

**Mobility and Access Committee for Scotland (MACS)  
Main Committee meeting**

**Minutes of meeting held on Tuesday 22 January 2019  
Conference Room 2, Victoria Quay Edinburgh**

**Present:**

Naghat Ahmed  
Linda Bamford, Convener  
Audrey Birt  
Joanne Fairweather  
Sheila Fletcher  
Susan Fulton  
David Hunter  
George Mowat-Brown  
Hussein Patwa  
Keith Robertson  
Hilary Stubbs  
Fraser Sutherland  
Michael Tornow  
John Whitfield

**Secretariat:**

Karen Armstrong – Deputy Sponsor  
Claire Smith – Sponsor (Item 4 onwards)  
Douglas Adams - Secretary  
Aga Lysak – Secretary

**In attendance:**

Alexandra Dunn - Disability Equality Policy Officer, Equality, Human Rights and Third Sector Team, Scottish Government

Bruce Sutherland, Disability Equality Policy Officer, Equality, Human Rights and Third Sector Team, Scottish Government

**Apologies:**

Marsali Craig

### Agenda Item 1. Welcome and Apologies

- 1.1 The Convener welcomed all attendees, in particular, Susan Fulton, who was attending her first meeting. She also welcomed Phil Pool, from the Department of Transport (DfT), who was attending in the observer capacity.
- 1.2 The Convener confirmed that Dr Anne Findlay had resigned from the committee as of 31<sup>st</sup> December 2018 and she thanked Anne for her contributions and wished her well for the future.

### Agenda Item 2. Minutes of the previous meeting, matters arising and action points

2.1 The minutes of the previous meeting of 22 October 2018 had been previously agreed electronically and the committee agreed that no amendments were required.

2.2 Discussion moved onto the Action Point table. David Hunter asked if a new action point could be raised in relation to a matter arising from the previous minute (para 2.3a) on the Inclusive Mobility document. A discussion had been held at the last MACS Leads meeting and there had been agreement that MACS should continue to monitor progress on the revision of this document. If MACS assessed that insufficient progress was made by the end of 2019, MACS should recommend to Scottish Ministers and Transport Scotland that they produce their own document given the timeframe from review and how out-dated the guidance was in relation to emerging issues and developments.

**Action Point 1:** MACS should maintain a watching brief on the revision of the Inclusive Mobility document for the remainder of 2019, and if insufficient progress is made, submit a recommendation to Scottish Ministers and Transport Scotland that they produce their own Inclusive Mobility document. This action has previously been allocated to the Roads, Infrastructure and Active Travel Workstream, who would monitor this in conjunction with the Planning and Strategy Workstream.

2.3 Keith Robertson informed the committee that he is continuing to work with Karl Zaczek of the Transport Scotland (TS) Accessibility Team on the joint research project with DfT on designing streets. This also links with work underway on Inclusive Streets, the Good Practice Guide on Roads Design and research on Tactile Surfaces. Keith will continue to work with Karl and the Roads Unit in Transport Scotland and where appropriate keep the full committee updated.

## AGENDA ITEM 2

2.4 All actions were complete, with the exceptions of Action Point 4 and Action Point 8. It was agreed for Karen Armstrong would provide an update in on those actions under Agenda Item 5.

2.5 In relation to Action Point 14, Sheila Fletcher stated that she was concerned about the level of availability of accessible taxis. Although the law allows local authorities to require that a percentage of taxis must be accessible, there is no such requirement set for private hire cars (PHC). As there seems to be a shift towards PHC due to easier digital booking some operators of accessible taxis are reporting falling demand. This could lead to reduction in availability of accessible vehicles. Sheila suggested that an enquiry should be made to the Justice Directorate. She also suggested the Accessible Travel Team may wish to take this forward under the Accessible Travel Framework (ATF) work package on taxis.

2.6 It was agreed that Sheila would contact Robert Wyllie of Transport Accessibility Team. Robert is responsible for progressing work of the accessible taxis workstream of the Accessible Transport Framework (in collaboration with SATA), and could facilitate a meeting with Justice Directorate officials responsible for taxi and private hire vehicle licensing.

**Action Point 2** – Sheila Fletcher to contact Robert Wyllie to discuss accessibility of private hire vehicles and progressing the issue under the ATF taxi work package.

2.7 In relation to Action Point 17, Sheila Fletcher explained that she had been unable to contact Disabled Go. Susan Fulton said Disabled Go had recently changed their name to AccessAble and she agreed to send contact details to Sheila and Hussein Patwa.

**Action Point 3** – Susan Fulton to send contact details for Disabled Go/AccessAble to Sheila Fletcher and Hussein Patwa.

### Agenda Item 3. Convener Update

3.1 The Convener gave a brief overview of her salient activities in the last quarter. In relation to the update on the meeting with the Minister for Business, Fair Work and Skills, Mr Hepburn, Susan Fulton asked if there had been a commitment given by the Minister regarding access to volunteering. The Convener confirmed that the Minister is committed to ensure that disabled people have the same opportunities for

## AGENDA ITEM 2

volunteering as everybody else and that he had agreed to discuss this area with his colleagues.

3.2 There was agreement that MACS should continue to highlight the lack of clarity around the effect on income benefits of seeking employment as this is a major barrier for disabled people if the return to employment was unsustainable.

3.3 The Convener confirmed that a programme of meetings with Transport Scotland Directors is in the process of being finalised. The Convener thanked Laura Murdoch and Claire Smith for being instrumental in facilitating these meetings, and for convincing their colleagues of the value of engaging with MACS.

3.4 The Convener and David Hunter had met with the TS Active Travel Team and Sustrans Scotland earlier that morning and they shared the outputs of this meeting with the other committee members, including the preparations for MACS development day in March 2019, themed around “accessibility and active travel”. It was agreed that more consideration should be given to the language used around Active Travel to ensure it is accessible and encouraging, given the positive feedback from some of the subtle language changes the Active Travel Team and Sustrans Scotland had already made. It was agreed that the March Development Day should be used as a good opportunity to discuss any concerns and move forward in partnership.

3.5 The draft MACS recommendations for 2019 to 2022 set-out in Appendix 1 of the Convener’s paper were discussed. Keith Robertson proposed that an additional three organisations be added to the list of stakeholders relating to recommendation 3 on the promotion of meaningful EQIAs:

- SCOTS – Society of Chief Officers of Transportation in Scotland
- RIAS – Royal Incorporation of Architects in Scotland
- RIBA – Think this should be the Royal Institute of British Architects.

3.6 The recommendations were approved and Convener asked Keith to send her details of these organisations and she will update the list of stakeholders for recommendation 3.

<p><b>Action Point 4</b> – Keith Robertson to provide the Convener with details of SCOTS, RIAS and RIBA and she will update the list of stakeholders.</p>
---

## AGENDA ITEM 2

3.7 The committee discussed the Motability escalation paper produced by the Convener and David Hunter. David summarised the findings of the report published by the National Audit Office (NAO) in December 2018 on the Motability scheme. After discussion the committee was asked for agreement to the recommendations outlined in paragraphs 4.1 to 4.4 contained within the escalation paper.

3.8 The actions set out in paragraphs 4.1 (continue to advise the Ministers) and 4.2 (facilitate a round-table discussion with major Disabled People's Organisations) were agreed without any amendments.

Following a discussion on paragraph 4.3, which relates to the possibility of MACS involvement in the future governance and strategy of the Motability scheme, it was agreed that the request for MACS involvement should be made via Scottish Ministers following the completion of the roundtable engagement exercise. MACS will submit a recommendation to Scottish Ministers to facilitate involvement in the future governance and strategy of the Motability scheme.

3.9 The recommendation set-out in paragraph 4.4 specifies that MACS should be able to request information from the Motability scheme on its accountability and future spending plans. Keith Robertson highlighted that the Motability Charity is currently not registered with the Office of the Scottish Charities Regulator (OSCR) and this should be drawn to the attention of Scottish Ministers. Sheila Fletcher pointed out that the administration of some benefits is transferring to Social Security Scotland and this could have implications for the operation of the Motability scheme in Scotland. As Motability has over 60,000 customers in Scotland, the Convener proposed that MACS brings this information to the attention to Scottish Ministers. This approach was agreed by the committee.

**Action Point 5** – Once the round table consultation exercise with Scottish Disabled People's Organisations (DPOs) has been completed, MACS will recommend to Scottish Ministers that MACS should have a role in the future governance and strategy of the Motability scheme.

**Action Point 6** – MACS will include in the post roundtable briefing to Scottish Ministers, the importance of the Motability scheme in Scotland, and the highlight concerns around the current lack of registration with OSCR.

### **Agenda Item 4. Guest Speakers – Alexandra Dunn and Bruce Sutherland from the Equalities, Human Rights and Third Sector team in the Scottish Government**

4.1 The presentation explained the purpose and importance of conducting meaningful Equality Impact Assessments (EQIAs) in policy development or when introducing change. The following points were made:

- Conducting an EQIA exercise is a process, not just completing a document. It should be started at the concept stage of the policy development and should also be a team effort focusing on engaging internally as well as externally with stakeholder to ensure that people's voices are heard and no assumptions are made.
- EQIAs have 5 stages, which include framing workshop, data and evidence gathering, assessing the impact (positive and negative impacts, how to mitigate the impact), decision making and monitoring (demonstrate how findings helped to shape the policy). The EQIA should be treated as a live document and be updated accordingly.
- Although there is no formal enforcement process to conduct EQIA, their lack or poor quality can have a serious impact on policy development, including delay in policy implementation.
- The team is currently in the process of finalising a short animation titled "Mountains for All" which explains the EQIA process. A link to this animation will be circulated across the SG as the completion of EQIAs should underpin all SG activity.
- The SG EQIA team attends regular meetings with the Convention of Scottish Local Authorities (COSLA) committee that oversees EQIA compliance within LAs. This forum aims to identify examples of good practice relating to EQIAs within individual local authorities and then disseminate these across the whole country.

4.2 Members pointed out that a weakness of the current EQIA process is the lack of any feedback provided to individuals or organisations that have been consulted during the process. It is difficult for people to assess if their involvement in the process has led to a change in the policy or practice.

4.3 This led to a discussion on the lack of enforcement options available regarding the completion and quality of EQIAs. The Equality and Human Rights Commission (EHRC) has responsibility to ensure EQIAs have been completed but no influence on the standard or quality. It was noted that the SG has no ability to direct the work of the EHRC.

4.4 Claire Smith asked if the Scottish regulations relating to the Public Sector Equality Duty could be altered so that EQIAs must be completed and to a specified quality standard. Bruce stated that there is a planned review of the equality duties (planned for some time in 2019) but he is not sure if it feasible to amend the Scottish regulations. However, he agreed to consult with colleagues in his branch on this question and feedback to MACS.

**Action Point 7** – Bruce Sutherland to consult with colleagues on the feasibility of amendments to the Scottish regulations regarding the completion of EQIAs and feedback to MACS.

4.5 The Convener expressed her thanks to Alexandra and Bruce for their presentation to the committee.

### **Agenda item 5 – Sponsor Team update**

5.1 Karen Armstrong gave an overview on the work of the sponsor team and provided an update on the action points, which had been assigned to her at the previous meeting, held on 22 October 2018.

5.2 For Action Point 2, which related to the production of a list of principal stakeholders that can assist Local Authorities (LA) in completing EQIAs, she had spoken to Bruce Sutherland during the lunchbreak and he suggested that this would best be handled through the COSLA network. She had met with colleagues from the Equalities Unit the previous week and an agreement had been reached to share communications and updates.

5.3 On Action Point 4, which was to reserve 2023 as the themed year of Accessibility, Karen confirmed she had been working with Mark Hoskins to try to secure this year and they are now both members of an SG committee that is responsible for determining themed years. The next meeting is scheduled for the end of January. Karen agreed to provide updates on progress to the committee, as appropriate, at future meetings.

5.4 Action Point 8 remains open as the Ministerial train journey has been postponed to the 10<sup>th</sup> April. However, due to the current political uncertainty around Brexit, there remains the possibility that it might be rescheduled once again.

## AGENDA ITEM 2

5.5 Karen outlined to the committee some of the other activity currently being undertaken by the Accessible Travel Team. She and Aga Lysak have been investigating options available to MACS for the supply of communication and public relations (PR) support. A contract with an external company is being explored so that MACS has the freedom to engage with stakeholders without having to conform to TS media restrictions. Members were reminded to provide their feedback on their expectations of what MACS' communications strategy should encompass. Aga will collate and share the feedback with members.

**Action Point 8** – MACS members are reminded to submit their comments on MACS future communication strategy to Aga Lysak before Friday 15 February 2019. Aga will collate and disseminate the feedback to members.

5.6 Karen Armstrong gave a summary on the on-going preparations for the forthcoming TS Accessible Travel Summit, taking place in the Scottish Exhibition Campus (SEC) on 7 March 2019. Karen confirmed that due to the MACS Information day taking place on 6 March, and the early start to the Accessible Travel Summit, it is likely that most committee members will need to stay in Glasgow overnight.

5.7 There are several hotels located close to the venue which have been investigated by the TS Business Support Unit (BSU). Karen Armstrong agreed to e-mail details of these hotels to the committee members for them to review.

**Action Point 9** – Karen Armstrong to circulate details of the hotels located close to the SEC and seek feedback from MACS members on their accommodation needs for the evening of 6 March.

5.8 Claire Smith advised the committee that she represents TS on a High Level Group relating to Road Safety at the European Commission (EC). She informed the committee that there are on-going discussions on the creation of a new department on Accessibility by the EC and she wanted to make members aware of the existence of Scotland House in Brussels. She stated that the EC are receptive to discussions on Accessibility so it may be feasible to facilitate a meeting between an EC Commissioner and MACS members in Scotland House. This is an opportunity that MACS may wish to consider in future.

5.9 The Convener expressed her thanks to the Sponsor Team for their continued assistance in progressing the work of MACS.



### **Agenda item 6a – Update from Sheila Fletcher on the Bus and Community Transport Work Streams.**

6.1 Sheila Fletcher advised the committee that there is an issue forming in the North of Scotland relating to the use of coaches in rural areas. She confirmed that she had been contacted by a member of the public who is no longer able to travel on buses on the Caithness to Inverness route. This is due to the use of a particular vehicle, the Plaxton Elite, which are difficult to board due to the number of high steps passengers need to climb. She confirmed that this issue has been raised by disabled people and their representatives (including MPs and MSPs) in several areas of Scotland, where Plaxton Elite coaches are used on registered bus routes.

6.2 Joanne Fairweather confirmed that there has been a number of complaints from passengers published in the local press on this issue and suggested potential increase of the risk of social isolation, if passengers are unable to travel.

6.3 Sheila confirmed that she was attending a meeting with officials from the TS Bus Team after the conclusion of the MACS meeting and she would raise this issue with them. Claire Smith proposed that it might be useful to arrange a round table discussion involving Laura Murdoch and colleagues from the Bus Team to discuss these issues.

**Action Point 10** – Claire Smith to facilitate a round table discussion involving Linda Bamford, Laura Murdoch, Sheila Fletcher and representatives from the TS Bus Team to discuss issues around buses.

### **Agenda item 6b – Update from Hilary Stubbs on the Ferries and Airports Work Stream**

6.4 Hilary explained that the workstream managed to establish very good relationships with airports and confirmed the enormous amount of work being undertaken at local level.

6.5 Hilary had already prepared the MACS first draft response to the [Civil Aviation Authority \(CAA\) Strategy, Aviation 2050 – the future of UK aviation](#)<sup>1</sup>, which is currently out for consultation. She commented that it was pleasing to see a chapter in the consultation document on accessibility and support available at airports (Chapter 5 – enhancing the passenger experience). She confirmed that she would distribute the

---

<sup>1</sup> Available at: <https://www.gov.uk/government/consultations/aviation-2050-the-future-of-uk-aviation>

draft consultation response to all members with a deadline for any replies before finalising MACS submission.

6.6 Hilary noted that, to date, she had been unable to establish a relationship with TS Aviation Team as they did not see a value in engaging with MACS. Claire Smith suggested that it might be useful if she and Hilary met with James Fremantle of the CAA to discuss the new strategy.

**Action Point 11** – MACS Secretariat to facilitate a meeting between Claire Smith, Hilary Stubbs and James Fremantle of the CAA to discuss the new Aviation Strategy.

### **Agenda item 6c - Update from David Hunter on the Planning and Strategy Work Stream.**

6.7 David Hunter thanked the committee for their contributions to consultation responses submitted since the last meeting.

6.8 He highlighted that there is an opportunity for MACS to influence major infrastructure investment through the Strategic Transport Projects Review being conducted by Transport Scotland. The Review being not only about major projects such as airports, but also encompasses other programmes such as Active Travel and it would be used to inform TS projects for the next 10 years. This Review provides MACS with an opportunity to raise awareness of access issues across the whole programme of work conducted by Transport Scotland. David confirmed that he would remain involved with this as part of the horizon scanning element of the Planning and Strategy Workstream.

6.9 Claire Smith informed the committee that Laura Murdoch was meeting with the team conducting the review and she will also keep MACS informed on the role and remit of the Review.

6.10 Hussein Patwa advised the committee that the Disabled Persons Transport Advisory Committee (DPTAC) is currently conducting a scoping exercise on an Inclusive Transport Strategy (ITS). This is to ensure that views of disabled people are taken into account.

6.11 It was agreed that MACS needed to advocate for various ways of engaging with wider community and not relying mainly on digital communication. Some people are withdrawing from the digital world and this needs to be taken into account when public bodies and other organisations are undertaking consultations.

## AGENDA ITEM 2

6.12 Karen Armstrong said that DPTAC is focusing on social listening, which comprises of reviewing sources of information that already existed, such as Mumsnet, accessing social media content on outlets such as Twitter and using more traditional engagement methods such as workshops. Phil Pool confirmed that workshops would be held to capture as many views as possible. Phil agreed that he would clarify the methods of stakeholder engagement that would be used and provide this information to Karen for wider dissemination.

**Action Point 12** – Phil Pool to clarify the methods of stakeholder engagement for social listening, which will be used by DPTAC for the ITS and provide this information to Karen Armstrong for dissemination to the committee.

6.13 Phil Pool expressed DPTAC Chair's interest in attending a MACS meeting in the future and asked Aga Lysak if she could provide him with details of forthcoming meetings.

**Action Point 13** – Aga Lysak to send the dates of future MACS meetings to Phil Pool.

### **Agenda item 6d - Update from Hussein Patwa on the Rail Work Stream.**

6.14 Hussein Patwa explained that it had been a very busy quarter with the work stream having submitted a response to a consultation run by the Office of Road and Rail (ORR) on changes to Disabled People's Protection Policy. Hussein wanted to put on record his thanks to Fraser Sutherland for pulling together the MACS response and also his gratitude for the various inputs from other members of the committee.

6.15 Hussein confirmed that the Rail Workstream maintains a regular relationship with Andrew Marshall-Roberts, the Access and Inclusion Manager for ScotRail. It was agreed that thought needs to be given to improve service for those passengers with accessibility needs, who face travel disruption (and potentially a change in the mode of transport), but do not book assistance and do not identify themselves as disabled.

6.16 Concerns were also raised about a risk that the availability of the cheapest rail tickets becomes restricted to online and digital users, which disadvantages both disabled people and the wider public that are less inclined to use digital methods to purchase their tickets.

## AGENDA ITEM 2

6.17 The Convener informed the committee that there was an opportunity to raise these issues during the meeting with Mr Bill Reeve, Director of Rail in TS, on the 4<sup>th</sup> March 2019 and confirmed that either Hussein Patwa or Marsali Craig would attend with her. Karen Armstrong also agreed to raise this issue when she next meets with Patrick Nyamurundira, the Rail Accessibility Manager in TS.

**Action Point 14** – The Rail Workstream Lead to raise with the Director of Rail in TS the lack of a defined policy for passengers that have not booked Passenger Assist and whose journeys are interrupted.

**Action Point 15** - Karen Armstrong to raise the lack of a defined policy for passengers that have not booked Passenger Assist and whose journeys are interrupted when she next meets with Patrick Nyamurundira, the Rail Accessibility Manager in TS.

6.18 A need to promote the reduction in notice period to one hour for booking Passenger Assist was pointed out and it was agreed that Karen would raise this with Patrick Nyamurundira

**Action Point 16** – Karen Armstrong to raise the lack of marketing on the changes to the Passenger Assist scheme with Patrick Nyamurundira.

6.19 Hussein confirmed that the Stations Accessibility Toolkit has now been finalised and thanked Fraser Sutherland for his assistance. The document will be reviewed on annual basis and should be issued to operators within the next 10 days.

### **Agenda item 6e - Update from Keith Robertson on the Roads, Infrastructure and Active Travel Work Stream.**

6.20 Keith confirmed that a relationship with the Scottish Roads Works Commissioner (SRWC) was established and MACS had been invited to present at forthcoming regional meetings of the Roads Authorities and Utilities Committee (Scotland) (RAUCS). Keith suggested that a single presentation at the Scotland-wide meeting could be a more effective way of time management for members. The aim of these presentations being to raise awareness of the barriers and potential hazards for disabled people negotiating road works.

6.21 Keith confirmed that work is continuing on the Good Practice Guide on Inclusive Mobility, Shared Space and Tactile Surfaces and that as this work sat under his workstream remit, he would keep the committee updated as appropriate.

## AGENDA ITEM 2

6.22 The Committee agreed that MACS should advocate for ensuring that all Electric Vehicle charges bays are fully accessible. Susan Fulton confirmed that there is already an existing requirement within updated *BS 8300-1:2018 Design of an accessible and inclusive built environment Part 1: External environment Code of practice*, that requires all Electric Vehicle recharging points are designed to be accessible.

6.23 Keith informed the committee that following a series of individual meetings with five councils on their plans for Open Spaces and inclusive street design, SCOTS will facilitate any future meetings that MACS requires to be set-up to discuss councils plans.

6.24 The Convener thanked the Lead members for their updates and the committee members for the contributions during the meeting.

### **7. AOB**

7. There was no other business risen.

**Action points for the meeting held on 22 January 2019**

No.	Ref	Action	Update
1	2.2	MACS should maintain a watching brief on the revision of the Inclusive Mobility document for the remainder of 2019, and if insufficient progress is made, submit a recommendation to Scottish Ministers and Transport Scotland that they produce their own Inclusive Mobility document. This action has previously been allocated to the Roads, Infrastructure and Active Travel Workstream, who would monitor this in conjunction with the Planning and Strategy Workstream.	
2	2.6	Sheila Fletcher to contact Robert Wyllie to discuss accessibility of private hire vehicles and progressing the issue under the ATF taxi work package.	
3	2.7	Susan Fulton to send contact details for Disabled Go/AccessAble to Sheila Fletcher and Hussein Patwa.	
4	3.6	Keith Robertson to provide the Convener with details of SCOTS, RIAS and RIBA and she will update the list of stakeholders.	
5	3.9	Once the round table consultation exercise with Scottish Disabled People's Organisations (DPOs) has been completed, MACS will recommend to Scottish Ministers that MACS should have a role in the future governance and strategy of the Motability scheme.	
6	3.9	MACS will include in the post roundtable briefing to Scottish Ministers, the importance of the Motability scheme in Scotland, and the highlight concerns around the current lack of registration with OSCR.	
7	4.4	Bruce Sutherland to consult with colleagues on the feasibility of amendments to the Scottish regulations regarding the completion of EQIAs and feedback to MACS.	
8	5.5	MACS members are reminded to submit their comments on MACS future communication strategy to Aga Lysak before Friday 15	

## AGENDA ITEM 2

		February 2019. Aga will collate and disseminate the feedback to members.	
9	5.7	Karen Armstrong to circulate details of the hotels located close to the SEC and seek feedback from MACS members on their accommodation needs for the evening of 6 March.	
10	6.3	Claire Smith to facilitate a round table discussion involving Linda Bamford, Laura Murdoch, Sheila Fletcher and representatives from the TS Bus Team to discuss issues around buses.	
11	6.6	MACS Secretariat to facilitate a meeting between Claire Smith, Hilary Stubbs and James Fremantle of the CAA to discuss the new Aviation Strategy.	
12	6.12	Phil Pool to clarify the methods of stakeholder engagement for social listening, which will be used by DPTAC for the ITS and provide this information to Karen Armstrong for dissemination to the committee.	
13	6.13	Aga Lysak to send the dates of future MACS meetings to Phil Pool.	
14	6.17	The Rail Workstream Lead to raise with the Director of Rail in TS the lack of a defined policy for passengers that have not booked Passenger Assist and whose journeys are interrupted.	
15	6.17	Karen Armstrong to raise the lack of a defined policy for passengers that have not booked Passenger Assist and whose journeys are interrupted when she next meets with Patrick Nyamurundira, the Rail Accessibility Manager in TS.	
16	6.18	Karen Armstrong to raise the lack of marketing on the changes to the Passenger Assist scheme with Patrick Nyamurundira.	