

9. Cultural Heritage

Summary

This chapter presents an assessment of effects of the proposed scheme on cultural heritage resources comprising archaeological remains, historic buildings and the historic landscape.

A study area was defined which comprised the footprint of the proposed scheme and extended 200m in all directions from it. Baseline conditions for the study area were established through desk-based survey, LiDAR analysis, a walkover survey and a geophysical survey. From these sources, a total of 270 cultural heritage resources were identified within the study area. A further three cultural heritage resources located outside of the study area were included in the baseline due to the potential for impacts on their settings. The total number of cultural heritage resources included in the baseline was therefore 273, comprising 134 archaeological remains, 123 historic buildings and 16 historic landscape types (HLT).

Mitigation measures to re-integrate Dunkeld and Birnam Station, including Footbridge (Asset 26), a Category A Listed Building, with Birnam and reduce the impact on the setting of the station were embedded in the design of the proposed scheme. Measures to better integrate the proposed scheme into Murthly Castle Garden and Designed Landscape (GDL) (HLT 14), included on the Inventory of Gardens and Designed Landscapes, were also embedded in the design of the proposed scheme.

With the embedded mitigation in place, but in the absence of essential mitigation, the following potentially significant adverse effects (i.e. of Moderate significant or higher) during construction were assessed:

- effects of Moderate significance on Dunkeld And Birnam Station, Goods Yard (Asset 832) Ladywell Enclosure (Asset 941), the possible enclosures, pit-like anomalies, sub-circular anomalies identified by archaeological geophysical survey in Geophysical Survey Area P02_05 (Asset 960) and the possible enclosure in Geophysical Survey Area P02_03 (Asset 962);
- effects of Moderate significance on Dunkeld and Birnam Station Signal Box (Asset 16; a Category B Listed Building), Birnam Conservation Area (Asset 44) and the non-designated Auchlou, Inver (Asset 793) and Inver Wood, Bridge (Asset 931).
- the significance of effect on Dunkeld and Birnam Station, including Footbridge (Asset 26; a Category A Listed Building) was assessed to be Very Large; and
- an effect of Moderate significance on Murthly Castle GDL (HLT 14).

For the archaeological remains essential mitigation comprising archaeological excavation (Mitigation Item P02-CH03) informed by the results of archaeological trial trenching (Mitigation Item P02-CH02) will be undertaken. After mitigation the residual significance of effect for Dunkeld And Birnam Station, Goods Yard (Asset 832), Ladywell Enclosure (Asset 941), the possible enclosures, pit-like anomalies, sub-circular anomalies identified by archaeological geophysical survey in Geophysical Survey Area P02_05 (Asset 960) and the possible enclosure in Geophysical Survey Area P02_03 (Asset 962) has been assessed to be Neutral. Interpretation boards presenting interpretive information on Asset 832 will be installed at suitable publicly accessible locations within the proposed Compulsory Purchase Order area (CPO) at the end of the construction period (Mitigation Item P02-CH06).

For Birnam Station Signal Box (Asset 16) and Birnam Conservation Area (Asset 44) essential mitigation comprises a photographic survey to document existing setting prior to construction (Mitigation Item P02-CH05). After mitigation the residual significance of effect during construction for Asset 16 and for Asset 44 has been assessed to be Moderate adverse.

For Auchloul, Inver (Asset 793) and Inver Wood, Bridge (Asset 931) essential mitigation comprises historic building recording (Mitigation Item P02-CH04). After mitigation, during construction the residual significance of effect on Assets 793 and 931 have been assessed to be Neutral.

Historic building recording (Mitigation Item P02-CH04) has also been identified for Dunkeld and Birnam Station, including Footbridge (Asset 26). While this would reduce the effects resulting from the partial removal of historic fabric of Platform 1 and Platform 2 and on the setting of the station it would not mitigate the temporary noise and visual construction effects on this historic building. After mitigation, during construction the residual significance of effect on Asset 26 has therefore been assessed to be Very Large adverse.

Interpretation boards presenting interpretive information on Dunkeld and Birnam Station, including Footbridge (Asset 26) will also be installed at suitable publicly accessible locations within the proposed CPO (Mitigation Item P02-CH06) at the end of the construction period.

For Murthly Castle GDL (HLT 14) essential mitigation comprises a photographic survey (Mitigation Item P02-CH07) and a historic landscape survey (Mitigation Item P02-CH08). Interpretation boards presenting interpretive information Murthly Castle GDL (HLT 14) will also be installed at suitable publicly accessible location within the proposed CPO (Mitigation Item P02-CH09) at the end of the construction period. After mitigation, during construction the residual significance of effect on Murthly Castle GDL (HLT 14) has been assessed to be Moderate adverse.

Mitigation Items P02-CH02, P02-CH03, P02-CH04, P02-CH05, P02-CH07 and P02-CH08 will include a programme of assessment, reporting, analysis, publication and dissemination (including archaeological community outreach) of results commensurate with the value of the historic resources affected. This will include the preparation of reports which will be submitted to the Perth & Kinross Historic Environment Record (PKHER) and the National Record of the Historic Environment (NRHE), along with ordered archives which will be submitted to an appropriate repository.

During operation no residual significant effects on archaeological remains have been assessed.

During operation, with embedded mitigation in place but in the absence of essential mitigation, a Moderate significance of effect has been assessed for Dunkeld and Birnam Station Signal Box (Asset 16), a Large significance of effect for Dunkeld and Birnam Station, including Footbridge (Asset 26), and a Moderate significance of effect for Birnam Conservation Area (Asset 44).

No essential mitigation is proposed during operation for Dunkeld and Birnam Station Signal Box (Asset 16). The residual significance of effect for Asset 16 during operation has therefore been assessed to be Moderate adverse.

For Dunkeld and Birnam Station, including Footbridge (Asset 26) and Birnam Conservation Area (Asset 44), the embedded mitigation measures will be implemented in accordance with Mitigation Item P02-LV25 (Chapter 10 (Landscape)). After this essential mitigation the residual significance of effect for Dunkeld and Birnam Station, including Footbridge (Asset 26) during operation has been assessed to be Moderate adverse while during operation the residual significance of effect for Birnam Conservation Area (Asset 44) has also been assessed to be Moderate adverse.

During operation the measures identified to re-integrate Dunkeld and Birnam Station, including Footbridge (Asset 26) with Birnam Conservation Area (Asset 44), including increasing visual connectivity between the two cultural heritage resources, and a beneficial effect for operational noise, have been assessed to have a residual significance of effect of Slight beneficial for Dunkeld and Birnam Station, including Footbridge (Asset 26). During operation the measures identified to re-integrate Dunkeld and Birnam Station, including Footbridge (Asset 26) with Birnam Conservation Area (Asset 44), including increasing visual connectivity between the two cultural heritage resources, has also been assessed to have a residual significance of effect of Slight beneficial for Birnam Conservation Area (Asset 44).

No mitigation during operation is proposed for Murthly Castle GDL (HLT 14). The residual significance of effect for Murthly Castle GDL (HLT 14) during operation has therefore been assessed to be Moderate adverse.

With proposed mitigation, the overall effect on archaeological remains has been assessed to be of Neutral significance.

With proposed mitigation, the overall effect on historic buildings has been assessed to be of Moderate significance. A Slight beneficial impact on historic buildings has also been assessed.

With proposed mitigation, the overall effect on the historic landscape has been assessed to be of Moderate significance.

9.1 Introduction

9.1.1 This chapter presents the results of the cultural heritage assessment for the Design Manual for Roads and Bridges (DMRB) Stage 3 environmental assessment of the proposed scheme (see Chapter 6 (The Proposed Scheme)) under the three sub-topics of archaeological remains, historic buildings and the historic landscape. The appendices which support this chapter are presented in Volume 1 - Part 6 (Appendices) and comprise:

- Appendix A9.1: (Cultural Heritage Approach and Method);
- Appendix A9.2: (Cultural Heritage Baseline Information);
- Appendix A9.3: (Historic Environment Desk-based Assessment of Murthly Castle Garden and Designed Landscape (The Jessop Consultancy, 2022));
- Appendix A9.4: (LiDAR Analysis Report);
- Appendix A9.5: (A9 Dualling Programme: Pass of Birnam to Tay Crossing Geophysical Survey Report (Headland Archaeology, 2025); and
- Appendix A9.6: (Assessment of Non-Significant Cultural Heritage Effects).

9.2 Approach and Methods

9.2.1 Please refer to Appendix A9.1: (Cultural Heritage Approach and Methods) for details of relevant legislation, policy and best practice guidance, the approach to establishing the study area and baseline, assessment of value (sensitivity), impact magnitude, significance of effect and limitations to the assessment.

9.3 Baseline Conditions

Summary

9.3.1 From the sources identified in Appendix A9.2 (Cultural Heritage Baseline Information), a total of 270 cultural heritage resources were identified within the 200m study area. A further three cultural heritage resources located outside of the study area were included in the baseline due to the potential for impacts on their settings. The total number of cultural heritage resources assessed as part of the baseline is therefore 273, comprising 134 archaeological remains, 123 historic buildings and 16 historic landscape types.

9.3.2 A summary of the total number of cultural heritage resources and their value (sensitivity) is provided in Table 9.1.

Table 9.1: Total numbers of cultural heritage resources assessed as part of the baseline

Value (sensitivity)	Negligible	Low	Medium	High	Total
Subtopic					
Archaeological Remains	88	34	9	3	134

Value (sensitivity)	Negligible	Low	Medium	High	Total
Subtopic					
Historic Buildings	1	50	5	67	123
Historic Landscape Types	5	6	1	4	16
TOTAL	94	90	15	74	273

- 9.3.3 Baseline information on cultural heritage resources is provided in Appendix A9.2 (Cultural Heritage Baseline Information) and Appendix A9.3: (Historic Environment Desk-based Assessment of Murthly Castle Garden and Designed Landscape (The Jessop Consultancy, 2022)). The location of all cultural heritage resources included in the baseline are shown on Figure 9.1 (Archaeological Remains and Historic Buildings) and Figure 9.2 (Historic Landscape Types).
- 9.3.4 Baseline information on the cultural heritage resources for which significant effects have been assessed (Section 9.4) are summarised as follows.

Archaeological Remains

Dunkeld and Birnam Station, Goods Yard (Asset 832)

- 9.3.5 As well as providing access to passengers wishing to travel into the Highlands, from 1856 the Perth and Dunkeld Railway also serviced goods traffic between Perth and Dunkeld. Conceived as part of the original scheme for the terminus of the Perth and Dunkeld Railway at Birnam, the Dunkeld and Birnam Station, Goods Yard (Asset 832) required the construction of an embankment to raise ground levels to the north-east to enable access to the goods yard from the mainline. While the goods yard was largely removed by the construction of the existing A9, surviving remains comprise the goods yard embankment, sidings (Photograph 9.1), and a possible section of the former boundary wall on Station Road.
- 9.3.6 The key characteristics of Dunkeld and Birnam Station, Goods Yard (Asset 832) comprise the potential for any surviving associated archaeological remains to contribute to our understanding of the operation of a 19th century goods yard and its association with the Dunkeld and Birnam Station, including Footbridge (Asset 26), a Category A Listed Building. The value (sensitivity) of Asset 832 has been assessed to be medium.

Ladywell Enclosure (Asset 941)

- 9.3.7 Ladywell Enclosure (Asset 941) is the cropmark remains of a possible prehistoric enclosure visible on modern web-based aerial imagery. The key characteristics of Asset 941 include its physical remains and its potential to contribute to the understanding of prehistoric settlement in the region. In consideration of this, the value (sensitivity) of this cultural heritage resource has been assessed to be medium.

Geophysical Survey Area P02_05 (Asset 960)

- 9.3.8 Asset 960 comprises possible enclosures, pit-like anomalies, and sub-circular anomalies identified by archaeological geophysical survey in Geophysical Survey Area P02_05 (Headland Archaeology, 2025). Based on the interpretation that these are the remains of enclosures, possible round-houses and pits of prehistoric date the value (sensitivity) of this cultural heritage resource has been assessed to be medium.

Geophysical Survey Area P02_03

- 9.3.9 Identified by archaeological geophysical survey in Geophysical Survey Area P02_03, Asset 962 is the sub-circular anomaly approximately 20m in diameter (Headland Archaeology, 2025). Based on the interpretation that this is the remains of a small enclosure of prehistoric date the value (sensitivity) of this cultural heritage resource has been assessed to be medium.



Photograph 9.1: Two extant sidings forming part of the Dunkeld and Birnam Station, Goods Yard (Asset 832). Jacobs, 2015.

Historic Buildings

Dunkeld and Birnam Station, Signal Box (Asset 16)

- 9.3.10 Dunkeld and Birnam Station, Signal Box (Asset 16; Photograph 9.2), is a Category B Listed Building. Built in 1919 it is a typical brick-built structure conforming to a Highland Railway design employed from c.1900. Asset 16 is a rare example of a Highland Railway signal box of this design, the only other surviving example being that at Boat of Garten railway station (LB258; a Category B Listed Building). The signal box's setting, comprising its trackside location, intervisibility with Dunkeld and Birnam Station, including Footbridge (Asset 26; a Category A Listed Building), surviving semaphore signals and more modern railway infrastructure, contribute to value of this cultural heritage resource.

- 9.3.11 The key characteristics of the signal box are its architectural detail and features, including painted brick structure, weather-boarding and the multi-pane glazed windows of the operating room, its functional relationship with the Highland Main Line railway and its setting. As a Category B Listed Building, and association with Dunkeld and Birnam Station, Asset 16 has been assessed to be of high value (sensitivity).



Photograph 9.2: Dunkeld and Birnam Station, Signal Box (Asset 16) view looking south-east from the eastern end of Platform 1 at Dunkeld and Birnam Station, including Footbridge (Asset 26). Jacobs, 2018.

Dunkeld and Birnam Station, including Footbridge (Asset 26)

- 9.3.12 Dating to 1856 Dunkeld and Birnam Station, including Footbridge (Asset 26) (Photograph 9.3) is a Category A Listed Building. The architect was Andrew Heiton Junior. The station building retains much of its original design and many of its original features.
- 9.3.13 The Tudor Cottage style of the station building has been described as ‘*consciously picturesque*’ (Gifford, 2007). This style is reflected in:
- the high near-symmetrical multi-gables with weather veins and finials which, along with the tall chimneys, give additional height to the building;
 - the projecting central porch;
 - stone mullioned windows and modest decorative stonework including friezes; and
 - intricately carved wooden bargeboards.
- 9.3.14 Later elements include the station canopy, with cast-iron cherry decoration, and the latticed-sided footbridge (Photograph 9.4).
- 9.3.15 Largely built of locally-sourced squared and random blue/grey rubble whinstone, pale yellow sandstone is further employed in the modest decorative stonework. Detailing is also provided by carved wood, cast-iron and lead.

- 9.3.16 The materials and the colour palette are reflected in the use of similar materials for buildings and boundary treatments of the period elsewhere in Birnam, including along Station Road.



Photograph 9.3: View of Dunkeld and Birnam Station, including Footbridge (Asset 26), facing south. Jacobs, 2024.



Photograph 9.4: View of the cast-iron footbridge located to the south-east of the station and forming part of Asset 26, facing south-east. Jacobs, 2024.

- 9.3.17 Located within Birnam Conservation Area (Asset 44), the setting of Dunkeld and Birnam Station comprises:

- Its dramatic landscape context (Photograph 9.5). While views north are limited by existing roadside planting, the spectacular amphitheatre formed by the Tay Valley and natural grandeur and dramatic scenery of the forested hills that frame Birnam provide a dramatic landscape context for the station.
- Visual relationship between the station, Station Road and Birnam. Station Road previously provided a direct link from the station to the speculative developments along Perth Road which developed shortly after the arrival of the railway and which was the commercial centre of Birnam's Highland resort. However the existing A9 has severed this direct link, and roadside planting and the presence of Birnam Industrial Estate immediately to the north-east of the station means that there are only limited views (generally in winter) of historic buildings along Station Road and Birnam both from the station building entrance and from the footbridge.
- Former forecourt. The former approach to the station from Station Road terminated in an informal forecourt to the front (north) of the station. Due to the construction of the existing A9 and the existing car park, the former public forecourt is no longer legible.
- Elements of railway infrastructure comprising The Highland Main Line railway, the Dunkeld and Birnam Station Signal Box (Asset 16; a Category B Listed Building), semaphore signalling, the sidings, and more modern railway infrastructure.
- Existing A9. The existing A9, including visible road traffic and traffic noise, forms part of the setting of the station but does not make a positive contribution to its value. It also physically severs the station from Station Road and Birnam.



Photograph 9.5: The dramatic landscape setting of Dunkeld and Birnam Station, including Footbridge (Asset 26; a Category A Listed Building). Jacobs, 2018.

- 9.3.18 As the former terminus of the Perth and Dunkeld Railway, Dunkeld and Birnam Station, including Footbridge (Asset 26) contributes to the understanding of the rapid expansion of the national railway network from the mid-1850s. The mid-Victorian connection of Dunkeld and Birnam into the wider national railway network, led to the economic decline in the prosperity of Dunkeld and the rapid growth of Birnam as speculative investors took advantage of the village's proximity to the railway station to develop housing and businesses associated with it as a Highland resort following the opening of the railway.
- 9.3.19 The station's relationship with the economic and social history of Dunkeld and Birnam, particularly the rapid expansion of facilities to support the Highland tourism industry, including hotels and guesthouses, illustrates the social changes occurring from the mid-19th century onwards. The growth of the middleclass and an increase in leisure time, and quicker and cheaper travel due to the expansion of the national rail network, provided opportunities for people to holiday in a once remote area, such as the Highlands, which before had only been possible by the wealthy.
- 9.3.20 With a design that is both functional and reflects the local contemporary building style as well as the station's status as the terminus of the Perth and Dunkeld Railway, Asset 26 is also an example of Scottish railway architecture by known local architect, Andrew Heiton Junior. The associative value derived from this connection adds to the interest of the station.

9.3.21 The key characteristics of Dunkeld and Birnam Station, including Footbridge (Asset 26) therefore comprise its outstanding architectural interest articulated through the completeness of design and the quality of its architectural features, the setting of the station, rarity as an almost complete example of a Victorian railway station, its social historical interest as a former terminus station, access point to the mid-Victorian Highland resort of Dunkeld and Birnam and gateway to the Highlands, and association with a renowned architect. In consideration of this, and its designation as a Category A Listed Building, the value (sensitivity) of Asset 26 has been assessed to be high.

Birnam Conservation Area (Asset 44)

9.3.22 The townscape character assessment undertaken for the proposed scheme (Appendix A10.2: (Townscape Character)), identified four Townscape Character Areas (TCA) within Birnam:

- TCA B1 – Birnam Conservation Area (north of existing A9);
- TCA B2 – Birnam Conservation Area (south of existing A9);
- TCA B3 – Erigmore Estate Leisure Park; and
- TCA B4 – South-East Corner of Birnam.

9.3.23 Of these four TCAs, TCA B1 and TCA B2 make up Birnam Conservation Area (Asset 44). Descriptive details of TCA B1 and TCA B2 from the townscape character assessment, which has been revised to include information relevant to the cultural heritage of the Conservation Area, are provided in Tables 9.2 and 9.3.

Table 9.2: TCA B1 – Birnam Conservation Area (north of the existing A9)

Townscape Attributes	Description
Key Characteristics	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Mid- to late-19th century village with a Victorian feel. The core of the village is characterised by a collection of substantial grey stone buildings along Perth Road (the former A9). Some examples of mid- and late-20th century housing are also visible within the area. Thirty-six Category B and C Listed Buildings. ▪ Key buildings within the area include the Birnam Arts & Conference Centre (Asset 885), The Birnam Hotel & Inn, a Category B Listed Building (Asset 64) and St. Mary's Church, a Category B Listed Building (Asset 46).
Positive Character Attributes	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Hedges and other garden vegetation soften the streetscape along Perth Road and contribute towards the green infrastructure of the area. ▪ The stonework and architectural details of the Victorian era buildings along Perth Road contribute towards the visual interest of the area. The Birnam Arts & Conference Centre (completed in 2001) is also an attractive architectural focal point, featuring a combination of timber clad and stone exterior, with street trees

Townscape Attributes	Description
	and planting at the interface between the building and Station Road.
Negative Character Attributes	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ The existing A9 and associated traffic are clearly visible from Core Path DUNK/11. ▪ Traffic on the existing A9 is also visible in filtered views looking south through roadside trees from Station Road and Gladstone Terrace.
Value	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Townscape quality (condition): Stonework and architectural details of buildings along Perth Road provide visual interest. The Birnam Arts & Conference Centre (completed in 2001) is also an attractive architectural focal point. ▪ Scenic quality: Vistas from the area are towards the wooded slopes of the wider surrounding landscape. Birnam Hill forms a backdrop to views looking south and Craig a Barns closes the view looking north-west along Perth Road. ▪ Rarity: The high quality of the architecture and the picturesque setting are in many ways unique. ▪ Representativeness: Architectural style along Perth Road is characteristic of the Victorian era. ▪ Conservation/cultural interest: Mid- to late 19th century village with a Victorian feel. Thirty-six Category B and C Listed Buildings. ▪ Recreational value: Core Path DUNK/10 provides a scenic riverside walk through AWI riparian woodland along the southern bank of the River Tay. ▪ Perceptual aspects: Sense of tranquillity associated with green space and landscape setting and visual interest associated with architectural details. ▪ Associations: The Birnam area has strong cultural associations with Beatrix Potter who spent her childhood holidays there, and who is celebrated in the publicly accessible Beatrix Potter Garden (Asset 57), a tranquil green space situated behind the Birnam Arts & Conference Centre. The Birnam Oak is located to the north of the area, accessible via Core Path DUNK/10.

Table 9.3: TCA B2 – Birnam Conservation Area (south of the existing A9)

Townscape Attributes	Description
Key Characteristics	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Low density residential area comprising listed mid-Victorian villas with large, secluded wooded gardens.

Townscape Attributes	Description
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Mid-19th century Dunkeld and Birnam Station, including Footbridge (Asset 26) (a Category A Listed Building) enriches the character of the area. The area has historically been separated from the rest of the village of Birnam by the Highland Main Line railway, and later by the existing A9. The area is accessible via Birnam Glen (Core Path DUNK/11), linking the area with Birnam TCA B1 via an underpass below the existing A9.
Positive Character Attributes	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The wooded north-facing slope of King's Seat/Birnam Hill (to the immediate south of the area) is easily accessible via Core Path DUNK/11. A 30m wide strip of native woodland separates and partially screens the residential properties from the Highland Main Line railway.
Negative Character Attributes	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The existing A9 and associated traffic are clearly visible from Dunkeld and Birnam Station and sever the station from Station Road and Birnam. The existing A9 and associated traffic are partially visible from residential properties in filtered views through intervening vegetation.
Value	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Townscape quality (condition). Category B and C listed villas of mid-19th century date (Assets 14, 15, 17, 18, 19 and 22) with large, secluded wooded gardens and the Category A listed Dunkeld and Birnam Station, including Footbridge (Asset 26). Scenic quality: Vistas from the area are towards the wooded slopes of the wider surrounding landscape. Rarity: The high quality of the architecture and the picturesque setting are in many ways unique. Representativeness: The architecture is characteristic of the Victorian era. Conservation/cultural interest: Mid-Victorian railway station (a Category A Listed Building dating to 1856) is a key focal point. Recreational value: Birnam Hill accessible via Core Path DUNK/11. Perceptual aspects: Sense of tranquillity associated with green space and landscape setting. Associations: Writers and artists have been historically attracted to the surrounding landscape.

- 9.3.24 The setting of Birnam Conservation Area (Asset 44) is defined by its riverside location to the south of the River Tay in the wider topographic bowl of the amphitheatre formed by the Tay Valley. While outward views are limited by the historic buildings and dense woodland, views along principal streets, such as Perth Road, contribute to the appreciation of Asset 44. The relationship between the buildings and coherence of the streetscape, as well as the historic relationship with the development of the railway and Highland tourism, also contribute to the architectural and social historical interest of Asset 44.
- 9.3.25 The key characteristics of this cultural heritage resource include its architectural interest articulated through the variety of Victorian building stock which, while making use of similar, locally sourced materials exemplify a range of architectural styles, its setting, and association with the Perth and Dunkeld Railway.
- 9.3.26 Birnam Conservation Area (Asset 44) has been assessed to be of medium value (sensitivity).

Auchlou, Inver (Asset 793)

- 9.3.27 Auchlou, Inver (Asset 793; Photograph 9.6) is a much-altered 19th century cottage which may have once formed part of the group of buildings associated with the Ferry Inn (Site of) (Asset 887; Appendix A9.2: (Cultural Heritage Baseline Information)) now severed from Inver by the existing A9. Of limited architectural interest, but as an example of building types whose key characteristics, articulated as their surviving 19th and 20th century architectural details and features, demonstrate local and regional building types and the use of locally sourced materials, Auchlou, Inver (Asset 793) has been assessed to be of low value (sensitivity).



Photograph 9.6: View of Auchlou, Inver (Asset 793), facing west. Jacobs 2024.

Inver Wood, Bridge (Asset 931)

- 9.3.28 Inver Wood, Bridge (Asset 931; Photograph 9.7) is a small, single arch, rubble stone bridge crossing a minor unnamed watercourse. The bridge has two low, parallel parapets with horizontal copes which are turned through a quadrant and carried down to the ground at the ends of the parapet walls. It is likely to be a 19th century parliamentary bridge. The bridge is on a former section of road (Asset 932; Appendix A9.2: (Cultural Heritage Baseline Information)), immediately to the west of the existing A9. Its key characteristics comprise its simple, functional architectural features which contribute to its architectural interest and the limited contribution this cultural heritage resource makes to the understanding of the development of the local road network. Therefore, the value (sensitivity) of Asset 931 has been assessed to be low.



Photograph 9.7: View of Inver Wood, Bridge (Asset 931), facing east. Jacobs, 2024.

Historic Landscapes

Murthly Castle Garden and Designed Landscape (GDL) (HLT 14)

- 9.3.29 Murthly Castle Garden and Designed Landscape (GDL) (HLT 14) is recorded on the Inventory of Gardens and Designed Landscapes. The Key Landscape Features (KLF) (the natural landscape features that influenced the landscape design of Murthly Castle GDL), and the Special Features (F) (the design elements including planting, land-forming (for example creating artificial slopes), built structures, open ground and water management which form part of the landscape design) are summarised in Table 9.4 and are shown on Figure 9.3.

- 9.3.30 A detailed description of the history and baseline of Murthly Castle GDL (HLT 14) is presented in Appendix A9.3 (Historic Environment Desk-based Assessment of Murthly Castle Garden and Designed Landscape (The Jessop Consultancy, 2022)). The summary below focuses on the Key Landscape Features, Special Features, Key Views and Sightlines, and Historical Views as these for the basis assessment of effect in accordance with Managing Change in the Historic Environment: Gardens and Designed Landscapes (Historic Environment Scotland, 2020). As these contribute to the artistic, historical, horticultural, architectural, archaeological, scenic and nature conservation interests of Murthly Castle GDL (HLT 14), they in turn inform the assessment of value (sensitivity).
- 9.3.31 Please note that in Tables 9.4 – 9.7 the Key Landscape Feature (KLF) number, Special Feature (F) number, Key Views and Sightlines and Historic Views references from Appendix A9.3 and the URN numbers from Appendix A9.4 have been retained to enable the baseline information summarised in these tables to be related to that in Appendix A9.3 and Appendix A9.4.

Table 9.4: Summary of the Key Landscape Features (KLF) and Special Features (F) of Murthly Castle GDL (HLT 14)

Key Landscape Features and Special Features	Summary Description
The Knoll (KLF-1)	<p>The Knoll is a low hill partially enclosed by the southern bend in the River Tay (part of KLF-5). One of the reasons that the Category A listed Murthly Castle (F1.02) was located on The Knoll was likely to take advantage of its elevated, defensible position.</p> <p>As a result of the location of Murthly Castle (F1.02), the earliest (c. 1660-1759) phase of the development of the GDL was located on and around The Knoll. Comprising a formal design influenced by the Dutch style popular at the time, Special Features associated with this design include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> the 16th/17th century Category A listed Chapel of St Antony the Eremite (F1.05); The Dead Walk (F1.15), originally planted between c.1321 and 1471 and replanted after 1825; the 17th/18th century Category A Listed Walled Garden (F1.03) and Garden House (F1.11); and the early 18th century Lime Avenue (F1.23) of which Tree nos. 010 and 11 are likely to be part. <p>These features would have formed the Pleasure Ground, designed for the use of the owners of Murthly Castle.</p> <p>As the location of Murthly Castle, The Knoll provided the focus for the later surrounding policies. Policies are the improved land surrounding a Scottish country house. Developed from the 1750s to the late 1820s at Murthly Castle the policies took the form of the system of ha-has (sunken walls) which were used to create uninterrupted views across newly created parkland, the planting of</p>

Key Landscape Features and Special Features	Summary Description
	<p>policy woodland and the creation of drives. The result was a more naturalistic landscape replacing the formality of the earlier designed landscape. Remnants of woodland from this period can be seen along the west side of the pleasure ground to the north of Murthly Castle and include Tree nos.016 and 017, and in the policies (for example Tree no.225, Tree no.256, Tree no.265, Tree no.271, and Tree no.272).</p> <p>In the 19th century Murthly New Castle (F1.04; now destroyed) was also located on The Knoll. Designed by the influential architect James Gillespie Graham, the construction of Murthly New Castle (F1.04) to the south of Murthly Castle (F1.02) in the early 1830s represented a significant phase in the development of the designed landscape in the Picturesque idiom. The landscape architect John Wallace was appointed to supervise the landscaping around Murthly New Castle and it was Wallace who designed the Triple Avenue (F1.16) which ran from Murthly New Castle towards Malakoff Arch (F3.10; now destroyed).</p>
The Ridge (KLF-2)	<p>Aligned east to west The Ridge is located between the floodplain of the River Tay to the north and the higher level ground forming the Muir of Thorn (KLF-3) to the south. The Ridge defined the southern boundary of the policies of Murthly Castle, and areas of commercial plantations and the ornamental farmland to the south.</p> <p>The Malakoff Arch (F3.10; now demolished) was an ornamental triumphal arch erected in 1857 by Sir William Drummond Stewart to commemorate the bravery of his son in the Crimean War. It was located on The Ridge. It likely that The Triple Avenue (F1.16) was designed to create a vista from Murthly New Castle (F1.04; now demolished) to the now demolished arch and to allow views between the two.</p>
The Muir of Thorn (KLF-3)	<p>A large level plateau, which was formerly an area of bog, located to the south of The Ridge (KLF-2). Following the purchase of the land at the Muir of Thorn in 1819 coniferous plantations were quickly planted, however it was Sir William Drummond Stewart who oversaw the creation of areas of ornamental farmland between c.1855 and 1857.</p> <p>Combining the practical with the aesthetic, the ornamental farmland is characterised by amorphous shaped enclosures defined by ha-has and stone walls (F3.11). These enclosures were later surrounded by commercial coniferous plantations mainly of Douglas Fir and Pine.</p>
Gellyburn (KLF-4)	<p>After it leaves the Muir of Thorn, Gellyburn meanders north-eastwards towards the River Tay. It forms part of the eastern boundary of the GDL and a carriageway (F3.02) follows its course.</p>

Key Landscape Features and Special Features	Summary Description
The River Tay and floodplain (KLF-5)	<p>The southern bend in the River Tay partially provides the setting and the northern, north-northeastern and north-northwestern boundary for the 17th, 18th and early 19th century designed landscape that remains at the core of the GDL.</p> <p>The River Tay also contributed to the naturalistic and picturesque qualities of the GDL, which were exploited in the 19th century, providing views across the river and influencing the location of Special Features, such as the balustrade (F2.28), designed to exploit those views.</p> <p>The steep sided southern bank of the River Tay enabled the construction of drives and paths (for example River Walk (F2.54)) along the extended river frontage.</p> <p>As one of the most productive salmon rivers in Scotland the River Tay also provided recreational opportunities, which are evident in features such as East Fishing Lodge (F2.35) which has an associated highly ornamental fountain (F2.36).</p>
The Pass of Birnam (KLF-6)	<p>The Pass of Birnam where it narrows and is constrained by the steep rocky lower slopes of the higher ground to the south-west and the River Tay to the north-east has been described as the '<i>gateway to the Highlands</i>'. The change from lowland to highland landscape as you entered the Pass of Birnam, via the Western Drive (F2.69 and F2.71) which linked Murthly Castle to Birnam would have provided a dramatic contrast.</p>
Duncan's Hill and Birnam Hill (KLF-7)	<p>In addition to providing a dramatic backdrop in views to the west from Murthly Castle and from within the policies, Birnam Hill provided an elevated position against the dramatic backdrop of the Highlands from which visitors could view Murthly Castle and the Perthshire lowlands to the east and south-east.</p> <p>Drives or rides such as F4.04 on Birnam Hill led to the Category C listed Stair Bridge (F4.05) and then up to the King's Seat via a zig zag stepped path with viewing seats at the top (F4.14). These walks and narrow drives had seats along the route (such as F4.12) and there is a feature that is interpreted as a drinking trough or pool for horses (F4.13).</p> <p>It is likely that the landscape architect John Wallace was responsible for the development of the plantations on Birnam Hill in about 1832. While forming an important part of the economy of the estate, the locations of these also suggest that they were designed to contribute to the wider character of the GDL.</p> <p>Duncan's Camp (F4.03) is a small hillfort, potentially dating to the Iron Age and Early Historic Period. The interior contains three small sections of drystone wall and a connecting wall on the south, built</p>

Key Landscape Features and Special Features	Summary Description
	<p>c.1867 by Sir William Drummond Stewart. These embellishments were added to Duncan's Camp to take advantage of the views, which include a view of Murthly Castle and the policies, the Highlands, and across the Perthshire Lowlands (View 11 in Table 9.5). These additions may also have increased the visibility of Duncan's Camp from Murthly Castle to the north-east and Stair Bridge to the south-west (Views 1 and 13 in Table 9.5).</p> <p>Dating to the 16th century, Rohallion Castle (F4.18) is located below King's Seat on the edge of a high terrace and has views to the north, east and north-west along the Tay Valley (View 15 in Table 9.5).</p> <p>Duncan's Hill was also partially enclosed in c.1839 to form the Buffalo Park (F4.11). Defined by a stone boundary wall with raised metal stays supporting a wire fence, the Buffalo Park enclosed approximately 49 hectares for a herd of buffalo. Linked to the Buffalo Park was an elevated terrace and wall (F4.07) which was linked to a carriage drive (F4.08) leading down to Bee Cottage (F4.09), a Category B Listed Building, and then later extended to Rohallion Lodge (F4.10), a Category B Listed Building. Adjacent to the terrace is the Category B Listed Buffalo Hut (F4.06), an ornamental building. The view from The Buffalo Hut towards Murthly Castle has been identified as a Key View and Sightline (View 16 in Table 9.5).</p> <p>In addition to reflecting the fashion for things American at this time, the Buffalo Park also reflects the personal experiences of the then owner Sir William Drummond Stewart, derived from his travels in North America between 1832 and 1838.</p>
Keppie Wood, Byres Wood and other areas of ancient (of semi-natural origin) woodland (KLF-8)	The areas of ancient (of semi-natural origin) woodland recorded by the Ancient Woodland Inventory within or partially within Murthly Garden GDL (HLT 14).
Birnam Burn (KLF-9)	The rugged picturesque qualities of the natural gorge formed by the Birnam Burn were exploited and enhanced as part of the early-19th century landscape design, for example through the construction of the Roman Bridge (F2.10) across the gorge on the main drive (F2.66 and F2.71) between Birnam and Murthly Castle
The Valley (KLF-10)	A wooded narrow valley created by an unnamed water course aligned south-west/north-east from below the ridge at Colryden Lodge (F3.21), a Category B Listed Building, onto the floodplain of the River Tay to the south-west of Murthly Castle.

Key Landscape Features and Special Features	Summary Description
Special Features	Summary Description
Built Structures	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Murthly Castle (F1.02), associated Walled Garden (F1.03), Garden House (F1.11), and St Antony Eremite Chapel (F1.05). ▪ Bridges: Bridge over Birnam Burn to the south of Roman Bridge (F2.09), Roman Bridge (F2.10), Stair Bridge (F4.05), Unnamed Bridges (F1.01, F2.14, F2.21 and Asset 951). ▪ Buffalo Hut (F4.06). ▪ Formal gates including East Gates (F2.01), pyramidal gate piers in consistent Murthly Estate style (F2.17, F2.20, F3.01, F3.12, F3.13, F3.14, F3.15, F3.16, F3.17, F3.18, and F4.01). ▪ Lodges comprising East Lodge Murthly Castle (F2.02), East Fishing Lodge (F2.35), Ringwood Lodge (F2.67), Unnamed Lodge (F2.68), Colryden Lodge (F3.21), Kingswood Lodge (F3.23), and Rohallion Lodge (F4.10). ▪ Cottages, some of which are executed in the estate style, comprising Chapel House (F2.03), Newtyle Cottage (F2.05), Cottage at the former Gasworks (F2.06), Unnamed Cottage (F2.07), Kingswood Cottage (F2.08) and Bee Cottage (F4.09). ▪ Farmsteads: (F3.19) and Byres of Murthly (F3.22). ▪ Other buildings including outbuilding to the rear of Dalpowie Hospital (F2.11) and garden (F2.33), the remains of an unnamed building (F2.42), and Bradyston (F3.27). ▪ Other landscape features such as terraces, ha-has, walls, banks, cascades, seats, steps, look-outs/platforms/possible viewpoints, drinking fountains, and pools (F1.07, F1.08, F1.09, F1.10, F1.12, F1.14, F1.19, F1.20, F1.22, F1.24, F1.25, F2.12, F2.13, F2.15, F2.18, F2.22, F2.23, F2.25, F2.27, F2.28, F2.29, F2.30, F2.31, F2.36, F2.38, F2.44, F2.50, F2.51, F4.02, F4.12, F4.13, and F4.14).
Archaeological Sites	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Murthly Castle Standing Stone 300m SSW of Castle (F2.65), Duncan's Camp (F4.03), Rohallion Castle (F4.18), Staredam Standing Stones (F4.19), and the former site of a 19th century toll house (F3.24). ▪ The former sites of Murthly New Castle (site of) (F1.04) and Malakoff Arch (F3.10).
Gardens	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Attributed to the landscape architect John Wallace, American Garden (remains of) (F2.59) established in the 1830s reflects the fashion for American Gardens during this period and the personal experiences and collections of Sir William Drummond Stewart, derived from his travels in North America between 1832 and 1838.

Key Landscape Features and Special Features	Summary Description
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The site of the Old Kitchen Garden (F2.61), and Octagonal Kitchen Garden (F2.56).
Formal drives, avenues and paths	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Avenues such as Lawson Row (F1.13), The Dead Walk (F1.15), The Triple Avenue (F1.16), The Araucaria Avenue (F1.18), The East Avenue (F1.21), The Lime Avenue (F1.23), an unnamed Avenue (F2.24) and Lime Tree Avenue (F2.47). Carriage Drives (F3.02, F3.06, F3.09, F3.25, F4.04, and F4.08). Drives and possible drives comprising F2.19, F2.26, the Route to Chapel House (F2.45), West Carriage Drive (F2.66), Western Drive (F2.69), Copper Beech Avenue (F2.70), Western Drive (Cedar Avenue) (F2.71), Unnamed drives (F3.07, F3.08, and URN 85). Paths including F1.06, the River Walk (F2.54) and URN 68/76/86. Cuttings and embankments associated with the above comprising F2.16 and F2.34. Trackways including URN 60, URN 65, and URN 74.
Plantations	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Dating to the 19th and 20th centuries plantations comprise The Pinetum (F1.17), Netherwood (F2.48), Broadarthur Wood (F2.49), Byres Wood (F2.55), Branders Hill (F2.57), and Ringwood (URN 92).
Parkland	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 23 Acre (F2.37), Chapel Park (F2.46), Meadow Park (F2.52), Newtyle Park (F2.53), Dovecot Park (F2.58), 26 Acre (F2.60), 15 Acre (F2.62), Washinghouse Park (F2.63), and Buffalo Park (F4.11) (with associated stone wall with gate F4.07). Many of the areas of parkland that form the policies around Murthly Castle are divided from each other and from the pleasure ground around Murthly Castle by ha-has. Former parkland at Ringwood Plantation (URN 93).
Enclosures	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Enclosures dating to the mid-19th century (F3.11)
Other	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Curling Ponds (F2.32 and F4.20), Meadow Bog Curling Pond and associated Club House (F2.40 and F2.39), 23 Acre Park Pond (F2.64), a Mill pond (F3.26), ponds (F4.16 and F4.17), quarries (F2.04, F3.03, and F4.15) and the remains of an ornate fence (F2.41). Located adjacent to Gellyburn (KLF-4), quarry (F3.03) was incorporated into the designed landscape by being converted into an ornamental quarry garden.

9.3.32 A total of 16 Key Views and Sightlines have been identified. These are presented in Table 9.5 and are shown on Figure 9.4.

Table 9.5: Murthly Castle GDL (HLT 14) Key Views and Sightlines

View and Sightlines	Summary Description
View 1: From Murthly Castle towards Birnam Hill (KLF-7) and the Pass of Birnam (KLF-6)	A ridge of high land, The Ridge (KLF-2), runs along the southern edge of the policies limiting the potential views from Murthly Castle (F1.02) to the south. Such views would have been further reduced between 1829 and 1949 by the presence of Murthly New Castle, and vistas therefore predominately look out towards Birnam Hill and Duncan's Camp (F4.03) to the west. View 1 is still representative of the intended view towards the Pass of Birnam, with minimal secondary growth from planting and vegetation (Appendix A9.3, Figure 5.1).
View 2: From Murthly Castle towards the Chapel of St Anthony the Ermite	The view looking north from Murthly Castle (F1.02) towards the Chapel of St Anthony the Ermite (F1.05) emphasised the link between the two buildings. It should be noted that the view is directed towards the secondary phase of the Church from 1843. This view is still representative of the intended view (Appendix A9.3, Figure 5.2).
View 3: From the site of Murthly New Castle looking towards the site of the Malakoff Arch	The view from the site of Murthly New Castle (F1.04) follows the main vista south towards The Ridge (KLF-2), and it was likely that the view of Murthly Castle would have been restricted by the higher topography of The Ridge. The Triple Avenue (F1.16) focuses the view towards The Ridge and the former site of the Malakoff Arch (F3.10). This view is still representative of the intended alignment of the historical view although with the removal of the Malakoff Arch its focal point has been lost (Appendix A9.3, Figure 5.3).
View 4: View from the site of the former Malakoff Arch looking towards the site of Murthly New Castle	The view looking south from the site of the Malakoff Arch (F3.10) towards the site of Murthly New Castle (F1.04), was the subject of numerous photographs reproduced as postcards. This view is still representative of the intended vista although the focal point of this view is now Murthly Castle (F1.02) rather than the now removed Murthly New Castle (F1.04) (Appendix A9.3, Figure 5.4).
View 5: From the River Tay (KLF-5) towards the Chapel of St Antony the Ermite	The view looking south is directed from the apex of the meander in the River Tay (KLF-5) towards The Knoll (KLF-1) and the Chapel of St Antony the Ermite (F1.05). This view is still representative of the intended view (Appendix A9.3, Figure 5.5).
View 6: From the East Entrance Gates along the Lime Avenue	The view looking due west from the East Gates (F2.01) represents the current principal approach to Murthly Castle and the formal entrance to Murthly Castle GDL which was created c.1848-1858. The view is framed by The Lime Avenue (F2.47) and is illustrative of the enormous scale of the Murthly Castle GDL. It is considered to be the most significant view. When standing in front of the East Gates the trees and drive appear to be endless and the effect was clearly intended to impress the visitor and then draw them into the heart of

View and Sightlines	Summary Description
	the policies and north-south axis with its vista (View 4) leading down to Murthly New Castle. This view is still representative of the intended view (Appendix A9.3, Figure 5.6).
View 7: From the Malakoff Arch towards Murthly Castle	This view has been partially lost since the demolition of the Malakoff Arch (F3.10) with its former elevated position on top of The Ridge (KLF-2), however this view was intended to provide a long view towards Murthly New Castle as a focal point. The introduction of the railway and new planting has impacted upon the overall legibility of views from the arch. This view is still representative of the intended alignment of the historical view although since the removal of Murthly New Castle its focus is now Murthly Castle (Appendix A9.3, Figure 5.7).
View 8: From the site of Malakoff Arch towards the Muir of Thorn (KLF-3)	This view has been lost since the demolition of the Malakoff Arch (F3.10), however, was intended to provide a long linear view to the south along the principal north-south axis through the landscape and out over the Muir of Thorn (KLF-3). This view has been lost, although its alignment is still partially evident by logging tracks.
View 9: From the Balustrade overlooking the River Tay (KLF-5)	A short view across the river looking north, but enhanced by the decorative nature of the low parapet wall with raised piers forming The Balustrade (F2.28). The view is framed by dense planting on either side. This view is still representative of the intended view (Appendix A9.3, Figure 5.8).
View 10: Overlooking the Birnam Burn (KLF-9) (east bank) as it flows into the River Tay (KLF-5)	The viewpoint is on top of a stone revetment located high above the outflow of the Birnam Burn (KLF-9) which would have had impressive views over and along the River Tay (KLF-5) in all directions to the north, west and east and then back towards the Roman Bridge (F2.10) to the south. This is an important view that forms part of the development of this section of the Murthly Castle GDL in the second half of the 19th century. This view is obscured by self-seeded trees and dense vegetation (Appendix A9.3, Figure 5.9).
View 11: From Duncan's Camp towards Murthly Castle	Duncan's Camp (F4.03) is an archaeological feature within the Murthly Castle GDL and the fact that in c.1867 Sir William Drummond Stewart embellished the walls suggests that it was considered to be a visible feature within the landscape, but also to provide a long distance view of Murthly Castle to the north-east. This view is still representative of the intended view, although the form and character of Duncan's Camp is obscured by bracken in the summer months (Appendix A9.3, Figure 5.10).
View 12: From King's Steps along the Tay Valley, towards Murthly Castle	At the top of a winding path (a possible narrow drive/ride) are a series of steps (F4.14) leading to King's Seat. At the top level of the path is a low retaining wall and a series of stone seats, which provide impressive views along the Tay Valley, Murthly Castle and a huge

View and Sightlines	Summary Description
	sweep of the Perthshire Lowlands. This view is still representative of the intended historical view (Appendix A9.3, Figure 5.11).
View 13: From Stair Bridge towards Murthly Castle	Following the upper slopes of Birnam Hill at the point where the Birnam Burn (KLF-9) cuts through the hillside is the Stair Bridge (F4.05). Historic mapping and comparison of other Special Features such as the Buffalo Hut (F4.06) suggest this viewpoint was created sometime between 1825 and 1855. This is not only the period during which Wallace was working on the policies, but it was also associated with the construction of Rohallion Lodge (Fraser, 1868). This view is still representative of the intended view (Appendix A9.3, Figure 5.13).
View 14: From Stone Seat	To the north of the Stair Bridge (F4.05) on the side of the path is a stone seat (F4.12) built into the hillside, orientated to provide a view towards the west across Rohallion Lodge (F4.10) and Duncan's Hill (F4.03). The viewpoint was developed in the 19th century to enable the appreciation of this dramatic setting, with a wide view towards Murthly Castle, the Tay Valley and along the Pass of Birnam. This view is obscured by self-seeded trees and vegetation (Appendix A9.3, Figure 5.14).
View 15: From Rohallion Castle along the Tay Valley towards Murthly Castle	From the hilltop location of the ruins of Rohallion Castle (F4.18) the natural topography provides a commanding vista along the Tay Valley to the east and across to Murthly Castle. Rohallion Castle was sighted in a prominent location to look out over the landscape, but also to act as a focal point on the skyline. This view is still representative of the intended view.
View 16: From The Buffalo Hut towards Murthly Castle	At the Buffalo Hut (F4.06) is a raised terrace with crenelations, identical to those to the parapet of the Stair Bridge (F4.05) and as such are stylistically considered to be a contemporary element of the expansion of this part of the GDL in the 19th century. This part of the Murthly Castle GDL appears to have had a degree of importance attached to it by Sir William Drummond Stewart who, in c.1855, commissioned two paintings from this natural vantage point above the Pass of Birnam to investigate the impact of the proposed railway on the landscape. This view is still representative of the intended view (Appendix A9.3, Figure 5.15).

9.3.33 In addition, six Historic Views (i.e. views that are depicted in paintings and other illustrations) have been identified. These are presented in Table 9.6 and shown on Figure 9.4. For more information on Historic Views please refer to Section 5 of Appendix A9.3.

Table 9.6: Murthly Castle GDL (HLT 14): Historic Views

Historic View	Summary Description (from the Jessop Consultancy, 2022)
Historic View A: From The Old Military Road, Carpath towards Birnam Hill	This view is depicted on <i>Old Murthly Castle</i> by T.H. Shepherd (see Appendix A9.3, Figure 5.16) and shows a stylised view looking north-west from the Old Military Road, Carpath, with long distance views towards Birnam Hill (KLF-7) and the Pass of Birnam (KLF-6), from the north side of the River Tay (KLF-5) near Carpath. Murthly Castle (F1.02) is depicted, framed by trees, looking out towards the River Tay. This view is now obscured by self-seeded trees and dense vegetation.
Historic View B: View looking east along the Pass of Birnam towards Murthly Castle	<i>Murthly Castle D.O. Hill</i> , published by Thomas Hill, Perth (see Appendix A9.3, Figure 5.17) presents the view looking east across the western polices towards the River Tay (KLF-5) through the Pass of Birnam (KLF-6) towards Murthly Castle (F1.02). Like Historic View A, Historic View B uses artistic licence to emphasise the castle's location. This view is obscured by trees, dense vegetation and the route of the existing A9.
Historic View C: From the junction of the west carriage drive and 'Grand' triple avenue south of the Murthly New Castle	An untitled print published c.1845 (see Appendix A9.3, Figure 5.18) presents an unknown artist's impression of a visitor's view of the completed Murthly New Castle (F1.04) as they approached the turn into The Triple Avenue (F1.16) from western carriage drive (F2.66). The image shows the newly planted avenue of trees. Whilst this view no-longer includes Murthly New Castle (F1.04), views across the parkland towards Murthly Castle (F1.02) have been maintained.
Historic View D: From the eastern policies looking west towards Murthly New Castle	A photograph of c.1850 (see Appendix A9.3, Figure 5.19), depicts the view looking north-west towards Murthly New Castle from Meadow Park (F2.52). The photograph shows the domination of Murthly New Castle in the landscape, and The Triple Avenue (F1.16) aligned north/south. Whilst this view no-longer includes Murthly New Castle, views across the parkland towards the site of Murthly New Castle (F1.04) have been maintained.
Historic View E: From north bank of the River Tay near Carpath looking west towards Murthly Castle GDL (HTL 14)	This untitled painting by an unknown artist (see Appendix A9.3, Figure 5.20), presents a stylised view looking west towards Murthly New Castle (F1.04) and Murthly Castle (F1.02), within the designed landscape framed against long distance views towards Birnam Hill (KLF-7), the Pass of Birnam (KLF-6) and the Highlands beyond. Murthly New Castle is portrayed as per the original, more grandiose plans, which were never fully realised. Whilst this view no-longer includes Murthly New Castle, views across the parkland towards the site of Murthly New Castle (F1.04) have been maintained.
Historic View F: From Birnam Wood east towards Murthly Castle	In his painting of 1891 titled <i>From Birnam Wood to Dunsinane</i> (see Appendix A9.3, Figure 5.21), the artist David Farquharson presented the view looking east from Birnam Hill towards Murthly Castle (F1.02). There is an emphasis of the painting is on the landscape

Historic View	Summary Description (from the Jessop Consultancy, 2022)
	rather than Murthly Castle. While the painting lacks detail the colours used by Farquharson suggest broadleaf woodland rather than conifers, however this is likely to be a romanticised view, as the policy woodland of Murthly Castle GDL is likely to have been dominated by conifer plantations at this time. Whilst this view no longer includes Murthly New Castle, views across the Murthly Castle GDL have been maintained.

- 9.3.34 Table 9.7 provides a summary of how the Key Landscape Features, Significant Features, Views and Sightlines contribute to the artistic, historical, horticultural, architectural, archaeological, scenic and nature conservation interests of Murthly Castle GDL (HLT 14), which form the basis for the designation of the GDL (please refer to the inventory description (HES, n.d.) and Annex 3 of Designation Policy and Selection Guidance (HES, 2019)). More information on the artistic, historical, horticultural, architectural, archaeological, scenic and nature conservation interests of Murthly Castle GDL (HLT 14) is presented in Section 7 of Appendix A9.3.

Table 9.7: Summary of the artistic, historical, horticultural, architectural, archaeological, scenic and nature conservation interests of Murthly Castle GDL (HLT 14)

Interest	Summary (from The Jessop Consultancy, 2022)
Artistic Interest (This refers to the design of a garden and designed landscape as is currently evident)	<p>Murthly Castle GDL has a long history of appreciation of its artistic interest with the landscape and buildings at Murthly the inspiration for artists and images of the castle and landscape appearing in numerous paintings, engravings, sketches and photographs. In addition John Everett Millais' family rented Birnam Hall (Dalpowie) on a succession of annual leases from 1882 and painted numerous pictures of the Murthly Estate.</p> <p>No one landscape designer has been identified as being responsible for the creation of Murthly Castle GDL, but the designed landscape is the result of numerous periods of change largely undertaken in the 18th and 19th centuries influenced by known individuals such as John Wallace and its owners, particularly Sir William Drummond Stewart.</p> <p>As identified in Tables 9.5 and 9.6 there are numerous planned views, sightlines and vistas which contribute to the appreciation of Murthly Castle GDL.</p> <p>In consideration of the influence on artists such as Millais, the identified role of individuals of regional importance in the history of landscape design, and the contribution the surviving views and vistas, the artistic interest of Murthly Castle GDL has been assessed to be high.</p>
Historical Interest (This refers to the garden and designed landscape)	There is extensive documentary evidence for Murthly Castle GDL, including early cartography, estate accounts and other documentary evidence. These historical accounts together with articles and comments in gardening journals and newspapers, combine to show

Interest	Summary (from The Jessop Consultancy, 2022)
<p>within a historical context, the survival of evidence for its development and the relationship of the site with people, both past and present)</p>	<p>an increasing use of the designed landscape as an amenity for excursions and a growth in the concept of a Highland tourism and intended for enjoyment for sport, walking, and an appreciation of the aesthetic. Features were added to the designed landscape that provided visitors with the opportunity to view Murthly Castle GDL, such as the laying out of paths, drives and seating on Birnam Hill, in addition to the enhancements made to Duncan's Camp (F4.03). The grand entrance gates added next to Birnam Hotel in the 1870s corresponding to the opening up of the estate in 1871 to the public without appointment would have also added to the sense of entering an 'experience'.</p> <p>Numerous special features survive which reflect changing horticultural practice and landscape design at Murthly, from the Dutch influences of the 17th century to the fascination of early 19th century with the cultivation of newly imported tree species influenced by Sir William Drummond Stewart's American travels. In the later 19th century the fashion for a combination of specimen formal gardens and naturalistic parkland landscapes and ornamental farmland is also reflected in the changing landscape designs at the Murthly Estate</p> <p>Special features relating to these periods comprise:</p> <p><u>1660-1759: Renaissance/ formal:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ The Walled Garden (F1.03); ▪ Garden House (F1.11); ▪ Lime Avenue (F1.23); ▪ The Kitchen Garden (F2.61). <p><u>1759-1827: The beginning of the naturalistic</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Early trees to the west of the castle (Tree nos. 016 and 017) and in the policies (Tree no.225, Tree no.256, Tree no.265, Tree no.271, Tree no.272); ▪ The laying out of parks in the policies as shown on 1825 estate plans including the opening out of Chapel Park (F2.46) and the creation of Washinghouse Park (F2.63), Dovecot Park (F2.58), Newtyle Park (F2.53), Meadow Parks (F2.52) alongside the creation of the otherwise unnamed 23 acre (F2.37) and 15 acre (F2.62)). <p><u>1827-1838: The picturesque</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Triple Avenue (F1.16) (including Tree no. 018).

Interest	Summary (from The Jessop Consultancy, 2022)
	<p><u>1838-1871: The romantic, the American influence and the arrival of the railway</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Drives (F2.19, F2.45, F3.02, F3.06-F3.09) and associated features such as Roman Bridge (F2.10) and Stair bridge (F4.05); ▪ Buffalo park and hut (F4.11 and F4.06); ▪ The planting of exotic trees around the castle and associated terraces (e.g. F1.13, F1.14, F1.17, F1.18, F1.19, F1.20, F1.22); ▪ Features on Birnam Hill e.g. seats (F4.12), drives (F4.04 and F4.08), pathways such as the Kings Seat steps (F4.14), and the addition of the designed landscape around Rohallion Lodge (F4.12) that includes Robins Dam (F4.16) and Stare Dam (Rohallion Loch) (F4.17); ▪ The additional of estate designed gateways at the entrance to the estate and throughout the ornamental farmlands across the Muir of Thorns (e.g. F3.01, F4.01 and F3.12-F3.17) and the surviving paddocks (F3.11). <p>Murthly Castle's relationship with historic individuals and significant persons beyond the owners is limited. The development of the designed landscape appears to have been locally derived. Much of Murthly Castle GDL's design has been attributed to John Wallace who was active there between 1828 and 1838, although the prominent 19th century architect James Gillespie Graham was also employed to design many of the features within it.</p> <p>The extent of the surviving documentary evidence which supports our understanding of the development of Murthly Castle GDL, the influence of regionally important garden and landscape designers such as Wallace, and the contribution made by the nationally important architect Gillespie Graham, and historical associations with figures such as the artist Millais contribute to the historic interest of Murthly Castle GDL.</p> <p>The current baseline provides evidence that Murthly Castle GDL followed established fashions, and provides a good representation of significant changes in landscape design and sequence of styles overtime, as such Murthly Castle GDL has been assessed to be of high historical interest.</p>
Horticultural interest (This refers to the plants, trees, shrubs and woodlands in a garden and designed landscape). It	Documentary accounts detail that along with seeds and plants being collected from elsewhere within the world, largely North America, many horticultural specimens were purchased from the Perthshire Nurseries that had been established in 1767 by James Dickson overlooking the River Tay. This nursery supplied many similar estates to Murthly throughout the United Kingdom. It is the surviving exotic

Interest	Summary (from The Jessop Consultancy, 2022)
covers any important associations with the history of horticulture, arboriculture (the cultivation of trees and shrubs) or silviculture (the cultivation of forest trees, or forestry)	<p>tree species planted in the 19th century which continue to make the garden designed landscape outstanding.</p> <p>Associated with the propagation of the trees and plants on the estate evidence for three walled enclosures, or gardens have been identified.</p> <p>Many mature examples of the variety of species described in the historical accounts have been noted to survive and contribute to the horticultural interest of Murthly, this is in regards to the avenues and areas of plantation within the policies.</p> <p>As such it is still considered that the horticultural interest of the site is outstanding.</p>
Architectural interest (This refers to the built features within a garden and designed landscape)	<p>Murthly Castle GDL is the setting for 24 listed buildings, including four Category A, ten Category B and ten Category C listed buildings. Of these, ten are situated within the Murthly Castle GDL inventory site boundary and 14 are situated within the wider area. These buildings include Murthly Castle (F1.02), the Chapel of St Anthony the Eremite (F1.05), the Walled Garden (F1.03) and associated Garden House (F1.11), formal entrances and gate piers (such as F3.01) and bridges including Roman Bridge (F2.10) and Stair Bridge (F4.05).</p> <p>Many of the ancillary buildings are recognisable as being constructed in a consistent architectural style which has a restrained architectural level of detail, but does suggest that there may have been a guiding architect behind buildings such as the fishing hut (F2.35), curling club house (F2.39) and Buffalo Hut (F4.06).</p> <p>Garden structures such as the seat (F2.12) and the pool and cascade (F2.15) in the centre of the Dolphin Terrace (F2.13) are important elements of the formal landscape design, which typically for 18th century landscapes cleverly incorporated functional structures such as bridges (F2.14) and (F2.21) into the overall design, but also sweeping rock faced cuttings (F2.16 and F2.35) which help articulate the form and character of the numerous drives within the policies.</p> <p>All of these elements demonstrate a degree of architectural design and homogeneity and contribute to the overarching architectural interest of Murthly Castle GDL and enable an understanding of the landscape as both a pleasure ground and working estate. As a result, the architectural interest of Murthly Castle GDL has been assessed to be outstanding.</p>
Archaeological interest (This refers to archaeological features contained within the garden)	<p>Murthly Castle GDL derives its archaeological interest both for the contribution made to the character of the designed landscape by archaeological sites which pre-date Murthly Castle GDL but which have been incorporated into it, the potential for archaeological remains relating to earlier phases of the garden design, and the</p>

Interest	Summary (from The Jessop Consultancy, 2022)
and designed landscape)	<p>archaeological potential for information relating to buildings which have been removed.</p> <p>Given the contribution that archaeological sites such as the standing stone (F2.65) make to the character of the designed landscape, the 19th century incorporation of archaeological sites into Murthly Castle GDL, including the physical adaption to Duncan's Camp (F4.03), and the potential for archaeological remains to contribute to our understanding of the development of Murthly Castle GDL, the archaeological interest of Murthly Castle GDL has been assessed to be high.</p>
Scenic interest (This refers to the special contribution that the garden and designed landscape makes to the quality of the surrounding landscape)	<p>The designed landscape at Murthly Castle comprises not only the policies and plantations to the south of the River Tay that surround Murthly Castle, but that it extends westwards towards Birnam encompassing Birnam Hill, and then to the south as defined by the ornamental farmland. The size and distinct character of Murthly Castle GDL has influenced the landscape we see today, which is largely expressed by the surviving architectural features within the landscape and the areas of policy woodland and plantation forestry which respect those established in the 19th century.</p> <p>Murthly Castle GDL makes a significant contribution to the character of the landscape of the Tay Valley and the Pass of Birnam, including where afforded glimpsed views of the policies surrounding Murthly Castle from the existing A9 and wider road network, and in views of the designed landscape set against the wider backdrop of Lowland Perthshire to the south-east and the hills and mountains of the Highlands to the north-west, as such Murthly Castle GDL has been assessed to be of outstanding scenic interest.</p>
Nature conservation (This refers to the quality and diversity of the environments and habitats within the garden and designed landscape)	<p>Murthly Castle GDL incorporates a variety of habitats some of which are nationally designated for their conservation value or scientific interest. Primarily the landscape is made up of long-established plantation forestry, which has its own conservation value, but the designed landscape also includes parts of the River Tay and important freshwater habitat, supporting an important Atlantic Salmon population alongside other Annex II species such as Sea lamprey, Brook lamprey, River lamprey and Otter.</p> <p>In addition to this there are also important areas of lag fen and open water which support nationally scarce flora, including Cairnleith Moss which is out with the inventory site boundary for Murthly Castle GDL but identified in this report as forming part of Murthly Castle GDL to the south and is therefore an additional contributor to the nature conservation interest of the site. The contribution of the SSSI's and SACs alongside the conservation value of the long-established plantations and smaller areas of Ancient (Semi-natural)</p>

Interest	Summary (from The Jessop Consultancy, 2022)
	woodland contributes to the outstanding level of Nature Conservation interest at Murthly Castle.

- 9.3.35 Taking into account its inclusion on the Inventory of Gardens and Designed Landscapes and the significant artistic, historical, horticultural, architectural, archaeological, scenic and nature conservation interests, the value (sensitivity) of Murthly Castle GDL (HLT 14) has been assessed to be high.

9.4 Potential Impacts and Effects

- 9.4.1 The design of the proposed scheme has been developed through an iterative design process in order to avoid, reduce and mitigate potential impacts on cultural heritage resources. Further information is provided in Chapter 5 (Iterative Design Development). This section takes into account the embedded and standard mitigation presented in Section 9.5 (Mitigation) and describes the potential impacts that would be expected to occur in the absence of specific mitigation.
- 9.4.2 Potential significant effects (i.e. of **Moderate** or higher significance) on cultural heritage resources are assessed below. Appendix A9.6 (Assessment of Non-Significant Cultural Heritage Effects) presents a detailed assessment of non-significant effects, mitigation measures where required, and residual effects. Unless otherwise stated, all effects described are adverse.

Embedded Mitigation

- 9.4.3 Chapter 5 (Iterative Design Development), describes the key design developments that have been developed to avoid or reduce potential impacts on cultural heritage resources:
- Measures to re-integrate Dunkeld and Birnam Station, including Footbridge (Asset 26) with Birnam and reduce the impact on the station. These include:
 - Provision of a new underpass structure providing access to Dunkeld and Birnam Station. The underpass will appear as a new entrance to the station, and will take visual cues from the station architecture.
 - Provision of a natural stone-faced retaining wall at the end of Station Road (approximate ch3290 to ch3390) with a stone parapet 2m above the level of the A9 to screen traffic in views from Station Road. This includes a mono pitched slate roof the design and detail of which will provide a visual connection to the station and its new (underpass) entrance.
 - Provision of a green screen. While this would also have an adverse effect on the setting of the Listed Building, it would partially screen traffic movement in views from Dunkeld and Birnam Station, including Footbridge (Asset 26) and provide noise attenuation.
 - Provision of vehicular parking on Birnam Glen Road (space equivalent to approximately two parking spaces), reducing potential impact on the viability of future use of the station due to loss of current vehicular access and parking.

- These measures will be implemented in accordance with **Mitigation Item P02-LV25** (Chapter 10 (Landscape)).
- As detailed in Chapter 10 (Landscape) measures to integrate the proposed scheme into Murthly Castle GDL (HLT 14) comprise:
 - Realignment of the Murthly Estate Western Drive and planting of a new avenue of heavy standard trees within a widened verge to provide a continuation of the remaining section of the historic Western Drive (Cedar Avenue) (F2.71), reinforce the historic landscape pattern and strengthen the landscape structure of the Murthly Estate (**Mitigation Item P02-LV23**). In addition the embankment slope between the realigned Murthly Estate Western Drive and the carriageway between approximately ch100 and ch300 will be slackened to provide improved conditions for the establishment of new roadside woodland screen planting.
 - Birnam Junction landscape design, bridge design, and associated exposed rock cuttings to soften the engineering appearance of these and better integrate them with the surrounding landscape, including Murthly Castle GDL (**Mitigation Item P02-LV24**).
 - Proposed trees and shrubs to be planted within/ adjoining Murthly Castle GDL (HLT 14) will include the non-native species to integrate with the character of the historic landscape and will be developed in consultation with HES and NatureScot (**Mitigation Item P02-LV19**).
- Redesign of the compensatory flood storage between approximate ch5250 and ch5500 to avoid impact on the root system of Neil Gow's Tree (Asset 817).
- Fencing of the following cultural heritage resources including appropriate signage, and a toolbox talk for contactors to make them aware of the presence of these cultural heritage resources (**Mitigation Item P02-CH01**) to prevent accidental damage during construction:
 - Dalpowie Lodge (Site Of) (Asset 5);
 - Dunkeld and Birnam Station, including Footbridge (Asset 26);
 - Merryburn Hotel, Station Road, Birnam (Asset 32; a Category C Listed Building);
 - Farnyhaugh, Military Bridge (Asset 189);
 - Inver, Inverwood Cottage (Asset 814);
 - The possible surviving section of the enclosing wall of Dunkeld and Birnam Station, Goods Yard (Asset 832) on Station Road; and
 - Neil Gow's Tree (Asset 817).

A photographic survey to record the condition of these cultural heritage resources prior to the erection of the fencing and after its removal is also proposed.

Construction

Archaeological Remains

- 9.4.4 Construction of the Dunkeld and Birnam Station Car Park (centred on ch3350) would remove any surviving archaeological remains associated with Dunkeld and Birnam Station, Goods Yard (Asset 832; medium value (sensitivity)). During construction, the magnitude of this impact has been assessed to be major and the significance of effect **Moderate**.
- 9.4.5 Compensatory woodland planting (centred on ch4200) would remove or truncate archaeological remains associated with Ladywell Enclosure (Asset 941) which has been assessed to be of medium value (sensitivity). During construction the magnitude of this impact has been assessed to be major and the significance of effect **Moderate**.
- 9.4.6 Construction of Dalguise Junction (centred on ch7000) would remove the possible enclosures, pit-like anomalies, sub-circular anomalies identified by archaeological geophysical survey in Geophysical Survey Area P02_05 (Asset 960). This cultural heritage resource has been assessed to be of medium sensitivity. During construction the magnitude of this impact has been assessed to be major and the significance of effect **Moderate**.
- 9.4.7 Construction of the alignment (approximately ch5320) would remove possible enclosure in Geophysical Survey Area P02_03 (Asset 962) which has been assessed to be of medium sensitivity. During construction the magnitude of this impact has been assessed to be major and the significance of effect **Moderate**.

Historic Buildings

- 9.4.8 The introduction of two new lift shaft buildings on Platform 1 and Platform 2 at Dunkeld and Birnam Station, including Footbridge (Asset 26), and the construction and presence of a temporary pedestrian footbridge at ch3300 would reduce the visual connection between Dunkeld and Birnam Station Signal Box (Asset 16), assessed to be of high value (sensitivity) and Dunkeld and Birnam Station, including Footbridge (Asset 26) (see Figure 9.5). There would also be temporary noise and visual intrusion from construction activities associated with the construction of the Dunkeld & Birnam Station Pedestrian Underpass (connecting Platform 1 and Platform 2) which would also reduce the visual connection between the signal box and Dunkeld and Birnam Station, including Footbridge (Asset 26). While construction activities associated with the Dunkeld & Birnam Station Pedestrian Underpass, which would also result in the loss of trees to the south of the Dunkeld and Birnam Station Signal Box (Asset 16), this would not affect the signal box's setting, comprising its trackside location, intervisibility with Dunkeld and Birnam Station, including Footbridge (Asset 26), a Category A Listed Building, surviving semaphore signals and more modern railway infrastructure.



Figure 9.5: Illustration of the view north along Platform 2 towards Dunkeld and Birnam Station, including Footbridge (Asset 26). Nicoll Russell Studios, 2025.

- 9.4.9 The magnitude of impact on Asset 16 has been assessed to be moderate and the significance of effect **Moderate**.
- 9.4.10 Construction of the proposed scheme would impact on Dunkeld and Birnam Station, including Footbridge (Asset 26), a Category A Listed Building assessed to be of high value (sensitivity) as a result of:
- temporary noise and visual intrusion from construction plant and activities. For further information on the noise impact on Dunkeld and Birnam Station, including Footbridge (Asset 26), during construction please refer to Chapter 15 (Noise and Vibration). As identified in Chapter 15 (Noise and Vibration) no significant vibration impacts have been assessed for the station during construction;
 - two new lift shaft buildings which would permanently remove part of Platform 1 and Platform 2, introduce new infrastructure, reduce the prominence of the footbridge in views along the platforms and reduce the visual connection between the station building and Dunkeld and Birnam Station Signal Box (Asset 16);
 - temporary noise and visual intrusion from construction activities associated with the Dunkeld & Birnam Station Pedestrian Underpass (connecting Platform 1 and Platform 2) which would also reduce the visual connection between the station building and Dunkeld and Birnam Station Signal Box (Asset 16). While construction activities associated with the Dunkeld & Birnam Station Pedestrian Underpass, which would also result in the loss of trees to the south of the station, this would not affect it's setting as described in paragraph 9.3.15.
 - the permanent removal of the former forecourt;
 - the construction and presence of a temporary pedestrian footbridge at ch3300;
 - permanent removal of the remaining siding to the south-east of the station for the Railway Maintenance Access Track (ch3200 to ch3300);

- the reduction in the level of the southern end of Station Road permanently changing the topography of the road and altering the view along Station Road towards the station; and
- a broad construction corridor encompassing the carriageway and Station Car Park centred on approximately ch3350, increasing the existing severance between Birnam and the Station.

9.4.11 During construction, the magnitude of impact on Dunkeld and Birnam Station, including Footbridge (Asset 26; High Sensitivity) has been assessed to be major and the significance of effect **Very Large**.

9.4.12 Construction of the proposed scheme would impact on Birnam Conservation Area (Asset 44; medium value (sensitivity)) as a result of:

- temporary noise and visual intrusion from construction plant into the parts of the Conservation Area that are located partially within and adjacent to the proposed scheme (approximately ch3000 to ch3500);
- the introduction of additional infrastructure in the form of two new lift shaft buildings on Platform 1 and Platform 2 of Dunkeld and Birnam Station, including Footbridge (Asset 26);
- the introduction of permanent additional road infrastructure, including a wider higher crossing over Inchewan Burn at ch3450;
- the construction and presence of a temporary pedestrian footbridge at ch3300;
- the reduction the level of the southern end of Station Road which would permanently change the topography of the road and change the view along Station Road towards the station building; and
- a broad construction corridor encompassing the carriageway and Station Car Park centred on approximately ch3350 reinforcing the existing severance of the part of the Conservation Area to the north of the existing A9 (TCA B1) and to the south (TCA B2).

9.4.13 During construction, the magnitude of impact on Birnam Conservation Area (Asset 44) has been assessed to be moderate and the significance of effect **Moderate**.

9.4.14 The proposed scheme would remove Auchlou, Inver (Asset 793; low value (sensitivity)) through construction of the Main Line between ch5050 and ch5100 and would remove Inver Wood, Bridge (Asset 931; low value (sensitivity)) as a result of the construction of Dalguise Junction (ch6900). The magnitude of impact has been assessed to be major and the significance of effect **Moderate** for both these cultural heritage resources.

Historic Landscapes

9.4.15 Construction of the proposed scheme would impact on Murthly Castle GDL (HLT 14), assessed to be of high value (sensitivity,) as a result of:

- temporary noise and visual intrusion from construction plant and activities within The Ridge (KLF-2), Pass of Birnam (KLF-6), Keppie Wood, Byres Wood and other areas of ancient (of semi-natural origin) woodland (KLF-8), and Birnam Burn (KLF-9);

- a broad construction corridor reinforcing the existing severance between the areas of the GDL to the north and to the south of the existing A9;
- permanent changes to the topography of The Ridge (KLF-2) and Birnam Burn (KLF-9) as a result of construction of the mainline;
- permanent loss of areas of ancient (of semi-natural origin) woodland within Byres Wood (approximately ch-500 to ch-300), at Birnam Junction (centred on approximately ch2200) and along the carriageway from approximately ch1400 to ch2350. These are part of Keppie Wood, Byres Wood and other areas of ancient (of semi-natural origin) woodland (KLF-8);
- permanent realignment of the western end of Western Drive (Cedar Avenue) (F2.71) from approximately ch100 to ch250;
- permanent removal of the southern end of URN 65, a trackway shown on historical Ordnance Survey mapping and visible on LiDAR, at ch400;
- permanent removal of the northern end of URN 60, a trackway shown on historical Ordnance Survey mapping and visible on LiDAR, at ch450;
- permanent removal of northern red cedar and copper beech planting along Western Drive (Conifers) (F2.69), between approximately ch750 and ch1050;
- permanent severance of a path along the River Tay shown on historical Ordnance Survey mapping (URN 68/76/86), at ch900, ch1900, ch2450 and by the outfall for SuDS Basin B2;
- permanent removal of Copper Beech Avenue (F2.70) between approximately ch1380 and ch1550;
- permanent removal of the south-southeastern and north-northwestern ends of URN 85, a drive shown on historical Ordnance Survey mapping and visible on LiDAR, between ch1870 and ch1990;
- permanent changes to the topography of and the introduction of additional road infrastructure into The Pass of Birnam (KLF-6);
- severance of the northeastern end of the GDL from the rest of the GDL due to Birnam Junction, SuDS Pond B1 and associated outfall, spanning almost the entire width of the GDL at approximately ch2000;
- permanent changes to the layout of Ringwood Plantation (URN 92) and an associated former area of Parkland (URN 93) by the carriageway between approximately ch550 to ch1500 and by SuDS Basin A. While the plantation is now of recent conifers, and has been bisected by the existing A9, the current layout of the plantation broadly reflects that shown on historical Ordnance Survey mapping;
- permanent changes to the layout of an unnamed plantation (URN 95) between approximately ch1900 and ch2500. While the trees in the plantation are recent, and its western boundary has been changed by the existing A9, the layout of the plantation broadly reflects that shown on historical Ordnance Survey mapping;

- permanent changes to the topography and the introduction of road infrastructure in the form of SuDS Basin B2 pond and access track, into a large pasture field at the northern end of the GDL. The layout of this large field has remained largely unchanged from that shown on historical Ordnance Survey mapping. While utilitarian, this large pasture field contributes to the character of the northern end of the GDL; and
- temporary visual intrusion from plant and construction and the introduction of additional road infrastructure into View 11: From Duncan's Camp towards Murthly Castle, View 12: From King's Steps along the Tay Valley, towards Murthly Castle, View 16: From The Buffalo Hut towards Murthly Castle and Historic View B: View looking east along the Pass of Birnam towards Murthly Castle.

9.4.16 While the Muir of Thorn and Gelly Woods Ancient Woodland Inventory (AWI) compensation and non-AWI replacement planting is located within the Muir of Thorn KLF (KLF-3) as works in these areas comprise management of existing area of woodland, no impact on KLF-3 from the replacement woodland planting during construction has been assessed.

9.4.17 During construction, the magnitude of impact on Murthly Castle GDL (HLT 14) has been assessed to be moderate and the significance of effect **Moderate**.

Operation

Archaeological Remains

9.4.18 No significant effects on archaeological remains have been assessed to result from the operation of the proposed scheme.

Historic Buildings

9.4.19 The lift shaft buildings on Platform 1 and Platform 2 would continue to impact on the visual connection between Dunkeld and Birnam Station Signal Box (Asset 16; a Category B Listed Building; high value (sensitivity)) and Dunkeld and Birnam Station, including Footbridge (Asset 26). The magnitude of this impact has been assessed to be moderate and the significance of effect **Moderate**.

9.4.20 Operation of the proposed scheme would impact on Dunkeld and Birnam Station, including Footbridge (Asset 26), a Category A Listed Building assessed to be of high value (sensitivity) as a result of:

- the continued presence of new infrastructure in the form of a new lift shaft building on Platform 1 and a new lift shaft building on Platform 2. These would also reduce the prominence of the footbridge in views along the platforms and reduce the visual connection between the station and Dunkeld and Birnam Station Signal Box (Asset 16);
- the reduction in the level of the southern end of Station Road permanently changing the topography of the road and altering the view along Station Road towards the station;
- while a green screen immediately to the north-northeast of the station building would partially screen traffic movement, there would be visual intrusion from traffic;

- the green screen would have an adverse effect on the setting of the Listed Building. However in addition to partially screening traffic movement the green screen would also provide noise attenuation; and
- a wide proposed scheme footprint, comprising the carriageways and the new Station Car Park centred on ch3350, would continue to reinforce the severance of the relationship between Birnam and the station.

9.4.21 During operation, the magnitude of impact has been assessed to be major and the significance of effect **Large**.

9.4.22 During operation the measures identified to re-integrate Dunkeld and Birnam Station, including Footbridge (Asset 26) with Birnam, including increasing visual connectivity between Birnam and the station as a result of removal of buildings within Birnam Industrial Estate (see Photograph 9.8 and Figure 9.6) have been assessed to have a beneficial impact. In addition a beneficial effect on the station has been assessed for the station during operation (please refer to Chapter 15 (Noise and Vibration) for more information). The magnitude of these impacts has been assessed to be minor beneficial and the significance of effect **Slight beneficial**.



Photograph 9.8: Existing view from the footbridge at Dunkeld and Birnam Station, including Footbridge (Asset 26) towards Birnam Conservation Area (Asset 44). Jacobs, 2018.



Figure 9.6: Illustration of the view during operation from the footbridge at Dunkeld and Birnam Station, including Footbridge (Asset 26) towards Birnam Conservation Area (Asset 44). Nicoll Russell Studios, 2025.

- 9.4.23 Operation of the proposed scheme would impact on Birnam Conservation Area (Asset 44; medium value (sensitivity)) as a result of:
- the continued presence of additional road infrastructure, including a wider higher crossing over Inchewan Burn at ch3450, in the parts of the proposed scheme that are partially located within and immediately adjacent to the Conservation Area;
 - the continued presence of two new lift shaft buildings on Platform 1 and Platform 2 of Dunkeld and Birnam Station, including Footbridge (Asset 26);
 - the reduction in the level of the southern end of Station Road permanently changing the topography of the road and changing the view along Station Road towards the station building; and
 - a broad road corridor encompassing the carriageway and Station Car Park centred on approximately ch3350 reinforcing the severance of the Conservation Area to the north of the proposed scheme (TCA B1) and to the south (TCA B2).
- 9.4.24 During operation, the magnitude of impact on Birnam Conservation Area (Asset 44) has been assessed to be moderate and the significance of effect **Moderate**.
- 9.4.25 During operation the measures identified to re-integrate Dunkeld and Birnam Station, including Footbridge (Asset 26) with Birnam Conservation Area (Asset 44) including increasing visual connectivity between the two cultural heritage resources as a result of removal of buildings within Birnam Industrial Estate have been assessed to have a beneficial impact of minor magnitude and a **Slight beneficial** significance of effect on Birnam Conservation Area (Asset 44).

Historic Landscapes

- 9.4.26 Operation of the proposed scheme would impact on Murthly Castle GDL (HLT 14), assessed to be of high value (sensitivity), as a result of:
- the continued presence of additional roads infrastructure within The Ridge (KLF-2), Pass of Birnam (KLF-6), Keppie Wood, Byres Wood and other areas of ancient (of semi-natural origin) woodland (KLF-8), and Birnam Burn (KLF-9);
 - reinforcement of the severance between the areas of the GDL to the north and to the south of the existing A9;
 - continued severance of the north-eastern end of the GDL from the rest of the GDL due to Birnam Junction, SuDS Pond B1 and associated outfall, at approximately ch2000, given the footprint of the proposed scheme spans almost the entire width of the GDL;
 - the continued presence of roads infrastructure in the form of SuDS Basin B2 and access track in a large pasture field at the northern end of the GDL; and
 - the continued presence of additional road infrastructure in View 11: From Duncan's Camp towards Murthly Castle View, View 12: From King's Steps along the Tay Valley, towards Murthly Castle, View 16: From The Buffalo Hut towards Murthly Castle and Historic View B: View looking east along the Pass of Birnam towards Murthly Castle.
- 9.4.27 While the Muir of Thorn and Gelly Woods Ancient Woodland Inventory (AWI) compensation and non-AWI replacement planting is located within the Muir of Thorn KLF (KLF-3) as operation works in these areas comprise management of existing woodland, no impact on KLF-3 from the replacement woodland planting during operation has been assessed.
- 9.4.28 In the absence of mitigation, during operation the magnitude of impact on Murthly Castle GDL (HLT 14) has been assessed to be moderate and the significance of effect **Moderate**.

Cumulative Effects

Potentially significant cumulative effects of the proposed scheme, and those of the proposed scheme in combination with other reasonably foreseeable developments, are assessed in Chapter 21 (Assessment of Cumulative Effects).

9.5 Mitigation

- 9.5.1 This chapter makes reference to overarching standard measures applicable across A9 dualling projects ('SMC' mitigation item references), and also to project-specific essential mitigation measures ('P02' mitigation item references). Those that specifically relate to cultural heritage are assigned a 'CH' reference.
- 9.5.2 Mitigation for potential significant effects on cultural heritage resources is presented below. Mitigation for non-significant effects is not presented in this chapter but is presented in Appendix A9.6: (Assessment of Non-Significant Cultural Heritage Effects).

Standard Mitigation

- 9.5.3 During construction, Standard Mitigation Commitments (SMCs) will be applied (Table 9.8) in order to mitigate potential impacts on cultural heritage resources (**Mitigation Items SMC-CH1**). These commitments have been developed for adoption across the A9 Dualling Programme and will be implemented in addition to the Pass of Birnam to Tay Crossing project essential mitigation measures (**Mitigation Items P02-CH02 to P02-CH10**) identified in Table 9.9.

Table 9.8: Standard Mitigation for Cultural Heritage

Mitigation Item	Approximate Chainage/ Location	Timing of Measure	Party Responsible for implementation	Description	Mitigation Purpose/ Objective	Specific Consultation or Approval Required	Monitoring measure for the suggested mitigation
SMC-CH1	Throughout the proposed scheme	Construction	Main Contractor	The Main Contractor will consult with the relevant local authority and Transport Scotland’s Historic Environment Advisor should any archaeological or cultural heritage finds or sites be discovered or revealed during construction to enable appropriate measures to be implemented to mitigate potential impacts.	To enable appropriate mitigation measures to be implemented to mitigate impacts cultural heritage resources found during construction.	Perth & Kinross Heritage Trust (PKHT), Transport Scotland’s Historic Environment Advisor.	Publication of the results of the implemented mitigation and submission of the archive to the appropriate repository.

Specific Mitigation

Archaeological Remains

- 9.5.4 The following mitigation for effects on Dunkeld and Birnam Station, Goods Yard (Asset 83) and Ladywell Enclosure (Asset 941) the possible enclosures, pit-like anomalies, sub-circular anomalies identified by archaeological geophysical survey in Geophysical Survey Area P02_05 (Asset 960) and the possible enclosure in Geophysical Survey Area P02_03 (Asset 962) is proposed:
- archaeological trial trenching (**Mitigation Item P02-CH02**).
 - archaeological excavation (**Mitigation Item P02-CH03**).
- 9.5.5 Archaeological trial trenching (**Mitigation Item P02-CH02**) will also be undertaken in suitable areas within the CPO where physical disturbance would result from construction of the proposed scheme. Archaeological excavation (**Mitigation Item P02-CH03**) or archaeological monitoring during construction (**Mitigation Item P02-CH12**) would be undertaken of archaeological remains identified by the archaeological trial trenching.
- 9.5.6 **Mitigation Item P02-CH02** and **Mitigation Item P02-CH03** will be undertaken in accordance with relevant guidance provided by the Chartered Institute for Archaeologists (CIfA), and HES and a Project Design that will be developed in consultation with PKHT and Transport Scotland's Historic Environment Advisor.
- 9.5.7 **Mitigation Item P02-CH02** and **Mitigation Item P02-CH03** include a programme of assessment, reporting, analysis, publication and dissemination (including archaeological community outreach) of results commensurate with the value of the archaeological remains affected. This will include the preparation of reports which will be submitted to the Perth & Kinross Historic Environment Record (PKHER) and the National Record of the Historic Environment (NRHE), along with ordered archives which will be submitted to an appropriate repository.

Historic Buildings

- 9.5.8 As identified in Section 9.4, measures to re-integrate Dunkeld and Birnam Station, including Footbridge (Asset 26), with Birnam and reduce the impact on the station will be developed in accordance with **Mitigation Item P02-LV25**. Please refer to Chapter 10 (Landscape) for detailed information on **Mitigation Item P02-LV25**.
- 9.5.9 Historic Building Record (Detailed) in accordance with ALGAO: Scotland's Historic Building Recording Guidance (ALGAO: Scotland, 2013) (**Mitigation Item P02-CH04**) is proposed for Dunkeld and Birnam Station, including Footbridge (Asset 26), Auchlou, Inver (Asset 793) and Inver Wood, Bridge (Asset 931):
- 9.5.10 Photographic recording (**Mitigation Item P02-CH05**) is proposed for effects on Dunkeld and Birnam Station Signal Box (Asset 16) and Birnam Conservation Area (Asset 44). This would include recording the setting of the signal box, its relationship with Dunkeld and Birnam Station, including Footbridge (Asset 26) and its relationship with other railway infrastructure.

- 9.5.11 **Mitigation Item P02-CH04** and **Mitigation Item P02-CH05** will be undertaken in accordance with relevant guidance provided by ClfA, HES and ALGAO: Scotland, and a Project Design that will be developed in consultation with PKHT, Transport Scotland's Historic Environment Advisor, HES and PKC.
- 9.5.12 All mitigation proposed for historic buildings will include a programme of reporting, publication and dissemination of results commensurate with the value of the historic buildings affected. This will include the preparation of reports which will be submitted to the PKHER and the NRHE along with ordered archives which will be submitted to an appropriate repository.
- 9.5.13 Interpretation boards presenting interpretive information on Dunkeld and Birnam Station, including Footbridge (Asset 26) and Dunkeld and Birnam Station, Goods Yard (Asset 832) will be installed at suitable publicly accessible locations within the CPO. The content of the interpretation boards will be agreed with HES, PKC and PKHT and Transport Scotland's Historic Environment Advisor prior to installation (**Mitigation Item P02-CH06**).

Historic Landscapes

- 9.5.14 The following mitigation for effects on Murthly Castle GDL (HLT 14) is proposed:
- photographic survey of affected Key Landscape Features, Key Views and Sightlines and Historic Views in accordance with the guidance provided in Understanding the Archaeology of Landscapes: A Guide to Good Recording Practice (Second Edition) (Historic England, 2017) (**Mitigation Item P02-CH07**).
 - a Level 3 landscape survey record, in accordance with the requirements of Understanding the Archaeology of Landscapes: A Guide to Good Recording Practice (Second Edition) (Historic England, 2017) of the affected Special Features (**Mitigation Item P02-CH08**).
- 9.5.15 **Mitigation Item P02-CH07** and **Mitigation Item P02-CH08** will be undertaken in accordance with relevant guidance provided by the ClfA, HES and Historic England, and a Project Design that will be developed in consultation with PKHT and Transport Scotland's Historic Environment Advisor.
- 9.5.16 **Mitigation Item P02-CH07** and **Mitigation Item P02-CH08** will include a programme of reporting, publication and dissemination. This will include the preparation of reports which will be submitted to the PKHER and the NRHE, along with ordered archives which will be submitted to an appropriate repository.
- 9.5.17 Interpretation boards presenting interpretive information on Murthly Castle GDL (HLT 14) will be installed at suitable publicly accessible locations within the CPO within the GDL. The content of the interpretation boards will be agreed with PKHT, Transport Scotland's Historic Environment Advisor, HES and PKC prior to installation (**Mitigation Item P02-CH9**).

Table 9.9: Specific Mitigation for Significant Effects on Cultural Heritage Resources

Mitigation Item	Approximate Chainage/ Location	Timing of Measure	Responsible Party for implementation	Description	Mitigation Purpose/ Objective	Specific Consultation or Approval Required	Monitoring measure for the suggested mitigation
P02-CH02	Dunkeld And Birnam Station, Goods Yard (Asset 832), Ladywell Enclosure (Asset 941), the possible enclosures, pit-like anomalies, sub-circular anomalies identified by archaeological geophysical survey in Geophysical Survey Area P02_05 (Asset 960) and the possible enclosure in Geophysical Survey Area P02_03 (Asset 962)	Pre-construction	Main Contractor/Archaeological Advance Works Contractor	Archaeological Trial Trenching.	To inform the scope and scale of archaeological excavation.	PKHT and Transport Scotland's Historic Environment Advisor.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Submission of report(s) on the results of the archaeological trial trenching to the PKHER and NRHE. ▪ Submission of ordered archives to an appropriate repository.
P02-CH03	Dunkeld And Birnam Station, Goods Yard (Asset 832), Ladywell Enclosure (Asset 941), the possible enclosures, pit-like anomalies, sub-circular anomalies identified by archaeological geophysical survey in Geophysical Survey Area P02_05 (Asset 960) and the possible enclosure in Geophysical Survey Area P02_03 (Asset 962)	Pre-construction	Main Contractor/Archaeological Advance Works Contractor	Archaeological Excavation.	To make a record of archaeological remains.	PKHT and Transport Scotland's Historic Environment Advisor.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Submission of report(s) on the results of the archaeological excavation to the PKHER and NRHE and publication commensurate with the value of the archaeological remains affected. ▪ Submission of ordered archives to an appropriate repository.

Mitigation Item	Approximate Chainage/ Location	Timing of Measure	Responsible Party for implementation	Description	Mitigation Purpose/ Objective	Specific Consultation or Approval Required	Monitoring measure for the suggested mitigation
P02-CH04	Dunkeld and Birnam Station, including Footbridge (Asset 26), Auchlou, Inver (Asset 793) and Inver Wood, Bridge (Asset 931)	Pre-construction	Main Contractor/Archaeological Advance Works Contractor	Historic Building Record (Detailed) in accordance with ALGAO: Scotland's Historic Building Recording Guidance (ALGAO: Scotland, 2013).	To make a record of the historic buildings.	PKHT, Transport Scotland's Historic Environment Advisor, HES and PKC.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Submission of report(s) on the results of the historic building recording to the PKHER and NRHE. Submission of ordered archives to an appropriate repository.
P02-CH05	Dunkeld and Birnam Station Signal Box (Asset 16) and Birnam Conservation Area (Asset 44)	Pre-construction	Main Contractor/Archaeological Advance Works Contractor	A photographic record to document each cultural heritage resource in their existing setting prior to construction. This will include the preparation of a report on the results of the survey and preparation and submission of an ordered archive.	To record the setting of these historic buildings.	PKHT and Transport Scotland's Historic Environment Advisor.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Submission of report(s) on the results of the photographic to the PKHER and NRHE. Submission of ordered archives to an appropriate repository.
P02-CH06	Dunkeld and Birnam Station, including Footbridge (Asset 26) Dunkeld And Birnam Station and Goods Yard (Asset 832)	Construction	Main Contractor	Interpretation boards presenting interpretive information will be installed at suitable publicly accessible locations within the proposed CPO.	To enhance people's understanding of, and their engagement with, Dunkeld and Birnam Station, including Footbridge (Asset 26) and Dunkeld And Birnam Station, Goods Yard (Asset 832).	PKHT, PKC, HES and Transport Scotland's Historic Environment Advisor.	Installation of the agreed interpretation boards.
P02-CH07	Murthly Castle GDL (HLT 14)	Pre-construction	Main Contractor/Archaeological Advance Works Contractor	Photographic survey in accordance with the guidance provided in Understanding the Archaeology of Landscapes: A Guide to Good Recording Practice (Second Edition) (Historic England 2017).	To record the Key Landscape Features, Key Views and Sightlines and Historic Views affected by the construction and operation of the proposed scheme.	PKHT and Transport Scotland's Historic Environment Advisor.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Submission of report(s) on the results of the photographic survey to the PKHER and NRHE. Submission of ordered archives to an appropriate repository.

Mitigation Item	Approximate Chainage/ Location	Timing of Measure	Responsible Party for implementation	Description	Mitigation Purpose/ Objective	Specific Consultation or Approval Required	Monitoring measure for the suggested mitigation
P02-CH08	Murthly Castle GDL (HLT 14)	Pre-construction	Main Contractor/Archaeological Advance Works Contractor	A Level 3 landscape survey, in accordance with Understanding the Archaeology of Landscapes: A Guide to Good Recording Practice (Second Edition) (Historic England, 2017).	To record the Special Features affected by the construction of the proposed scheme.	PKHT and Transport Scotland's Historic Environment Advisor.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Submission of report(s) on the results of the Level 3 landscape survey to the PKHER and NRHE. Submission of ordered archives to an appropriate repository.
P02-CH09	Murthly Castle GDL (HLT 14)	Construction	Main Contractor	Interpretation boards presenting interpretive information on Murthly Castle GDL (HLT 14) will be installed at suitable publicly accessible locations within the CPO within the GDL at the end of the construction period.	To enhance people's understanding of, and their engagement with Murthly Castle GDL (HLT 14).	PKHT, PKC, HES and Transport Scotland's Historic Environment Advisor.	Installation of the agreed interpretation boards.

9.6 Residual Effects

- 9.6.1 Residual effects are those that remain once the proposed mitigation measures have been implemented. An assessment of the residual effects for the cultural heritage resources assessed in this chapter are presented in Tables 9.10, 9.11 and 9.12.
- 9.6.2 An assessment of non-significant residual effects is presented in Appendix A9.6: (Assessment of Non-Significant Cultural Heritage Effects).
- 9.6.3 Informed by archaeological trial trenching (**Mitigation Item P02-CH02**), during construction archaeological excavation (**Mitigation Item P02-CH03**), including a programme of assessment, reporting, analysis, publication dissemination, and archiving has been identified as mitigation for the Moderate significance of effect on:
- Dunkeld And Birnam Station, Goods Yard (Asset 832);
 - Ladywell Enclosure (Asset 941);
 - the possible enclosures, pit-like anomalies, sub-circular anomalies identified by archaeological geophysical survey in Geophysical Survey Area P02_05 (Asset 960); and
 - the possible enclosure in Geophysical Survey Area P02_03 (Asset 962).
- 9.6.4 Through archaeological excavation, a record of these remains would be made. Through the associated programme of assessment, reporting, analysis, publication and dissemination of results commensurate with the value of the archaeological remains affected, and archiving, the record would be made accessible. Archaeological excavation would therefore reduce the magnitude of impact through preserving information that would otherwise have been lost had the archaeological remains been removed without excavation. The residual magnitude of impact for Assets 832, 941, 960 and 962 has therefore been assessed to be negligible and the residual significance of effect **Neutral**.
- 9.6.5 Photographic survey (**Mitigation Item P02-CH05**) has been identified as mitigation for the impacts to the setting of Dunkeld and Birnam Station Signal Box (Asset 16) and Birnam Conservation Area (Asset 44) during construction. The photographic survey would make a record of the setting of these historic buildings before it is changed by the proposed scheme and make the record accessible. While the photographic survey would reduce the magnitude of impact through preserving information that would otherwise have been lost had the setting been changed without recording, recording would not mitigate the temporary construction effects identified in Section 9.4. The residual magnitude of impact on Dunkeld and Birnam Station Signal Box (Asset 16) and Birnam Conservation Area (Asset 44) during construction has therefore been assessed to be moderate and the residual significance of effect **Moderate**.

- 9.6.6 Historic Building Record (Detailed) (**Mitigation Item P02-CH04**) has been identified as mitigation for the physical impact and impact on the setting of Dunkeld and Birnam Station, including Footbridge (Asset 26). This would make a record of any surviving historic fabric before it is removed from part of Platform 1 and Platform 2 and record the setting of the station before it is changed by the proposed scheme, and would also make these records accessible. The historic building recording would therefore reduce the magnitude of impact through preserving information that would otherwise have been lost had the historic building fabric been removed and the setting been changed without recording. However this mitigation would not mitigate the temporary construction effects on this historic building identified in Section 9.4. The residual magnitude of impact on Dunkeld and Birnam Station, including Footbridge (Asset 26) during construction has therefore been assessed to be major and the significance of effect **Very Large**.
- 9.6.7 Historic Building Record (Detailed) (**Mitigation Item P02-CH04**) has been identified for the physical impact on Auchlou, Inver (Asset 793) and Inver Wood, Bridge (Asset 931). This is considered to be effective mitigation, reducing the amount of information on these historic building that would be lost in the absence of recording, and making these records accessible, reducing the magnitude of impact or significance of effect. As such the residual significance of impact on Auchlou, Inver (Asset 793) and Inver Wood, Bridge (Asset 931). during construction has therefore been assessed to be negligible and the significance of effect **Neutral**.
- 9.6.8 Photographic Survey (**Mitigation item P02-CH07**) and a Level 3 landscape survey (**Mitigation item P02-CH08**) has been identified as mitigation for the physical impacts Murthly Castle GDL (HLT 14), making a record of the affected elements of the GDL before they are removed and making this record available. The photographic survey would reduce the magnitude of impact through preserving information on these elements that would otherwise have been lost had they removed without recording, recording would not mitigate the temporary construction effects identified in Section 9.4. After mitigation the residual magnitude of impact on Murthly Castle GDL (HLT 14) during construction has therefore been assessed to be moderate and the significance of effect **Moderate**.
- 9.6.9 Provision of interpretation boards has also been identified as mitigation for effects during construction on Dunkeld and Birnam Station, including Footbridge (Asset 26), Dunkeld And Birnam Station and Goods Yard (Asset 832) and Murthly Castle GDL (HLT 14) (**Mitigation Item P02-CH06** and **Mitigation Item P02-CH09**). This is considered to be compensation and would offset the effects on these cultural heritage resources rather that reduce the residual magnitude of impact and residual significance of effect.
- 9.6.10 No significant effects have been assessed during operation for archaeological remains.
- 9.6.11 No mitigation is proposed for the effects on the setting of Dunkeld and Birnam Station Signal Box (Asset 16) during operation. The residual magnitude of impact on Dunkeld and Birnam Station Signal Box (Asset 16) during operation has therefore been assessed to be moderate and the significance of effect **Moderate**.

- 9.6.12 Implementing the embedded mitigation identified in Section 9.4 in accordance with **Mitigation Item P02-LV25** (please refer to Chapter 10 (Landscape)) would reduce the effects on the setting of Dunkeld and Birnam Station, including Footbridge (Asset 26) and Birnam Conservation Area (Asset 44), improve integration of the station with the Conservation Area, and strengthen the physical connection between these two cultural heritage resources. It would also screen traffic on the proposed scheme from the Conservation Area, whilst allowing the station building to be seen from along Station Road within the Conservation Area. After mitigation, the residual magnitude of impact on Dunkeld and Birnam Station, including Footbridge (Asset 26) during operation has been assessed to be moderate and the significance of effect **Moderate**. For Birnam Conservation Area (Asset 44) during operation has therefore been assessed to be moderate and the significance of effect **Moderate**.
- 9.6.13 In addition to the mitigatory effects of implementing the embedded mitigation identified for the station in accordance with **Mitigation Item P02-LV25**, this mitigation item is also considered to result in a beneficial effect during operation for Dunkeld and Birnam Station, including Footbridge (Asset 26) through improving the visual connectivity between the station and Birnam Conservation Area (Asset 44) (see Photograph 9.8 and Figure 9.6). In addition a beneficial effect for operational noise has also been assessed (Chapter 15 Noise and Vibration). The residual magnitude of these beneficial impacts has been assessed to be minor and the residual significance of effect **Slight beneficial**.
- 9.6.14 In addition to the mitigatory effects of implementing the embedded mitigation identified for the station in accordance with **Mitigation Item P02-LV25**, this mitigation item is also considered to result in a beneficial effect during operation on Birnam Conservation Area (Asset 44) by helping to re-integrate Birnam with the station through improving the visual connectivity between Birnam Conservation Area and Dunkeld and Birnam Station, including Footbridge (Asset 26). The residual magnitude of this beneficial impact has been assessed to be minor and the residual significance of effect **Slight beneficial**.
- 9.6.15 No mitigation is proposed for the effects on Murthly Castle GDL (HLT 14) during operation. The residual magnitude of impact on Murthly Castle GDL (HLT 14) during operation has therefore been assessed to be moderate and the significance of effect **Moderate**.

Table 9.10: Residual effects on Archaeological Remains

Asset no.	Asset Name	Designation	Value (Sensitivity)	Impact Magnitude	Significance of Effect	Mitigation Item	Residual magnitude	Residual Significance of Effect
Construction								
Asset 832	Dunkeld And Birnam Station, Goods Yard	None	Medium	Major	Moderate	P02-CH02 P02-CH03 P02-CH06	Negligible	Neutral
Asset 941	Ladywell Enclosure	None	Medium	Major	Moderate	P02-CH02 P02-CH03	Negligible	Neutral
Asset 960	Possible enclosures, pit-like anomalies, sub-circular anomalies identified by archaeological geophysical survey in Geophysical Survey Area P02_05	None	Medium	Major	Moderate	P02-CH02 P02-CH03	Negligible	Neutral
Asset 962	Possible enclosure in Geophysical Survey Area P02_03	None	Medium	Major	Moderate	P02-CH02 P02-CH03	Negligible	Neutral
Operation								
None								

Table 9.11: Residual effects on Historic Buildings

Asset no.	Asset Name	Designation	Value (Sensitivity)	Impact Magnitude	Significance of Effect	Mitigation Item	Residual magnitude	Residual Significance of Effect
Construction								
Asset 16	Dunkeld and Birnam Station Signal Box	Category B Listed Building	High	Moderate	Moderate	P02-CH05	Moderate	Moderate
Asset 26	Dunkeld and Birnam Station, including Footbridge	Category A Listed Building	High	Major	Very Large	P02-CH04 P02-CH06	Major	Very Large
Asset 44	Birnam Conservation Area	Conservation Area	Medium	Moderate	Moderate	P02-CH05	Moderate	Moderate
Asset 793	Auchlou, Inver	None	Low	Major	Moderate	P02-CH04	Negligible	Neutral
Asset 931	Inver Wood, Bridge	None	Low	Major	Moderate	P02-CH04	Negligible	Neutral
Operation								
Asset 16	Dunkeld and Birnam Station Signal Box	Category B Listed Building	High	Moderate	Moderate	None	Moderate	Moderate
Asset 26	Dunkeld and Birnam Station, including Footbridge	Category A Listed Building	High	Major	Large	P02-LV25	Moderate	Moderate
Asset 26	Dunkeld and Birnam Station, including Footbridge	Category A Listed Building	High	Minor	Slight (Beneficial)	P02-LV25	Minor	Slight (Beneficial)
Asset 44	Birnam Conservation Area	Conservation Area	Medium	Moderate	Moderate	P02-LV25	Moderate	Moderate

Asset no.	Asset Name	Designation	Value (Sensitivity)	Impact Magnitude	Significance of Effect	Mitigation Item	Residual magnitude	Residual Significance of Effect
Asset 44	Birnam Conservation Area	Conservation Area	Medium	Minor	Slight (Beneficial)	P02-LV25	Minor	Slight (Beneficial)

Table 9.12: Residual effects on Historic Landscapes

Asset no.	Asset Name	Designation	Value (Sensitivity)	Impact Magnitude	Significance of Effect	Mitigation Item	Residual magnitude	Residual Significance of Effect
Construction								
HLT 14	Murthly Castle GDL	Inventory Garden and Designed Landscape	High	Moderate	Moderate	P02-CH07 P02-CH08 P02-CH09	Moderate	Moderate
Operation								
HLT 14	Murthly Castle GDL	Inventory Garden and Designed Landscape	High	Moderate	Moderate	None	Moderate	Moderate

9.7 Compliance Against Plans and Policy

- 9.7.1 DMRB LA 104, Environmental Assessment and Monitoring, states that environmental assessment, reporting and monitoring shall meet the requirements of the national planning policy for each relevant overseeing organisation.
- 9.7.2 Appendix A3.1 (Assessment of Policy Compliance) identifies a topic specific review of national and local policy documents which are of relevance to the assessment undertaken and reported in this chapter in accordance with DMRB guidance. The compliance assessment undertaken in Appendix A3.1 focuses principally on the long-term effects of the proposed scheme rather than the short term, temporary effects.
- 9.7.3 National policy objectives of relevance to this assessment are provided in National Planning Framework 4 (Scottish Government 2023) and the Perth and Kinross Local Development Plan 2 (Perth and Kinross Council 2019) historic environment policies are of relevance.

Summary of Policy Compliance

- 9.7.4 The policy compliance assessment has identified some discrete areas of non-compliance with relevant policy. However, for the majority of cultural heritage resources, mitigation will reduce effects. It is therefore considered that the proposed scheme does on balance broadly comply with policy objectives relating to cultural heritage resources. A full policy compliance assessment can be found in Table A3.1-2 of Appendix A3.1 (Assessment of Policy Compliance).

Strategic Environmental Design Principles

- 9.7.5 Compliance of the proposed scheme with the A9 Dualling Historic Environment Strategic Environmental Design Principles is presented in Table 9.13.

Table 9.13: Compliance of the proposed scheme with the A9 Dualling Historic Environment Strategic Environmental Design Principles

Historic Environment		Adopting the Measures	Compliance
H1	Avoid impacts on the site and setting of heritage assets including scheduled monuments, historic buildings, designed landscapes and unscheduled archaeological features	Avoidance of impacts is the primary aim of this principle for all aspects of the historic environment including those not identified in this list such as conservation areas and battlefields. Where adverse impacts on designated assets are unavoidable, and after all alternatives have been properly investigated, there will be a need for prior consent to be granted and an ability to demonstrate why avoidance is not possible to Historic [Environment] Scotland and the relevant Local Authority, including Cairngorms National Park Authority (CNPA) where required.	Measures to avoid, reduce or mitigate unavoidable impact on cultural heritage resources are identified in Chapter 9 (Cultural Heritage) and Appendix A9.6: (Assessment of Non-Significant Cultural Heritage Effects). Listed Building Consent may be required for Dunkeld and Birnam Station, including Footbridge (Asset 26).
H2	Ensure effective consideration of battlefield sites, including their archaeological potential and landscape contexts. Avoid and minimise effects which may impact archaeological potential, landscape context or interpretation.	As noted above, avoidance of adverse impact is also the primary aim of this principle. To achieve this relevant project design teams shall develop a clear understanding of impacts on both archaeological remains and landscape features associated with the battlefield. This will inform the route alignment optioneering and design process. Historic [Environment] Scotland, CNPA, the Local Authority and other relevant stakeholders will be consulted.	The proposed scheme has avoided impacts on Dunkeld Battlefield (please refer to Appendix A9.6: Assessment of Non-Significant Cultural Heritage Effects).

Historic Environment		Adopting the Measures	Compliance
H3	Seek opportunities to improve access to the historic environment, including signage and interpretation	<p>Opportunities to enhance the appreciation/ understanding of the historic environment shall be explored at the relevant design stages (more likely to be DMRB Stage 3), such as through improved access and the provision of interpretation. The impact of such proposals should also be assessed.</p> <p>Project design teams shall work with Transport Scotland to investigate opportunities to integrate the results of any archaeological evaluation and mitigation work into the A9 Dualling educational programme.</p>	<p>Interpretation has been included at Dunkeld and Birnam Station, including Footbridge (Asset 26, Birnam Conservation Area (Asset 44), Dunkeld And Birnam Station, Goods Yard (Asset 832) and Murthly Garden GDL (HLT 14).</p> <p>Mitigation Items P02-CH02 and P02-CH03 includes archaeological community outreach, potentially including activities through Academy9, the A9 Dualling educational programme.</p>
H4	<p>Ensure appropriate use of materials that reflect local historic character.</p> <p>Ensure boundary treatments in Gardens & Designed Landscapes are of high quality materials, applied appropriately and consistently.</p>	<p>Whilst project design teams shall seek to use boundary treatments on sections adjacent to Gardens & Designed Landscapes (GDLs) that are of high quality materials, applied appropriately and consistently in line with GDLs historic character, and in consultation with relevant stakeholders, the principle of appropriate use of materials applies to all aspects of the historic environment along the route.</p> <p>Consultation will need to be undertaken with the Local Authority archaeological and / or conservation officers / advisors; and CNPA and Historic [Environment] Scotland where appropriate.</p>	<p>High quality materials and a design that reflects the local historic character of Dunkeld and Birnam Station, including Footbridge (Asset 26) and Birnam Conservation Area (Asset 44) have been included in the proposed scheme around Dunkeld and Birnam Station, including Footbridge (Asset 26).</p>

9.8 Statement of Significance

- 9.8.1 With proposed mitigation, the overall effect on archaeological remains has been assessed to be of **Neutral** significance.
- 9.8.2 With proposed mitigation, the overall effect on historic buildings has been assessed to be of **Moderate** significance. A **Slight** beneficial impact on historic buildings has also been assessed.
- 9.8.3 With proposed mitigation, the overall effect on the historic landscape has been assessed to be of **Moderate** significance.

9.9 References

ALGAO: Scotland (2013). Historic Building Recording Guidance [Online]. Available at: <https://www.algao.org.uk/sites/algao.org.uk/files/2023-08/ALGAO%20Buildings%20Guidance.pdf> (Accessed October 2024).

Fraser, W. (1868). The Red Book of Grandtully. Vol 1 Edinburgh.

Gifford, J. (2007). The Buildings of Scotland: Perth and Kinross. Yale.

Headland Archaeology (2025). A9 Dualling Programme: Pass of Birnam to Tay Crossing Geophysical Survey Report.

Historic England (2017). Understanding the Archaeology of Landscapes: A Guide to Good Recording Practice (Second Edition). [Online]. Available at: <https://historicengland.org.uk/images-books/publications/understanding-archaeology-of-landscapes/> (Accessed November 2024).

Historic Environment Scotland (2019). Designation Policy and Selection Guidance.

Historic Environment Scotland (n.d.). Murthly Castle (GDL00292). [Online]. Available at: <https://portal.historicenvironment.scot/apex/f?p=1505:300:::VIEWTYPE,VIEWREF:designaton,GDL00292> (Accessed November 2024).

Historic Environment Scotland (2020). Managing Change in the Historic Environment: Gardens and Designed Landscapes. [Online]. Available at: <https://www.historicenvironment.scot/archives-and-research/publications/publication/?publicationid=83214207-c4e7-4f80-af87-a678009820b9> (Accessed November 2024).

The Jessop Consultancy (2022). Historic Environment Desk-based Assessment of Murthly Castle Garden and Designed Landscape.