

Contents

DOCUMENT CONTROL SHEET	I
CONTENTS	II
1 INTRODUCTION	1
1.1 COMMISSION SUMMARY	1
1.2 COMMISSION OBJECTIVES.....	1
1.3 SCOPE OF THE COMMISSION.....	1
1.4 LOCATION PLAN	1
2 OBJECTIVES	2
2.1 CLIENT OBJECTIVES.....	2
2.2 OBJECTIVE METHODOLOGY	2
2.2.1 Methodology Step 1	2
2.2.2 Methodology Step 2	2
2.2.3 Methodology Step 3	3
2.2.4 Methodology Step 4	3
2.3 PLANNING OBJECTIVES.....	3
2.3.1 Planning Objective 1: Stabilize journey times on A737 at peak hours.....	4
2.3.2 Planning Objective 2: Achieve 20% reduction in traffic volume in New Street	4
2.3.3 Planning Objective 3: Improve accessibility across the A737.....	5
2.3.4 Planning Objective 4: Enhance the attractiveness for walking and cycling in Dalry	5
2.3.5 Planning Objective 5: Stabilize Bus Journey Times through Dalry at Peak Hours	5
2.4 GOVERNMENT OBJECTIVES.....	5
2.5 EXTERNAL OBJECTIVES	6
3 ANALYSIS OF EXISTING AND POTENTIAL PROBLEMS.....	7
3.1 IDENTIFICATION OF PROBLEMS	7
3.2 INITIAL ANALYSIS OF THE PROBLEMS.....	7
3.3 SUMMARY OF DETAILED ANALYSIS.....	8
3.3.1 Congestion and delay on the A737 Corridor (Problems 1, 2, 16, 27, 29, 36, 38 & 40)	8
3.3.2 Congestion in Dalry Town Centre (Problems 5, 6, 8, 10, 19, 20, 22, 23, 25, 28 and 30).....	8
3.3.3 Railway Station Park and Ride Car Park capacity (problem 12).....	9
3.3.4 Community Severance caused by the A737 (problems 9, 18 and 24)	9
3.4 CONSTRAINTS, UNCERTAINTIES AND OPPORTUNITIES	10
3.4.1 Constraints.....	10
3.4.2 Uncertainties	10
3.4.3 Opportunities	10
3.4.3.1 Improve connectivity of buses and trains (Opportunity 1)	10
3.4.3.2 Improvement of the existing footpath to Train Station (Opportunity 2)	10
3.4.3.3 Provision of cycle racks or secure cycle storage at the Railway station (Opportunity 3)	10
3.4.3.4 Provision of cycle racks or secure cycle storage in the Town Centre (Opportunity 4)	11
3.4.3.5 Establish Focus Group for New Street Shopkeepers (Opportunity 5)	11

4	OPTION GENERATION, SIFTING AND DEVELOPMENT	12
4.1	OPTION GENERATION AND SIFTING SUMMARY	12
4.2	THE PROCESS.....	12
4.3	THE ACCEPTED OPTIONS	14
4.3.1	Option A1 – Review signal timings on existing Traffic Lights.....	14
4.3.2	Option A2 – Modification of Existing A737 junctions with New Street and Roche Way	14
4.3.3	Option A3 – Review of Car parking and shop deliveries etc	14
4.3.4	Option A4 – Traffic Management Measures.....	14
4.3.5	Option A5 – Improve signing of High Vehicle Divert Route.....	14
4.3.6	Option A6 – Introduce by-pass to east of Dalry	14
4.3.7	Option A7 – Pedestrian Crossing on A737.....	14
4.3.8	Option A8 – Improve Footpath/Cycle way from Railway Station etc	14
4.3.9	Option A9 – School Travel Plans.....	15
4.3.10	Option A10 – Improve bus services from Town Centre to Train Station.....	15
5	CONSULTATION	16
5.1	INTRODUCTION	16
5.2	CONSULTATION PLANNING FOR THE A737 DALRY STUDY	16
5.3	PART 1 CONSULTATION	16
5.4	PART 2 CONSULTATION	16
6	PART 1 APPRAISAL.....	19
6.1	OUTLINE OF INITIAL APPRAISAL	19
6.2	FINAL PACKAGED OPTION	19
6.2.1	Approach to the appraisal of specific options	20
6.2.1.1	Option One	20
6.2.1.2	Option Two	20
6.2.1.3	Option Three.....	20
6.2.1.4	Option Four	21
6.2.1.5	Option Five.....	21
6.2.2	Environmental Appraisal of Options	21
6.3	TRAFFIC MODELLING USING S-PARAMICS MICROSIMULATION SOFTWARE	22
6.3.1	The Existing Situation and Base Model.....	22
6.3.2	Modelling of Traffic Management Solution (Option Two – see table 6.2).....	22
6.3.3	Future Year Traffic Growth.....	23
6.3.4	S-Paramics Output Summary.....	24
6.3.4.1	Path 1 – A737 Southbound.....	24
6.3.4.2	Path 2 – A737 Northbound.....	25
6.3.4.3	Path 3 – Roche Way to New Street signals.....	25
6.3.4.4	Path 4 – New Street from Courthill Street to Traffic Lights	26
6.3.5	Assessment of overall improvement/delay	26
6.3.6	Sensitivity to Traffic Growth.....	27
6.3.7	Removal of By-passable traffic	27
6.3.8	Summary of findings for Option 2.....	27
6.4	BRIEF ASSESSMENT OF THE IMPACTS OF THE CONSIDERED OPTIONS	27

6.5	OPTION APPRAISAL SUMMARY	29
6.6	OPTIONS REJECTED – SUMMARY DISCUSSION	30
6.6.1	<i>Option One Rejection</i>	30
6.7	OPTIONS TAKEN FORWARD – DISCUSSION	30
6.7.1	<i>Option Two Acceptance</i>	30
6.7.2	<i>Option Three Acceptance</i>	30
6.7.3	<i>Option Four Acceptance</i>	31
6.7.4	<i>Option Five Acceptance</i>	31
6.7.5	<i>Option Six Acceptance</i>	32
6.7.6	<i>Option Seven Acceptance</i>	32
6.7.7	<i>Option Eight Acceptance</i>	32
6.8	PART 1 APPRAISAL SUMMARY TABLES	32
7	PART 2 (DETAILED) PROJECT APPRAISAL	33
7.1	INTRODUCTION	33
7.2	PROPOSAL DETAILS	33
7.2.1	<i>Package 1 Proposals as issued for Consultation</i>	33
7.2.2	<i>Package 2 Proposal as issued for Consultation</i>	35
7.2.3	<i>Development of Proposals</i>	35
7.2.3.1	Option 2, reference 2/1 (modification to existing junction)	35
7.2.3.2	Option 4 (Dalry By-pass)	35
7.2.4	<i>Key Stakeholder Consultation Feedback</i>	36
7.2.4.1	Option 2 (Improvement to New Street Junction)	36
7.2.4.2	Option 3 (Car Parking etc)	37
7.2.4.3	Option 4 (Dalry By-pass)	39
7.2.4.4	Option 5 (Pedestrian Crossing)	39
7.2.4.5	Option 6 (Cycle path + Cycle Storage)	40
7.2.4.6	Option 7 (School Travel Plans)	41
7.2.4.7	Option 8 (Improve Bus services to the Train Stations)	41
7.2.5	<i>Package 1 Proposals for Detailed Appraisal</i>	43
7.2.6	<i>Package 2 Proposal for Detailed Appraisal</i>	43
7.2.7	<i>Appraisal Reference Cases</i>	43
7.2.8	<i>Scheme Opening Years</i>	43
7.3	PLANNING OBJECTIVES	44
7.3.1	<i>Planning Objective 1</i>	44
7.3.2	<i>Planning Objective 2</i>	45
7.3.3	<i>Planning Objective 3</i>	46
7.3.4	<i>Planning Objective 4</i>	46
7.3.5	<i>Planning Objective 5</i>	47
7.4	IMPLEMENTABILITY APPRAISAL	48
7.4.1	<i>Technical</i>	48
7.4.2	<i>Operational</i>	49
7.4.3	<i>Financial</i>	49
7.4.4	<i>Public</i>	50
7.5	ENVIRONMENTAL APPRAISAL	51
7.5.1	<i>Introduction</i>	51

7.5.2	<i>Methods</i>	51
7.5.2.1	Collation of Baseline Information	51
7.5.2.2	Environmental Evaluation	51
7.5.3	<i>Noise and Vibration</i>	57
7.5.3.1	Overview	57
7.5.3.2	Package 1	57
7.5.3.3	Package 2	57
7.5.4	<i>Global Air Quality (Carbon Dioxide (CO2)) and Local Air Quality (Particulates (PM10))</i>	57
7.5.4.1	Overview	57
7.5.4.2	Package 1	58
7.5.4.3	Package 2	58
7.5.5	<i>Water Quality, Drainage and Flood Defence</i>	58
7.5.5.1	Overview	58
7.5.5.2	Package 1	59
7.5.5.3	Package 2	59
7.5.6	<i>Geology (including contaminated land)</i>	60
7.5.6.1	Overview	60
7.5.6.2	Package 1	60
7.5.6.3	Package 2	60
7.5.7	<i>Biodiversity</i>	60
7.5.7.1	Overview	60
7.5.7.2	Package 1	61
7.5.7.3	Package 2	61
7.5.8	<i>Landscape</i>	61
7.5.8.1	Overview	61
7.5.8.2	Package 1	62
7.5.8.3	Package 2	62
7.5.9	<i>Visual Amenity</i>	63
7.5.9.1	Overview	63
7.5.9.2	Package 1	64
7.5.9.3	Package 2	64
7.5.10	<i>Agriculture and Soils</i>	64
7.5.10.1	Overview	64
7.5.10.2	Package 1	65
7.5.10.3	Package 2	65
7.5.11	<i>Cultural Heritage</i>	65
7.5.11.1	Overview	65
7.5.11.2	Package 1	65
7.5.11.3	Package 2	66
7.6	SAFETY	67
7.6.1	<i>Accidents</i>	67
7.6.1.1	Introduction	67
7.6.1.2	Package 1	67
7.6.1.3	Package 2	67
7.6.2	<i>Security</i>	68
7.7	ECONOMY (TRANSPORT ECONOMIC EFFICIENCY)	69

7.7.1	<i>Introduction</i>	69
7.7.2	<i>Operational Assessment</i>	69
7.7.2.1	Package 1.....	69
7.7.2.2	Package 2.....	70
7.7.3	<i>Economic assessment</i>	71
7.7.3.1	Introduction	71
7.7.3.2	Package 1.....	71
7.7.3.3	Package 2.....	72
7.8	ECONOMY (ECONOMIC ACTIVITY AND LOCATION IMPACTS).....	78
7.8.1	<i>Overview of Study Approach</i>	78
7.8.2	<i>Key Impacts and Effects</i>	79
7.8.3	<i>Regeneration and Distribution Effects</i>	82
7.8.4	<i>Conclusion</i>	83
7.9	INTEGRATION.....	84
7.9.1	<i>Transport Interchanges</i>	84
7.9.1.1	Services and Ticketing.....	84
7.9.1.2	Infrastructure & Information	86
7.9.2	<i>Land-use Transport Integration</i>	86
7.9.2.1	North Ayrshire Local Plan.....	86
7.9.2.2	A Joint Transport Strategy for Western Scotland to 2025	88
7.9.2.3	North Ayrshire Council Local Transport Strategy.....	88
7.9.2.4	Ayrshire Joint Structure Plan 1999 (approved plan).....	89
7.9.2.5	Ayrshire Joint Structure Plan 2025	89
7.9.3	<i>Policy Integration</i>	90
7.9.3.1	Disability	90
7.9.3.2	Health	90
7.9.3.3	Rural Affairs.....	90
7.10	ACCESSIBILITY AND SOCIAL INCLUSION	91
7.10.1	<i>Public Transport Network Coverage</i>	91
7.10.1.1	Package 1.....	91
7.10.1.2	Package 2.....	91
7.10.2	<i>Access to Other Services</i>	92
7.10.2.1	Package 1.....	92
7.10.2.2	Package 2.....	93
7.10.3	<i>Distribution/Spatial impacts by Social Group (accessibility)</i>	93
7.10.3.1	Road Users	93
7.10.3.2	Pedestrians.....	94
7.10.3.3	Cyclists	94
7.10.3.4	Shoppers.....	94
7.10.3.5	Public Transport Users	95
7.10.4	<i>Distribution/Spatial impacts by Area</i>	95
7.10.4.1	Area 1 – Area bounded by Townend St, Garnock St and New St.	95
7.10.4.2	Area 2 – Housing to the east of Dalry Railway Station	95
7.11	COST TO PUBLIC SECTOR.....	96
7.12	MONETISED SUMMARY	96

8	RISK AND UNCERTAINTY	97
8.1	INTRODUCTION	97
8.2	OPTIMISM BIAS – CAPITAL EXPENDITURE	98
8.2.1	<i>Upper Bound Values - CAPEX</i>	98
8.2.2	<i>Optimism Bias Assessment - CAPEX</i>	98
8.2.2.1	Package 1	98
8.2.2.2	Package 2	98
8.2.3	<i>Optimism Bias Conclusion</i>	99
8.3	RISK AND UNCERTAINTY ISSUES	102
8.3.1	<i>Traffic Growth Assumptions</i>	102
8.3.2	<i>Enforcement of schemes</i>	102
8.3.3	<i>Environmental/Ecological Issues/Uncertainties</i>	103
8.3.4	<i>Scheme Specific Risk</i>	103
8.3.5	<i>Traffic Regulation Orders for the new junction arrangement</i>	104
8.3.6	<i>Procurement and demolition of No.43 New Street and flat above</i>	104
8.3.7	<i>Risk of delay to Main Line Orders for By-pass</i>	105
8.3.8	<i>Risk of delay to Side Road Orders for By-pass</i>	105
8.3.9	<i>Risk of delay to Compulsory Purchase Orders</i>	105
8.3.10	<i>Technical risk to by-pass arising from Extensive Mine workings</i>	105
8.3.11	<i>Valuing the risks</i>	106
8.4	PROGRAMME RISK	106
8.4.1	<i>Package 1 Programme</i>	106
8.4.2	<i>Package 2 Programme</i>	107
9	MONITORING AND EVALUATION	108
9.1	MONITORING	108
9.2	EVALUATION	108
9.2.1	<i>Process Evaluation</i>	108
9.2.2	<i>Outcome Evaluation</i>	112
10	CONCLUSIONS.....	113
10.1	SUMMARY OF KEY OBJECTIVES	113
10.2	SYNOPSIS OF METHODOLOGY	113
10.3	DESCRIPTIONS OF KEY PROPOSALS	113
10.3.1	<i>Package 1</i>	113
10.3.2	<i>Package 2</i>	114
10.4	KEY FINDINGS	114
10.4.1	<i>Traffic and Economic Efficiency</i>	114
10.4.1.1	Generally	114
10.4.1.2	Package 1	115
10.4.1.3	Package 2	115
10.4.2	<i>Economic Activity and Location Impacts (EALI) Assessment</i>	115
10.4.3	<i>Environmental Assessment</i>	116
10.4.3.1	Package 1	116
10.4.3.2	Package 2	116

10.4.4	Safety.....	116
10.4.4.1	Package 1.....	116
10.4.4.2	Package 2.....	116
10.4.5	Integration.....	117
10.4.5.1	Package 1.....	117
10.4.5.2	Package 2.....	117
10.4.6	Accessibility.....	117
10.4.6.1	Package 1.....	117
10.4.6.2	Package 2.....	117
10.4.7	Achievement of Planning Objectives	117
10.5	DELIVERABILITY.....	120
10.5.1	Package 1	120
10.5.2	Package 2	120
10.6	CONCLUSIONS.....	120
10.6.1	The Primary Problem.....	120
10.6.2	Town Centre Improvements (Package 1)	120
10.6.3	Dalry By-pass (Package 2).....	122
10.7	PRIMARY RECOMMENDATIONS.....	123
10.8	OTHER RECOMMENDATIONS.....	123

APPENDIX A – LOCATION PLAN

APPENDIX B – LIST OF PROBLEMS

APPENDIX C – PART 1 APPRAISAL SUMMARY TABLES

APPENDIX D – LOCATION DRAWINGS FOR PART 2 PROPOSALS

APPENDIX E – TABLE OF LISTED BUILDINGS IN DALRY

APPENDIX F – PART 2 APPRAISAL SUMMARY TABLES

APPENDIX G – KEY PERFORMANCE INDICATORS

APPENDIX H – LAND USE RECORDS

APPENDIX I – RISK ASSESSMENT MATRIX

APPENDIX J – NOTES FROM PUBLIC MEETING