structure of the workshop, draft study objectives and further engagement. A copy of the briefing note is included in **Appendix A**.

**At the workshop:** Following a welcome and introductions, Graham Edmond, Head of Network Maintenance for Transport Scotland, provided an update on the current work that is ongoing at the Rest and be Thankful. This update included discussions on the installation of netting at the landslip sites and the proposed use of the Old Military Road as a temporary emergency diversion route during closure periods.



A variety of questions were introduced from the attendees and responses provided by Transport Scotland representatives.

Transport Scotland (Gordon Ramsay) provided a general overview of the A83 Trunk Road Study, advising that the study would appraise a series of potential options to address the landslide problem at the Rest and be Thankful and for the wider route and these options would be further discussed with the Taskforce.

Following the introductory presentations, 'Session One' was undertaken whereby participants split into four break out groups. Each group was led by a representative from Jacobs and a representative from Transport Scotland. A list of all attendees and groups is included in Section 2 of this paper.

Stakeholders were asked to discuss their views in relation to the following:

- *What are the issues related to the landslide closures on the A83 Rest and be Thankful that affect you?*
- *What are the consequences related to the issues identified above?*
- *Are there any potential solutions to address the issues identified above? and*
- *What problems would these potential solutions mitigate?*

Stakeholders were also asked for their views on the draft objectives that had been developed.



Break out groups in discussion

Following the 'Session One' break out groups, feedback was provided to the full stakeholder group by Jacobs staff or a nominated representative of the group and questions/comments were invited from stakeholders.

The participants returned to the same groups to participate in 'Session Two'. In this session, stakeholders were asked to consider the whole A83 Trunk Road between Kennacraig and Tarbet and again discuss their views in relation to issues, consequences, potential solutions and what problems the potential solutions would mitigate. Stakeholders were also asked to rank the issues in order of priority.



Break out groups in discussion

Feedback was again provided to the full stakeholder group following completion of the break out sessions followed by a question and answer session.

A summary of the output from each workshop session is included in Section 3.

**After the workshop:** Comment forms were made available at the end of the day for stakeholders to provide any additional information following the event. These forms should be submitted to us no later than Friday 14 September. A copy of the feedback form is included in Appendix B.

**2 Workshop Attendees**

<p>John Buchanan (Friends of the Rest)  Garret Corner (Inveraray Community Council)  Mike Dean (Citylink Coaches)  David Eaglesham (Road Haulage Association)  Mary Haggarty (Arrochar &amp; Tarbet Community Council)  Andrew Mclure (Strathclyde Fire &amp; Rescue)  Alan Reid MP  Gordon Ross (Western Ferries)  Cllr John Semple  Andrew Wilson (Mid-Argyll Chamber of Commerce)  Robbie Brown (Caledonian Macbrayne)  Kathleen Cameron (Tourist Guide)  Cllr George Freeman  Danny Halliday (West Coast Motors)  Tony Jarvis (Highlands &amp; Islands Enterprise)  Iain MacInnes (Lochgoil Community Council)  Peter McKerral (Forestry Contractors)  Mike Masters (Furnace Community Council)  Robert Pollock (Argyll &amp; Bute Council)  Roland Stiven (Timber Transport Forum)  Graeme Herd (Jacobs)  Veronica Allan (Transport Scotland)  Helen Bradley (Jacobs)  Keith Murray (Transport Scotland)</p>	<p>Bob Chicken (Tarbert &amp; Skipness Community Council)  Gavin Dick (Argyll &amp; the Islands Tourism)  Gordon Donaldson (Forestry Commission)  Alastair Henderson (Caledonian Macbrayne)  Cllr Donald Kelly  Peter MacDonald (Strathclyde Police)  Mary MacGugan (West Loch Fyne Jane MacLeod (Mid-Argyll Chamber of Commerce)  Community Council)  Paul Robertson (Strathclyde Police)  John Semple (National Farmers Union)  Jim Smith (Argyll &amp; Bute Council)  John Wrigley (Scotland Transerv)  Cllr Roddy McCuish  Ian Liddell (Lochgilphead Community Council)  Leonard McNeill (West Loch Fyne Community Council)  Alan Bell (Loch Lomond and the Trossachs National Park)  David Duthie (HI-TRANS)  Edward Laughton (Ardrihaig Community Council)  Kirsty Robb (Argyll Timber Transport Group)  Callum Robertson (Argyll &amp; Bute)  Mike Story (Argyll &amp; the Islands Tourism)  Rebecca McClenaghan (Jacobs)  Gordon Ramsay (Transport Scotland)  Graeme McQuaker (Jacobs)  Andy Anderson (Transport Scotland)</p>
---	--

## 3 Summary of Workshop Outputs

### 3.1 Introduction

Representatives from Jacobs recorded the various comments made by the stakeholders, within the break out groups. All comments were then collated, and grouped into a series of common themes. The sections below present the key issues relating to the Rest and be Thankful and the remainder of the Trunk Road

### 3.2 Draft Study Objectives

A set of draft study objectives were presented and discussed at the various break out groups. The draft objectives are listed below:

- Provide a long term (permanent) solution to address landslide impacts at the Rest and be Thankful;
- Improve journey time reliability by reducing the frequency and impact of road closures;
- Improve operating conditions on the A83;
- Reduce accident rates and severity on the A83;
- Improve pedestrian and cycling amenities in the settlements on the A83; and
- Deliver environmental benefits where possible, and minimise necessary environmental impacts to an acceptable level.

The above draft objectives will be refined over the next few weeks to reflect the specific problems identified and discussed as part of the stakeholder engagement session.

### 3.3 Summary of Discussion Groups

Appendix C provides a summary of the output from the discussions during the first break out session at the stakeholder workshop, and Appendix D contains details from the second session. This output is presented in terms of the problems, causes, constraints and comments relating to particular issues and potential solutions, as raised by the workshop participants. The individual comments made have been collated and grouped by Jacobs to aid presentation and understanding.

The information within the tables in Appendices C and D reflects the discussion across the four break out groups and is presented as a record of the discussion. This information will be used to inform the study and is not meant to represent a complete list of options that will be considered as the study progresses.

## 4 Next Steps

Moving forward, the next steps in the project are to:

- consolidate outputs from this workshop with previous work and any other written submissions;
- progress the Stage 1 Appraisal;
- continue to report to the monthly A83 Taskforce meetings;
- conclude study by end of October 2012; and
- publish a final report by the end of the year.

## Appendix A Briefing Note

### **A83 Trunk Road Route Study Stakeholder Workshop: 22 August 2012**

#### **Information to aid participants**

**Please find below a general outline of the workshop and the agenda for the day. This information has been prepared to give you an understanding of the workshop structure and to outline what you can expect on the day in terms of your participation.**

**The project team look forward to meeting you and working with you in an open and collaborative forum.**

#### **1. Objective of the Workshop**

Jacobs has been appointed by Transport Scotland to carry out an appraisal of the A83 Trunk Road. In this appraisal we have been asked to consider measures to manage the effects of landslips at the Rest and be Thankful and also to consider wider measures which would seek to remove traffic pinch points and improve pedestrian and cyclist safety in villages along the A83.

Stakeholder and community participation and consultation are key elements of this process and we really encourage you to provide your thoughts, insights and ideas to help inform this study.

The objective of the workshop is to look more closely at the issues along the route and identify any ideas or solutions that could help remedy those issues. We are also keen to agree a set of objectives with you which will help the appraisal process.

We have invited a wide range of organisations and individuals to the meeting in order to hear from as many different people as possible in order that we may learn and understand more about the issues on the route and to think about the possible solutions.

You will note that this is a workshop rather than a public meeting. This means we would really like you to participate in the discussions. There will be further opportunities to talk to the team after the workshop should you have any further questions or concerns.

Lunch will be provided on the day, and we ask that you inform us of any special dietary requirements that you may have.

#### **2. Agenda**

An indicative Agenda is set out below. Please note this is for guidance and may be subject to change in terms of detailed timings and structure as we finalise our plans in the lead up to the workshop.

9:50 to 10:00 Registration

10.00 to 10.45 Introduction, Overview & Briefing

10.45 to 12.00 Session 1 – A83 Rest and Be Thankful

Discussion of the issues and identification of problems, followed by thoughts on the draft study objectives and identification of possible options and solutions.

12.00 to 12.30 Feedback

12.30 to 13.15 Lunch

13.15 to 12.30 Introduction to Session 2

13.30 to 14.45 Session 2 – A83 Tarbet-Lochgilpead-Kennacraig

Discussion of the issues and identification of problems, followed by thoughts on the draft study objectives and identification of possible options and solutions.

14.45 to 15.15 Feedback

15.15 to 15.30 Overview of Next Steps

### **3. Structure of Workshop**

An indicative structure for the workshop is set out below. Please note this is for guidance and may be subject to change as we finalise our plans in the lead up to the workshop. Also on the day of the workshop we may adjust some of the details so that we can accommodate the evolving discussion.

The workshop will be hosted by representatives of Transport Scotland and Jacobs. A Transport Scotland representative will provide a brief introduction, following which the programme for the day will be set out.

The first part of the morning session will consist of a short presentation by Jacobs staff on the appraisal process, highlighting the different aspects of the study; covering the Rest and be Thankful issues and also issues affecting areas along the remainder of the A83 Trunk Road.

Break out groups will then be used to facilitate discussion from the participants in each session. In addition to discussing the problems and opportunities, there will be a clear focus in each session on the discussion of well defined and robust objectives and potential solutions.

The first break out session will focus on the issues relating to the Rest and be Thankful section. Workshop participants will be encouraged to communicate the problems that are encountered as a result of the landslip closures and identify potential opportunities to improve the situation, both in the short term and longer term.

The afternoon session will concentrate on the issues relating to the whole of the A83 Trunk Road between Tarbet and Kennacraig. This will follow a similar structure to the morning session and participants will be encouraged to identify the causes and consequences of problems and other issues that are encountered along the length of the route, and again potential solutions.

### **4. Draft Study Objectives**

The following draft study objectives have been identified and we would like to hear your thoughts on these on the day.

- Provide a long term solution to address landslide impacts at the Rest and be Thankful;
- Improve journey time reliability by reducing the frequency and impact of road closures;
- Improve operating conditions on the A83;
- Reduce accident rates and severity on the A83; and
- Improve pedestrian and cycling amenities in the towns on the A83.

The above objectives will be refined over the next few weeks to reflect the specific problems identified and discussed as part of the stakeholder engagement session.

## **5. Further Engagement**

Whilst the workshop is a key component of the study, there will be further opportunities for stakeholders and interested parties to contribute to the study. All workshop participants will be issued with a form to provide additional comments, which can be submitted after the workshop. In addition, any further comments on the study can be submitted, after the workshop and for a reasonable period of time, via e-mail to [A83trunkroadstudy@jacobs.com](mailto:A83trunkroadstudy@jacobs.com), or in writing to:

Evonne Baird  
Jacobs UK Ltd  
95 Bothwell Street  
GLASGOW, G2 7HX

**Appendix B    Feedback Form**



**Appendix C Summary of First Break-Out Session Discussions (Rest and be Thankful)**

These tables summarise the issues and opportunities identified by participants during the first break-out session at the stakeholder event in Inveraray on 22 August 2012.

<b>Problems</b>	<b>Causes</b>	<b>Constraints</b>	<b>Opportunities/Interventions</b>
Closure of A83 at Rest and be Thankful	Landslide incidents or closure due to high risk of landslides.	Challenging topography. Geotechnical issues. Land ownership. Maintaining adequate diversion routes during construction. Landscape considerations. Affordability	Use of the Old Military Road for diversions. Utilise forestry road. Construction of a new route. Tunnelling. Provision of avalanche type rock/debris shelters. Removal of part of the hillside in a controlled manner. Re-introduction of livestock to the hillside to reduce the vegetation. Plant trees on the affected hillside. Improved ferry links to Cowal and Argyll.

<b>Consequences of the Closure</b>	<b>Comments made by participants</b>
Access to Glasgow and the central belt for shopping, hospital appointments and social requirements is reduced.	
Ageing population resulting from difficulty maintaining the population and reducing migration.	
Disruption to business. This includes hotels and other tourist facilities in Argyll and sawmills outwith Argyll that utilise forestry products from	

Consequences of the Closure	Comments made by participants
Argyll	
Economic costs to businesses in Argyll from additional fuel costs, drivers wages and other running costs.	
Closure of the Rest and be Thankful results in increased attendance times for the emergency services from alternative locations.	
External perception of Argyll as disconnected, peripheral and remote resulting from poor information giving negative messages.	Improve information promoting alternative routes.
Ferry connections missed resulting in a knock on effect to businesses on the islands.	
The hazard warning system flashes when there is an increased risk of landslide but drivers are unsure how to react when the warning is activated.	Review use of warning signs.
HGV/Bus may have insufficient driving hours to complete their journey.	Temporary relaxation of driving hours.
Closures and risk of closure due to landslides discouraging visitors from using the A83. High risk message being portrayed. Intense monitoring is making the situation worse.	Improve communication including promoting alternative routes into Argyll including use of the ferry service to Cowal. Toning down the high risk message.
Increased journey time due to road closure diversion. This increased journey time results in additional costs and can result in drivers not having sufficient driving hours to complete the journey.	
Increased risk of accidents due to the use of an unfamiliar diversion route with significantly longer driving times resulting in time pressures.	
Length of time to re-open the road following closure appears to be excessive as material needs to be removed and the slope made safe.	

Consequences of the Closure	Comments made by participants
Reduced passenger numbers on Campbeltown to Glasgow bus service during closures, reducing viability on non-subsidised service.	
Risk of material on lower slopes, below current road level, on the Rest and be Thankful slipping.	
Traffic queuing back onto road from ferry terminals at McInroes' Point and Hunter's Quay at times of increased traffic using ferry to Cowal to avoid A83 closure due to limited storage space at terminals.	
Traffic Scotland information slow to load on mobile devices and not specific to area.	Provide area specific information. Seek to improve suitability of web page for mobile devices.
Some school pupils travel to school through the landslip area and this is not viable when the route is closed.	
Uncertainty over future closures.	Improve information provision.
Viability of exporting timber from Argyll is reduced as the uncertainty over length of route is factored into pricing for the movement of timber resulting in reduced viability compared to other areas.	

## Appendix D Summary of Second Break-Out Session Discussions (Tarbet to Kennacraig)

These tables summarise the issues and opportunities identified by participants during the first break-out session at the stakeholder event in Inveraray on 22 August 2012.

Problems	Causes	Constraints	Comments made by participants
Poor visibility, obscured road signs and damage to vehicles.	Uncut vegetation and overhanging trees.	Trees are not all owned by the roads authority.	Ongoing maintenance of roadside vegetation.
Lengthy or no diversion routes available.	Road closures due to accidents or other incidents.	Topography limits opportunities for suitable diversion routes.	Improve information provision.
Excessive duration of road closures	Serious/fatal road accidents. Requirement for accident investigation with specialist support from outwith the immediate area.	Limited specialist support within immediate area. Requirement to fully investigate road accidents.	Improve information provision.
Lack of overtaking opportunities on route	Road alignment. High level of HGV traffic. Driver frustration. Platooning traffic behind slow moving vehicles.	Physical constraints from rockfaces and the lochside. Cost.	Improve road layouts.
Lay-bys are infrequent and full of potholes	Poor maintenance		Improve existing laybys and provide additional laybys where required.
Pinch points between Tarbet and Arrochar.	Width of road through railway bridge	Road width/pedestrian provision through bridge.	
Sharp bend at Tarbet Hotel.	Poor road alignment	Land ownership/landscape	Improve road layout.

<b>Problems</b>	<b>Causes</b>	<b>Constraints</b>	<b>Comments made by participants</b>
Risk of accidents at Ardgarten	Poor alignment		Improve road layout. Provision of additional signage and surface treatment.
Bus passengers having to alight at Ardgarten visitors centre as there are no facilities for buses to turn at the Rest and be Thankful.	Lack of space for bus to turn.	Land issues	Argyll & Bute Council are progressing a scheme for a bus turning facility at this location.
Narrow road and potholes along the edge of road between Dunderave and Inveraray.	Road alignment.		Improve road layout.
Delays on River Aray Bridge	Tourists stopping to take photographs and pedestrians on bridge.	Width of bridge	Provide pedestrian viewpoint with a path from Inveraray Green. Provide additional pedestrian crossing of the river.
Poor signage for Dalmally Road in Inveraray.			Improve signage.
Pedestrian vehicle conflicts within Inveraray, particularly in the tourist season.	Trunk road passes directly through the main street in Inveraray, tourists and other pedestrians cross this road between shops, hotels, restaurants etc.	No clear single pedestrian desire line.	Investigate the requirement for formalised crossing facilities.
Vibration of buildings within Inveraray.	Heavy vehicles passing through the middle of the town.	Trunk road passes through the main street.	Consider bypass of Inveraray Additional Traffic Management measures

<b>Problems</b>	<b>Causes</b>	<b>Constraints</b>	<b>Comments made by participants</b>
Abnormal loads require whole width of road when passing through Inveraray.	Width of load vs width of road.	Tight corners through town.	Effective management of abnormal loads to minimise disruption.
Road layout at church through Inveraray.	Driver confusion/hesitation.	Narrow road width around church.	Improve signing.
Accident risk at Strone Point north of Inveraray.	Sharp bend in road.	Land ownership/landscape	Improve road layout/safety features.
Dangerous right turn from Furnace (northern end of village), especially for buses.	Poor visibility while turning out of village.	Available land	Improve road layout/safety features.
Speeding through 40mph at Minard	Straight section of road with 40mph limit past village.		Provide additional road markings/warning signs.
Standing start up hill from Minard for HGVs when stopped at lights.	Traffic lights at pinch point at red.		Re-configure traffic signals to give priority to traffic heading south.
Speeding on 40mph limit through Lochgair	Excessive speed		Improve signage Improve enforcement Introduce additional warning signs.
30mph limit leaving Lochgilphead is not suitable for location.	30mph limit implemented when school was built. Design altered resulting in no requirement for pupils to walk on this stretch.		Speed limit review has been carried out.

<b>Problems</b>	<b>Causes</b>	<b>Constraints</b>	<b>Comments made by participants</b>
Crossing the road safely in Ardrishaig.	Lack of crossing facilities		Consider providing some form of pedestrian crossing facilities.
Approach to Adrishaig is a 40mph and cars enter going too fast.			Reduce speed limit, incorporate traffic calming measures.
Vehicles unable to pass at pinch point at Erines.	Narrow road width.	Rockface on west side, loch side on east side of road.	Partial or complete widening. Improved signage and control of traffic through pinch point.
Problems safely crossing the road to the Co-Op in Tarbert	Lack of crossing facilities		Consider providing some form of pedestrian crossing facilities.
Lack of space for two vehicles to pass on the approach to Tarbert from the north.	Narrow road width.	Adjacent house boundaries next to roadway.	Improve road layout; Additional control of traffic.
Strategic timber route that allows forestry HGVs to avoid the centre of Tarbert not being used to full potential.	Adverse camber in road at junction with A83		Improve road layout.